

# PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

## CONTENTS

	PAGE
TWO YEARS OF WARTIME PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION IN CANADA . <i>Charles H. Bland</i>	81
SURVEYING PREVAILING SALARY RATES . . . . . <i>Ismar Baruch</i>	86
ORGANIZING FOR PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION ✓ . . . . . <i>Lawrence A. Appley</i>	100
THE COMMITTEE ON WARTIME REQUIREMENTS FOR SPECIALIZED PERSONNEL . . . . . <i>Steuart Henderson Britt</i>	107
IMPROVING THE CIVIL SERVICE ESSAY TEST ✓ . . . . . <i>Norman J. Powell</i>	112
EXHIBITS AS A MEDIUM FOR PUBLIC REPORTING AND POSITIVE RECRUITING . . . . . <i>Barbara L. Brattin</i>	120
THE USE OF OPEN ELIGIBLE REGISTERS IN PUBLIC PERSONNEL SELECTION . . . . . <i>Ralph Mueller and George A. Warren</i>	125
PLACING NEW EXAMINEES ON OPEN ELIGIBLE REGISTERS . . . . . <i>C. R. Adams and C. H. Smeltzer</i>	133
THE MANAGEMENT TRAINING CONFERENCE PLAN . . . . . <i>W. P. Lehman</i>	138
COURT DECISIONS . . . . .	145
BOOK REVIEWS . . . . .	156
ARTICLE ABSTRACTS . . . . .	165

COPYRIGHT, 1942, BY THE CIVIL SERVICE ASSEMBLY OF THE UNITED STATES AND CANADA

PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW provides opportunities for the publication of factual information, and of materials that may represent divergent ideas, judgments, and opinions. It does not accept responsibility for the views expressed in articles, reviews, and other contributions that appear in its pages.

## *THE CIVIL SERVICE ASSEMBLY*

THE Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada is an association of public agencies, officials, and private citizens engaged or interested in public personnel administration. The constituent public agencies of the Assembly are civil service commissions and boards, or personnel offices serving a particular governmental department or division. They serve national, state, and local governments of the United States, and Dominion, provincial, and local areas in Canada. The Assembly was organized in 1906 by officials and others actually engaged in civil service and other public personnel activities in order to provide mutual help in meeting common problems and to improve public personnel administration. A Headquarters Office has been established at 1313 East 60th Street in Chicago, Illinois, to serve as a clearinghouse for information on public personnel matters.

# Two Years of Wartime Personnel Administration in Canada

CHARLES H. BLAND

CANADA entered the war on September 10, 1939. At that time her federal public service had a well-defined and well-established personnel system based partly upon that of Great Britain and partly upon that of the United States. Its basic statute, the Civil Service Act, provided for appointments by means of open competition, supervised and administered by an independent Civil Service Commission, which also was responsible for promotions, transfers, leave of absence regulations, compensation rates, a broad framework of classification and a general control of the organization and staff needs of the various units of government.

The coming of war did not change the desirability of these broad requirements, but did make it essential that they be applied in such a way that the pressure of war needs would be met without delay, and that while basic principles would be maintained, they would be carried out in practices and procedures that would meet the urgent and often immediate needs of the war units, even if this involved a considerable departure from the practices and procedures of peace.

The public service of Canada, while proportionately smaller in size than that of the United States, was similar in nature and scope of activities. It stretched geographically from the Atlantic to the Pacific and from the Arctic Ocean to the 49th parallel. It comprised the usual departments of gov-

ernment, now enormously extended in their war units (Army, Navy and Air) and augmented by a new and rapidly growing Department of Munitions and Supply and kindred auxiliary services. To these have subsequently been added departments controlling prices, wages and priorities, and the remainder of the units common to both our countries as the accessories of the war effort.

## PRE-WAR PRINCIPLES AND PRACTICES

THE fundamental principles and objectives of the personnel system which was in operation at the coming of the war were: (1) the appointment to the public service of the best qualified available persons; (2) the application of efficient employment methods thereafter, and (3) the most economical control of administrative costs without impairing the effectiveness of the service.

The practices and procedures by which these principles were carried out and these objectives secured were: (1) open competitive examinations for the great majority of the positions in the service; (2) appointments by the Civil Service Commission in order of merit from the eligible registers so obtained; (3) supervision and direction of personnel working conditions, including promotions, transfers, leave of absence and hours of attendance; (4) supervision of establishments and organization structures for the various units; and (5) supervision of the classification system and the rates of pay.

The pressure of the war made it neces-

CHARLES H. BLAND is President of the Civil Service Commission of Canada.

sary to reconsider both principles and practices in the light of changed conditions and vital needs. The three fundamental principles outlined above were still considered fundamental and desirable, but the time element had become of vital importance and predominant necessity. Employees must still be competent and capable, their working conditions must be such as to produce the most effective results, and unnecessary costs must more than ever be eliminated and diverted to more essential channels. Above all, however, from the personnel viewpoint, employees must be found, supplied, and placed at work as, when, and where needed, and without the delays which often made comparatively little difference in the time of peace. Speed was no longer secondary, but primary.

A second necessity was flexibility. System, methods and procedures which had been evolved after painstaking experimentation were no longer necessarily suitable for war conditions. This took time to realize. Before systems can be changed, thinking must be changed, and flexible, wide-awake thinking was a primary necessity when war came on us.

The changes in methods, systems, practices and procedures which have been evolved under the necessity of war are outlined in the following pages. They are effected under an Order-in-Council authorizing procedure in connection with war employees, which was approved in April, 1940. They do not represent permanent or perfect methods. Some have been changed many times since war began. Some are still not entirely satisfactory. But for what they are worth, they represent what we have found desirable or helpful or necessary, under the circumstances that exist, for a public personnel system under the stress of war.

#### REVAMPING EXAMINATION AND RECRUITING PROCEDURES

THE chief development in our concept of what wartime examinations should be is probably found in the more complete

realization that the examination is a means, not an end.

It should take the most practical and useful form that will secure the desired results of selecting quickly the most suitable persons for the jobs to be filled. In many cases it must include the finding of such persons as well as testing their qualifications. It is not necessarily an assembled test, a written test, or even a fully competitive test. Circumstances may render it impossible to take the time to find or assemble or examine all possible applicants. The usual procedures of public advertisement, hidden identity, examination fees, right of appeal, may still be desirable, but sometimes impracticable because of lack of time. Time is indeed the essence of the contract.

Registers must be maintained as fully and accurately as possible, but where no registers are available, new eligibles must be speedily sought, effectively examined, and quickly placed at work. In numerous classes, instead of having periodic competitions with fixed time limits for the receipt of applications, it has been desirable and effective to conduct continuous examinations with a resulting register of eligibles that is being constantly augmented and renewed. Forms of examination, the machinery of tests and weights and values, must be reconsidered from the basic viewpoint of "time."

This is not to suggest that the personnel agency should under the stress of war select and certify incompetent employees. It can never afford to do this, but now as never before it must weigh time against the refinements of the selective process, and fill positions in the rapidly moving assembly-line of war with the clearly recognized understanding that the jobs must be filled, and efficiently filled, as the assembly-line moves on, not while the line is halted to meet the demands of peacetime personnel procedure.

On the other hand, the conditions of war have made it more necessary than ever that public employees engaged on or in connection with war work should be such as will permit no possibility of their engaging or

being utilized in subversive activities. By finger-printing, by investigation of their community and employment record, and by check with the Royal Canadian Mounted Police, every effort has been made to guard against sabotage or subversive activity.

IT IS always more difficult to recruit civil personnel in time of war than in time of peace, and this difficulty has been augmented in Canada by the war regulation that male applicants between 18 and 45 years of age can be employed in the public service only if they are physically unfit for service with the armed forces or if the Civil Service Commission considers their employment "necessary in the public interest." The last clause has been sparingly used, and the recruitment of civil personnel has accordingly had to draw to the greatest possible extent upon the recruiting fields of persons unfit for military service, of female applicants, of married women, and of persons in the higher age categories who would normally have been retired from employment.

Age limits for employment, which were normally 18-35 for junior grades, have been relaxed where such action was necessary to secure sufficient eligibles. The minimum age for wartime clerical posts is now 16, and the maximum age depends only on physical fitness and capacity to perform the duties required.

There is no apportionment system for the headquarters of the Canadian Service at Ottawa, but there is a locality or residential preference for field positions which provides "so far as practicable" for the appointment of qualified residents of the "locality" in which the position occurs. This has been operated subject to war needs. If sufficient suitable employees can be found in the locality, they are employed; if not, they are secured where they can be found, consideration being given to local conditions and costs of transportation.

Before the war, female employees were required to resign their positions if they married, and the employment of married

women was permitted only if they were not supported by their husbands, or if a sufficient supply of single employees was not available. Under the stress of war, the supply of certain classes of help, notably stenographers and typists, has become barely sufficient to meet the need, and female employees in such classes are now retained in service after marriage, while married women desirous of entering the service are accepted irrespective of the question of marital support.

#### SUPPLYING STENOGRAPHERS AND TYPISTS

EARLY in the war, it became apparent that a sufficient supply of competent stenographers and typists would constitute a problem for the personnel agency. This has been partially met by the following means:

1. A continuous opportunity has been given for prospective eligibles to demonstrate their skill and secure employment.
2. The co-operation of schools and business colleges was obtained in encouraging pupils to train for wartime government service.
3. The co-operation of the press and the radio was enlisted in keeping the opportunities for service before the public.
4. Former employees have returned to duty for the duration of the war.
5. Travelling examiners have been used for the information and examination in the smaller towns of prospective employees in these classes of work.
6. The assistance of recreational associations and welfare committees has been sought where new employees are away from home and are congregated for war work.

#### STATUS OF TEMPORARY AND PERMANENT EMPLOYEES

PERMANENT employees whose responsibilities have increased because of war work are not, under Canadian war regulations, granted increases in compensation therefor, except in cases where they have been given leave of absence to join the armed forces. Permanent employees are frequently

loaned or seconded to war units, and with increased responsibilities they are, under present rules, ineligible for a corresponding increase in pay. There are accordingly numerous cases where temporary war employees receive higher compensation than permanent employees performing similar or more responsible duties. Experience leads us to believe that this condition is not desirable, and will require a change.

Permanent status is not granted to persons replacing permanent employees who are on loan for service with the armed forces. All persons employed under wartime regulations are advised that their employment in war units is not permanent in nature and will not exceed the duration of the war. For this period a deduction of five per cent is made from their pay checks to form the basis, with interest paid by the government, for a savings fund to be used on retirement. Temporary war employees do not receive annual or periodic increases in pay, though they may on the assumption of more responsible duties, which are classified in a higher grade, be certified in a temporary capacity thereto.

#### LEAVE AND TRANSFER POLICIES

**M**ANY public servants have enlisted in the Army, the Navy and the Air Force. They are on leave of absence without pay (i.e. receiving only their military pay) under the following conditions:

1. They may return, after discharge, to their positions in the public service.
2. In the meantime their statutory increases are not deferred, and they are given equal consideration with those remaining in the service for promotion to vacant positions therein.
3. Their service as members of the armed forces is counted for the purpose of superannuation, but they are freed from the contributions they otherwise would make to the superannuation fund during such period.

The great increase of work in the war departments, and the comparative decrease in appropriations for some peacetime activities,

has rendered it extremely desirable, from the two points of view, that any employees who could be spared from peacetime work and utilized on war work should be loaned or transferred from one department to another. Although in some cases the transfer has been a permanent one, in the majority of instances it has been a loan for the duration of the war. The administration of the loan system has been in the hands of an interdepartmental committee and the Civil Service Commission.

#### DECENTRALIZATION OF ADMINISTRATION

**D**ECENTRALIZATION of authority and of action has been found to be of vital aid to swift and effective personnel work. Not only in the procedure of selection, including recruitment of applicants, examinations, ratings and placement of eligibles, but in organization and classification procedures, the work and the responsibility have been delegated to the local representative of the Commission with the result that time and expense have been saved, and direct contacts have been established that have done much to "sell" the merit system to new units whose previous impressions of civil service had frequently consisted of red tape, needless formality and delay. Mobile units, operating where and when needed, have carried the personnel system and made it work in all branches of the field.

#### ORGANIZATION AND ESTABLISHMENTS

**T**HE proper control of organization and establishments is difficult in time of war, but its desirability is unquestionable. If waste and extravagance should be prevented in time of peace, it is even more essential that every war dollar should be diverted from non-essentials and spent on essentials. A great deal can be done by the careful examination of plans of organization before the personnel are actually enlisted, and a great deal more by continuous assistance to the new organization as it develops.

It is probably true that the urgency of the need for the work to begin frequently over-

rides the care and forethought that would be desirable in peacetime projects. It is also true that it is better war policy to spend a little too much and achieve results, than to cut the costs slightly and miss the mark. It has been our experience, therefore, that it is well worth while to give as careful consideration as possible to the question of organization, and to regard costs and methods from the point of view of good efficiency engineering, always bearing in mind, however, that economies in dollars and cents will never make up for failure to provide an organization that will achieve results. Aid in organization, in management procedure, in the selection of competent staff, will all be welcomed by a wartime unit when given in the right way by the personnel agency.

#### CLASSIFICATION SYSTEMS AND RATES OF PAY

NORMAL pay plans for the public service generally include such terms as minimum and maximum rates of pay, salary ranges, appointments at the minimum, periodic increases within the range, and similar standard features. War conditions have brought about some changes. As far as permanent employees are concerned, both in wartime and peacetime departments, salary ranges have been maintained, with the usual corollaries of appointment at the minimum rate and periodic increases within the range, subject to the standard conditions of satisfactory service and increased usefulness. In the case of temporary wartime employees, however, it has not been the practice to grant such periodic increases, with the consequent necessity of offering more than the minimum rate for initial employment, where circumstances so necessitated. As elsewhere indicated, it has also been the practice to increase the compensation of temporary wartime employees whose subsequent duties and responsibilities justify higher classification, by certifying them in the higher grade, but so far as permanent employees are con-

cerned this has been allowed only when a vacant position on the establishment permitted a promotion.

In other words, temporary employees in war establishments may be reclassified; permanent employees may not. It may be added that while this has been the practice so far, there are now indications that it is becoming recognized that permanent and temporary employees should as far as possible be dealt with on the same salary basis.

#### RED TAPE AND "DOLLAR-A-YEAR" MEN

THE "dollar-a-year" men now serving in war departments will tell you that one of the results of their participation has been the at least partial elimination of "red tape." Conversely, civil servants who are working with them are inclined to think that business men are beginning to recognize that even in wartime, a system of checks and balances is necessary where large expenditures are concerned. The truth of the matter is probably part way between the two extremes. Peacetime procedures are admittedly too slow for wartime needs, but the principles behind such procedures still hold good, and must be observed, though in ways that are adapted to meet the times.

#### SUMMARY

TO SUMMARIZE our war experience, I would say that what we have learned, or should have learned, is this: That the recognized principles of personnel administration hold good in war as in peace, but that they must be applied and adapted to the conditions and requirements of the emergency. The merit system can still be maintained—in truth it is part of what we are fighting for—but it can be operated in these days of war only if we make sure that the instrument is not greater than the end, if we realize that we shall be judged by results not by methods, and if we energetically, speedily and effectively get our personnel jobs done.

# Surveying Prevailing Salary Rates

ISMAR BARUCH

THE establishment or revision of rates of pay for positions in the public service is a critical and frequently a controversial phase of general management. The ramifications of any plan for determining and administering pay rates are legion. It links personnel management with budgetary control; tax revenues with expenditures; public service with public costs. The general public, the taxpayer, legislator, budget officer, comptroller, executive, supervisor, and employee all have vital interests which are not always aimed at the same objectives.

The proper balancing of these interests, always a perplexing problem, becomes more difficult in war time, when governments at all levels face new responsibilities to be discharged in the face of labor scarcities, increased turnover, intense competition of defense industries, rising salary levels outside the service, and mounting cost of living. Clearly, the administration of pay matters is of such a nature as to require a definite plan, founded on sound and equitable policies, coordinated with the various phases of personnel and fiscal administration, and consistently applied by organized methods on the basis of properly collected and evaluated facts. Such a plan is conveniently called a "pay plan."<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Although the scope of a pay plan for a given jurisdiction should cover practically all the positions in the service, this article deals primarily with salaried positions, paid at a monthly or yearly rate, for regular, unbroken service.

ISMAR BARUCH is Chief of the Division of Personnel Classification of the United States Civil Service Commission. He is President of the Civil Service Assembly.

## GENERAL SPECIFICATIONS FOR PAY PLAN

THE bare structure of a pay plan consists of two basic elements: the scales of pay; and the statements of policy and formal rules of operation. Underlying this outward structure is the deeper design and specification that the pay plan—regardless of what the pay scales are in dollars—shall be so constructed and operated that it satisfies the following requirements:

1. The kind, difficulty, and responsibility of the work of each position and employee shall determine the applicable pay scale.
2. Equal work under similar employment conditions shall be paid for by equal pay scales applicable throughout the entire jurisdiction, with differences in kind, difficulty, and responsibility of work logically and equitably recognized by differences among pay scales.
3. The relative proficiency of the employee in his work will determine the specific rate of pay which he receives within the scale of pay applicable to his work.
4. At any given time, under any type of personnel transaction, or under any set of circumstances, the scale of pay and the rate of pay applicable to each position and employee shall be definite.
5. The programs and transactions of personnel administration, budgetary and fiscal control, and pay administration can be effectively coordinated.
6. Revisions or adjustments of pay policies, scales, or rules, made necessary from time to time by changes or differences in economic or employment conditions, or

shown by administrative experience to be desirable, will be integral operations of the pay plan itself, designed to keep it up to date, workable, and of maximum benefit to the service, and capable of being made without destroying or disrupting the foundation of basic relationships upon which the pay plan rests.

A whole set of such relationships concerns the connection between a pay plan and a position-classification plan. In fact, in order to make possible the accomplishment of the foregoing objectives, it is essential to base the structure and operation of a pay plan on a position-classification plan for the same positions. If one is not in existence, it must be developed and adopted before a sound pay plan can be put into effect.<sup>2</sup> This is the only way in which internal consistency of the pay plan can be originally established and subsequently maintained. But after a pay plan is adopted and installed, there are many phases of administration to carry out, one of which, as has been indicated, is keeping pay scales reasonably adjusted to current conditions. Although there are many additional things to consider in tackling this problem, Carl L. Richey has recently emphasized the periodic gathering of prevailing rate data as the major step in public pay scale revision. "Let us start talking," he says, "about the periodic gathering of pay data so that we will have a knowledge of concrete facts relating to our competitors for the services of employees."<sup>3</sup>

#### SIGNIFICANCE OF SALARY SURVEYS

CONCURRENT with the increasing cost of living and the effect of national economic and labor measures, such as com-

modity price controls and man-power allocation programs, government jurisdictions and private industries are giving increasing attention to problems of salary adjustments in war time.<sup>4</sup> In the light of constantly evolving changes in the relation of public pay scales to those of other employers, public jurisdictions, in examining or adjusting their own pay scales, may well be guided by data concerning the salaries paid by their competitors for employees. Such data have always been significant for this purpose and it seems likely that they will remain so.

When a pay plan is first placed in effect, its salary levels are based upon many factors as they currently exist, some economic, some social, and some a matter of governmental fiscal or recruiting policy. These factors fluctuate and change over a period of years, generally gradually, but sometimes abruptly. Even in stable times, one may reasonably expect after several years to find material changes in the elements upon which the salary plan was originally founded. There exists, therefore, a logical need for a more or less continuing scrutiny of at least the more significant factual bases of the existing salary plan.

WHEN a public jurisdiction examines its current pay scales to determine to what extent they need revision, the responsible officials customarily seek information about prevailing rates of pay outside the

<sup>2</sup> For a brief treatment of position-classification, see the writer's "Basic Aspects of Position-Classification," *Public Personnel Review*, October, 1940, pp. 1-17. For a comprehensive treatment, see *Position-Classification in the Public Service*, A Report Submitted . . . by the Committee on Position-Classification and Pay Plans (Chicago, Civil Service Assembly, 1941). On pages 61-64 of the latter publication will be found a discussion of the reasons for using a position-classification plan as a foundation for a pay plan.

<sup>3</sup> "Determining Pay Policy," *Public Personnel Review*, January, 1942, pp. 20-24.

<sup>4</sup> Norman N. Gill, Municipal Reference Librarian, Milwaukee, *Report on Salary and Wage Trends in Various Cities*, October 14, 1941 (mimeographed); "What's Happening to White-Collar Pay?", *Wall Street Journal*, October 6, 1941, pp. 1-2 (reprinted in *The Management Review*, November, 1941, pp. 399-401); Carl H. Chatters and Margorie Leonard, *Salary and Wage Increases by 384 United States Cities During 1941*, (Chicago, Municipal Finance Officers Association, December, 1941); Jules Backman, "Canadian Wartime Price Control," *Dun's Review*, December, 1941, pp. 19-46; C. Canby Balderston, "Wage Adjustment for Payroll Flexibility," in *Wage Adjustment and Grievance Policies*, Personnel Series No. 52 (New York, American Management Association, 1941), pp. 3-9; Robert P. Brecht, "Salary Adjustments During the Emergency," in *Emergency Salary Administration*, Office Management Series No. 95 (New York, American Management Association, 1941), pp. 23-32; Isador Lubin, "Wage Policies and Price Trends," *Survey Graphic*, January, 1942, pp. 19-23.

service, i.e., the rates being paid by private employers and other public employers in the region for certain kinds of work. Even in normal times, all the employers within a given area are loosely in competition for workers of the same qualifications. This competition is intensified for a good many occupations in times like the present. Accordingly, each employer would like to know what he has to pay "in the market" to secure, for example, stenographers or draftsmen, or what he has to pay in order to retain the stenographers or draftsmen he already has. While maintaining, by means of a position-classification plan, an *internal* consistency in his pay plan, he would like also, if possible, to preserve a reasonable *external* consistency.<sup>5</sup>

Of course, the market for workers in a given occupation, even without the strong disturbances of war time, is not the economist's theoretically "perfect market," in which both workers and employers are mobile, bids and offers are freely disseminated, and changes in demand and supply and in pay asked or offered are sensitively interrelated. For salaried workers a state of true competition involving only work and pay seldom exists.<sup>6</sup> It is obvious that salaries of

<sup>5</sup> Samuel L. H. Burk, "Bases for Sound Salary Determination," in *Sound Bases for Salary Standardization*, Office Management Series No. 92 (New York, American Management Association, 1940), p. 4; I. W. Briggs, "Equitable Compensation," *ibid.*, p. 18.

<sup>6</sup> "This competition, more or less direct and obvious at the time of recruiting, takes on an extremely varied character after the employee has served the Government for some years. It may almost completely die, as in those activities in which the Government has a complete monopoly, the employee gradually finding himself more highly trained and more valuable to the Government, but in a specialized field which has no counterpart and no direct usefulness outside the Federal Government. It may become more keen, as in the cases of administrators of large caliber and research workers of renown in the applied sciences, whose talents are continually sought by private industry at salaries far above the Government's pay levels. Or, limited competition may persist, as in some professional fields in which the demand is confined to universities, museums, or other public or quasi-public institutions or foundations." U. S. Personnel Classification Board, *Closing Report of Wage and Personnel Survey*, H. Doc. No. 771, 71st Cong., 2d sess., (Washington, Government Printing Office, 1931), p. 242. See also Dale Yoder, *Personnel and Labor Relations* (New York, Prentice-Hall, 1938), p. 329; J. O. Hopwood, *Salaries, Wages, and Labor Relations* (New York, The Ronald Press Co.,

ferred to applicants or paid to employees by a state or city are not the only incentives leading to their decision to accept, resign, or continue employment in the public service or elsewhere. Working conditions, hours of work, vacation and sick leave privileges, tenure, retirement benefits, purely personal considerations, and many other factors have their effect.<sup>7</sup> Available pay, however, both within the service and outside, is one of the most significant influences in recruiting and retaining qualified workers, and therefore should be covered statistically in any comprehensive program for gathering facts relating to salaries in a given jurisdiction.<sup>8</sup> A study of prevailing rates, accordingly, does not seek to determine, in the economic sense, the exact market or competitive rate for any occupation in a given area, but only to bring together information which, notwithstanding its theoretical and actual limitations, is of practical usefulness in reviewing and revising pay scales in the service.

To most employees the fact that their employer is paying them less or more than they could earn in the same kind of work elsewhere is a tangible and realistic thing. Consequently, employees and employee groups, as well as operating and administrative officials, are as much interested in prevailing rate data as are the budget, finance, or personnel officials and the legislators who

1937), pp. 12-14; John W. Riegel, *Salary Determination* (Ann Arbor, University of Michigan, 1940), p. 7.

<sup>7</sup> For a discussion of incentives other than salaries, see Scott, Clothier, Mathewson, and Spriggle, *Personnel Management*, (New York, McGraw-Hill, 1941), Chap. XXIV. See also Leonard D. White, *The Prestige Value of Public Employment in Chicago* (University of Chicago Press, 1929); *Ibid.*, *Further Contributions to the Prestige Value of Public Employment* (University of Chicago Press, 1932).

<sup>8</sup> In a comprehensive program, other data and items of information are also customarily prepared for consideration. Among these are: (a) a narrative summary showing the history of pay levels in the jurisdiction for some recent period; (b) detailed and summary salary distribution tables, showing the number of government employees, by agencies and by position-classification groupings, receiving specified rates of pay, and constituting the basis for computing estimates of costs of revision; (c) costs of living as indicated by typical family budgets; (d) time trends in the cost of living; and (e) expenditure costs of various proposals. To a certain extent, of course, the effect of cost of living changes is reflected in prevailing rates.

are called upon to evaluate and apply such data to the pay problems of the jurisdiction. Although the employee's first concern probably is with the maintenance of consistency and equity within the service in relating pay scales to work performed, he is inclined to test the *adequacy* of these pay scales by comparison with the rates paid by private business or other jurisdictions for the same work, particularly if working conditions and other non-monetary advantages are about the same.

#### LIMITATIONS OF SALARY SURVEYS

PLANNING a salary survey requires at the outset a definite recognition of its limitations with a view to conducting the survey in such a way as to diminish, so far as practicable, the effect of such limitations upon the dependability and use of the data collected. These limitations exist largely for the seven reasons enumerated and discussed hereafter:

1. Employers' salary quotations for one job title are apt to cover more than one class of positions, as this grouping would be defined in a position-classification plan. In the absence of such a plan, the names of positions used by private or public agencies are frequently unreliable indications of the work performed in such positions.<sup>9</sup> It is not very informative to be advised that private employers in a given area pay, on the average, \$20 a week for "accountants" and \$350 a month for "engineers." There are various kinds and levels of accounting or engineering work, both in the public service and

private business. Until it is known for what character, degree of difficulty, and level of responsibility of work these salaries are paid, no one is in a position to compare them reliably with salaries for any accounting or engineering class of positions in the public service concerned. Even under the best procedures, the degree of comparability of the outside positions, for which salary data are secured, with those in the jurisdiction, for which pay scales are to be established, will be by no means perfect.

2. Salaries quoted, particularly for white-collar workers, may reflect a range of pay arising through inconsistencies of salaries within the concerns themselves. A considerable proportion of private firms and local governments have no plan of salary administration based on job analysis and evaluation.<sup>10</sup> Furthermore, if they have not established standard pay scales by classes of employment, they can only quote the rates in existence at the time. Depending upon turnover and new hiring, these rates may or may not be representative.

3. Salaries quoted by the public and private organizations surveyed become significant and useful only when the positions to which they apply are classified on the basis of their duties and responsibilities in the same manner as the positions in the surveying jurisdiction. The crucial processes are fact-finding, job evaluation, and position-to-position comparisons. On the reliability of work comparisons the value of salary comparisons depends.

<sup>9</sup> "Job titles, even within a given industry, are generally misleading and taken on their face value in wage rate comparisons are unreliable bench marks. Individual company processes, equipment, organization, etc., are rarely identical. A purely nominal comparison of wage rates is inaccurate and unfair. Nevertheless, both employers and employees commonly quote comparative wage rates with definite conviction. Isolated or exceptional 'highs' or 'lows' are focal points for discussion and further complicate negotiations on wage agreements. Ordinarily, neither loyal employees nor better than marginal employers deliberately engage in deception—they simply draw conclusions from inadequate data." W. F. Cook, "Determination of Prevailing Wage Scales," *Personnel*, August, 1937, p. 24. See also *Position-Classification in the Public Service*, pp. 56-60.

<sup>10</sup> "The majority of American companies have no definite program of wage and salary administration, and as a consequence their wage structures are replete with inconsistencies. Differing rates are paid to employees performing the same work through the operation of such factors as consideration of length of service, transfers of workers without rate adjustments, the absence of standard hiring rates, favoritism, and the frequent practice of allowing foremen to judge the value of each employee to the company. Often there is no logical relationship between the rates for different occupations; with every flat percentage advance in wages the differentials are increased and the discriminations are emphasized." C. Canby Balderston, *Wage Setting Based on Job Analysis and Evaluation*, (New York, Industrial Relations Counselors, 1940), p. 3. See also p. 47 for a brief discussion of conditions diminishing the validity of salary data for white-collar jobs.

4. Salaries and wages may be quoted as pay rates or as aggregate earnings, for varying periods of time, such as an hour, day, week, month, or year. Rates usually require conversion to a common base, and must be distinguished from overtime or other extra earnings. In surveys now being conducted it is important to know whether any cost-of-living adjustments are in effect and whether they are included within salary figures quoted or are paid as separate "bonuses." For hospital or other institutional employments, the value of any quarters, meals, laundry service, etc. furnished to employees in addition to cash salary must also be known and considered a part of aggregate pay for comparative purposes.

5. Salaries quoted are apt to cover a wide range in dollars, with no explanation of the "lows" or "highs." Rates in the lower part of the range mean more when it is known that "these are beginners' rates," or "most of the employees in these brackets are new," or "in this occupation we are having a large turnover." Rates in the higher part of the range mean more when it is known that "these rates are in recognition of exceptional competence," or "these employees have been with us for a very long time."

6. For a full understanding of salary data, attention must frequently be paid to comparison of advantages other than those expressed by the rates quoted; e.g., progressive policies of personnel management, regular hours of work, vacation and sick leave privileges, continuity and security of employment, prestige and financial condition of the company, retirement, bonus, profit-sharing, stock-purchasing, or insurance plans, good physical working conditions, medical and dental service, and similar factors affecting the ability of any employer to secure qualified workers.

7. There is a considerable variation in the pay policies of different companies. Some try to match the average market rates of their competitors; others establish salaries above the locality average in order to attract su-

perior workers. Some companies control their pay levels by their ability to pay; when their profit margin is high, they establish hiring rates which are not maintained when their profit margin is low.

One may raise the question whether, in view of these limitations, the data obtained from a survey of prevailing salary rates are worth the time and effort required. However, it should be appreciated that, within recognized bounds, information concerning outside pay rates provides a valid base for appraising the fairness of the pay schedules of the jurisdiction. The important consideration here is to be aware of the inherent weaknesses in the data, and thus avoid being misled into specious conclusions.

#### CONDUCTING THE SURVEY

CONDUCTING a prevailing rate survey requires, in addition to provisions for staff and funds, certain decisions concerning scope and method. These are: (1) selecting "key" classes of positions, constituting the minimum group of classes for which salary data will be obtained; (2) limiting the localities or area within which the inquiry will be made; (3) selecting the organizations which will be requested to furnish information; and (4) determining the methods of securing the desired data.<sup>11</sup> Each of these points will be discussed separately in the following pages.

<sup>11</sup> Various reports of wage and salary data are prepared regularly or occasionally by federal and state agencies and trade associations. These, however, are apt to be of limited usefulness on specific problems of adjusting pay for salaried employments, and hence do not take the place of a salary study made currently under the direction of the jurisdiction itself for its own purposes. Mention may be made, however, of a series of studies published by the United States Bureau of Labor Statistics on salaries and hours of labor, July 1, 1938, in municipal fire and police departments (Bulletins No. 684 and No. 685); and of salary studies in their respective professions made by the American Library Association, National Education Association, American Association of Engineers, American Association of Social Workers, and other professional groups. See also John Calhoun Baker, *Executive Salaries and Bonus Plans* (New York, McGraw-Hill, 1938); United States Women's Bureau, *Wages of Office Workers, 1940* (Washington, Government Printing Office, 1941).

## KEY CLASSES TO BE COVERED

IN MOST government organizations there are some classes of positions that have no counterparts in private industry, and other classes that are not even duplicated in other governmental jurisdictions. Obviously, therefore, it is not possible to compare the pay of every class of positions inside the jurisdiction with the pay of a corresponding class of positions outside. This can be done only for certain classes of positions. Also, in view of the necessity for internal consistency of a pay plan, it is unlikely that pay relationships outside the service among different classes of positions will always be equitable or appropriate inside the service. Consequently, from among the various classes of positions in the service, it is desirable to select certain classes for the purpose of "keying" inside and outside pay at significant points or levels in the whole pay structure. These classes, selected through considerations of feasibility and significance, are known as "key" classes. The group of key classes will constitute the minimum occupational scope of the survey.

The survey will concentrate on the determination of prevailing rates for the selected key classes and its results will indicate the direction and extent of differences between the pay of these classes in the service and that shown by outside pay levels. Pay scales established for key classes would then serve as bench marks around which, on the basis of the relationships among the key and the non-key classes shown in the position-classification plan, the pay scales for all the classes would be determined.

There are several characteristics which key classes should have in order to serve their function most effectively.

1. They should have, if possible, a pivotal place in the position-classification plan, i.e., they should have significant relationships to other classes—particularly as to level of difficulty and responsibility—and therefore be good reference points.

2. So far as is feasible, they should be distributed so as to cover a wide range of values;

not all of them, for example, should represent the simpler and least difficult kinds of work.

3. They should be reasonably well-known and in any event susceptible to clear, understandable, and fairly concise description.

4. They should include a considerable number of positions both within the service and within the companies or jurisdictions participating in the study.<sup>12</sup>

It is not always practicable to select a large number of key classes which will fulfill all these requirements. It is essential, however, that the work which they cover shall be reasonably comparable, inside and outside, and from one outside organization to another, so that the resulting salary data will be equally comparable. Especially is it difficult to select more than a few key classes in the professional, scientific, or executive brackets of the public service. Considerable depends, however, on whether outside salary data are to be secured through correspondence questionnaires alone, or through schedules filled out by job analysts after personal interviews with representatives of cooperating companies or jurisdictions. The correspondence method definitely limits the number and kinds of key classes for which salary data can reliably and feasibly be requested. The personal interview method makes it possible to expand the list beyond the key classes to include those which lend themselves to mutual discussion with representatives of reporting organizations and the on-the-spot determination of likenesses and differences.

The number of classes selected for comparison thus depends upon: (1) the feasibility of achieving reasonable compliance with the characteristics of key classes already stated; (2) the choice made between correspondence and personal interview methods; (3) the relative number of possible contributors to the study who are doing work

<sup>12</sup> Another test of a key class has been expressed as follows: "There should not be in the market any considerable surplus or shortage of persons qualified for the position. Such a maladjustment distorts salaries and makes them unreliable as basing points in a salary schedule." Riegel, *op. cit.*, p. 20.

covering collectively a variety of functions like those in the public service; and (4) the volume of salary quotations needed for proper statistical analysis. If a sufficient volume of salary quotations can be secured, it is better to prepare a small list of accurately comparable classes than to assemble a larger but less reliable list. In a state or city of moderate size, about 100 key classes, including some salaried building maintenance crafts, may be considered appropriate for surveys involving a reasonable amount of personal inquiry.<sup>13</sup>

In salary surveys conducted by public jurisdictions, it is customary to include such key classes as: unskilled or common labor; elevator operators; hospital orderlies; watchmen; bakers; cooks; salaried building maintenance crafts; entrance and intermediate classes of stenographers, typists, office appliance operators, and bookkeepers; graduate nurses; dietitians; and entrance classes in professional or scientific work, requiring the equivalent of college graduation in a specialty but no experience.<sup>14</sup>

The duties and responsibilities of each key class should be clearly and adequately described in writing. These descriptions are used in questionnaire forms or in instructions, and provide an important factual basis for interviews, conferences, and decisions on the comparability of positions and salary rates. Their function is to improve the reliability of duties and pay comparisons and prevent unnecessary misunderstandings. For any classes to be covered primarily by correspondence questionnaires, the descriptions should be prepared with considerable care. It is essential to keep in mind that the returns from questionnaires will be accurate and reliable only to the extent that the duties content of key classes is understood by the reporting organizations.

Sometimes these descriptions are selected

<sup>13</sup> In a salary survey for the state of Minnesota in 1939, there were 125 key classes, including about 40 labor and crafts classes. In one for the city of Cincinnati in 1931, 135 key classes were covered by personal visits to local firms.

<sup>14</sup> For a list of key positions in a large industrial company, see Riegel, *op. cit.*, pp. 20-21.

from the "working definitions" prepared when a position-classification plan for the jurisdiction is being concurrently developed.<sup>15</sup> When these are not available, descriptions consisting of a few significant clauses may be written for the purposes of the survey. For example:

**Draftsman.** Prepare to scale difficult detailed drawings of machinery, equipment, accessories, following designs or sketches prepared by draftsmen of higher grade. Lay out complicated wiring diagrams from sketches, check drawings of mechanical details for completeness and correctness of views, dimensions, standard drafting-room practice. Check design of parts and assemblies; prepare bills of materials.<sup>16</sup>

**Watchman.** Maintains watch over property and grounds, making rounds at regular intervals, and seeing that windows and doors are locked and hazards eliminated; does some cleaning, makes minor emergency repairs to heating, lighting, and plumbing equipment.<sup>17</sup>

**Junior Chemist.** Performs routine chemical analysis of foods, beverages, feeds, fertilizers, and other substances to detect and determine adulteration, contamination, etc. Assists in analytical experimentation. Does not involve responsibility for interpretations of results.<sup>18</sup>

Occasionally, fairly complete specifications have been used.<sup>19</sup> Naturally, the length and detail of the descriptions vary according to the class, the simpler work requiring less explanation.<sup>20</sup>

For the most part, the descriptions of key classes are expressed in terms of the duties and responsibilities which they involve in the service. However, in a survey made several years ago of the salaries in private industry for routine clerical work, the descriptions for "under clerk" and "junior clerk" were expressed in terms of duties and tasks

<sup>15</sup> *Position-Classification in the Public Service*, pp. 220-21. Examples are given on p. 221.

<sup>16</sup> A. L. Kress, "Making a Salary Survey," in *Office Personnel Administration*, Office Management Series No. 84 (New York, American Management Association, 1938), p. 25.

<sup>17</sup> Minnesota State Civil Service Department, 1939.

<sup>18</sup> Z. Clark Dickinson, *Collective Wage Determination* (New York, The Ronald Press Co., 1941), p. 242; Riegel, *op. cit.*, pp. 22-23.

<sup>19</sup> For other examples, see Baridon and Loomis, *Personnel Problems* (New York, McGraw-Hill, 1931), pp. 58-59; Kress, *op. cit.*, pp. 25-26; L. C. Lovejoy, "Salary Standardization," Office Management Series No. 88 (New York, American Management Association, 1939), pp. 23-27.

four  
was  
duc  
cer  
wer  
self

T  
dep  
ava  
met  
sta  
pri  
the  
attr  
cali  
conv

A  
cou  
juris  
Wit  
tific  
pers  
whic  
are s  
agen  
read  
exch  
mak  
city s  
para  
nom

T  
and  
more  
olve  
obvi  
Cert  
exam  
vey v  
types

<sup>20</sup> U  
Routi  
ton, G

found in private industry. This procedure was made possible by a previous study conducted by personal interview, after which certain tasks found in business organizations were classified in accordance with the position-classification plan of the jurisdiction itself.<sup>20</sup>

#### LOCALITIES AND ORGANIZATIONS TO BE COVERED

THE selection of the localities or area to be covered in the prevailing rate survey depends somewhat on considerations of available time, staff, and funds, and the methods to be used. Generally, however, a state or local government will be interested primarily in rates of pay prevailing (a) in the geographic area from which it normally attracts new employees, and (b) in the localities to which present employees could go conveniently and economically in seeking other employment.

As a general rule, little difficulty is encountered in deciding upon the other public jurisdictions to be covered in the survey. Within the area selected they are easily identified, and their size, variety of occupations, personnel and pay policies, and the extent to which they are in competition for workers, are sufficiently well known to the surveying agency. Further, most public agencies are ready to cooperate with one another in the exchange of salary information. Usually, in making a public salary survey, a state or city selects other jurisdictions which are comparable to it in size and in social and economic characteristics.

The selection of business, commercial, and industrial firms is, however, somewhat more difficult. In some instances, it may involve elements of controversy because of its obvious bearing on the salary data obtained. Certain general decisions are first made. For example, it may be agreed (a) that the survey will cover a reasonably wide variety of types of business, e.g., banking and finance,

insurance, public utilities, wholesale and retail merchants, and manufacturing; (b) that it will specifically include those having many positions comparable to large groups in the surveying jurisdiction; (c) that it will not be confined to the largest employers, but equally progressive and reputable smaller firms will also be included; and (d) that there will be a sufficient distribution to prevent one type of business or one large concern from unduly weighting the results of the survey.<sup>21</sup>

Within this general plan, the selection of the precise concerns to be covered will be facilitated by enlisting the aid of industrial and trade associations, local personnel associations, chambers of commerce, employee groups, labor organizations, and professional, scientific, and civic groups, whose representatives will generally be glad not only to suggest firms for coverage, but to take active steps to secure their effective co-operation in supplying the agency with the essential information.

In addition, a helpful step is to divide the list of key classes into: (a) those of fairly common type for which reasonable counterparts will be found in a large number of concerns; and (b) those whose counterparts will necessarily be restricted to a small number of employers in specialized types of business. For example, salary data on stenographers and office appliance operators can be secured from a large number of sources, but special inquiry has to be made to locate employers of boiler inspectors or tree surgeons. Through an examination of the commercial and industrial activities of the area, contacts with local organizations and associations, and a search of directories, a number of fruitful sources of data on the group of less common key classes will be disclosed. Private industry, of course, will not be able

<sup>20</sup> U. S. Personnel Classification Board, *Salaries for Routine Clerical Work in Private Industry* (Washington, Government Printing Office, 1929), pp. 187-189.

<sup>21</sup> In conducting a salary and wage survey for the City of Seattle in 1938, Public Administration Service secured data from 325 local firms, covering 46 kinds of business, and from 30 unions which furnished current wage agreements. Information was also obtained from public utilities in other cities and from 18 public jurisdictions.

to furnish data on classes peculiar to the public service.<sup>22</sup>

#### DETERMINATION OF SURVEY METHODS

THE method used in gathering prevailing rate data and associated information depends on available time, funds, and staff. The most thorough procedure involves the securing of information by trained job analysts through interviews with representatives of cooperating private and public agencies, and the recording of such information on a prepared survey schedule which includes the analyst's description of the positions covered, in terms of their duties and responsibilities as he found them in the reporting concern.<sup>23</sup> When this procedure is not possible, it will usually prove satisfactory to adopt a dual approach: (a) use correspondence questionnaires to secure data for the simpler and more easily understood key classes from a large group of reporting organizations; and (b) reserve personal interviews for covering the more specialized classes from a smaller group of agencies, for following up queries arising when the correspondence returns are reviewed, and in some instances for making initial contacts.<sup>24</sup>

In the personal interview method, first contact with participating concerns may be made by call of an official of the surveying agency, explaining the nature and purpose of the survey, its public significance, the

<sup>22</sup> "The only way to check the adequacy of salaries paid to patrolmen, firemen, recreation workers, and similar types of employees is on an interjurisdictional basis. It is more important, therefore, to obtain comparable pay data from other cities concerning these types of positions than to obtain from such places information concerning the prevailing rates for typists, accountants, or electricians." Jeremiah J. Donovan, "Pay Adjustments for City Employees," *Public Management*, January, 1942, p. 10.

<sup>23</sup> For an example of such a form and an instructive description of the procedure used, see Edwin O. Griffenhagen and Fred Telford, "The Principles and Technique of Preparing a Plan of Compensation for Positions and Employees in a Large Organization," *Public Personnel Studies*, January, 1925, pp. 21-22.

<sup>24</sup> In securing salary data from other public jurisdictions it is helpful also to request (a) copies of position-classification and pay plans; (b) the latest budget schedules and salary ordinances or statutes; and (c) copies of reports of any recent salary survey in the area concerned. From such material a competent analyst can derive much significant information.

kind of information to be solicited, and the confidential character of the inquiry, and suggesting the value of the inquiry to the firm itself. At that time arrangements can be made for a job analyst to interview representatives of the company who have a good knowledge of the duties of various positions and the organization and policies of the company. Equipped with definitions of key classes and specifications of other classes, the job analyst can then discuss key and other jobs with company representatives, going into duties, responsibilities, qualification standards, form of organization, and work-methods, so that the salary data secured can be applied to comparable classes.

When necessary, the analyst should make first-hand observation of work. He may exchange with the company's representative information on rates, hours, overtime pay practices, non-salary benefits and policies and the like. He is also in a position to discover the reasons for rates which seem unduly low or high. If reasonable latitude is permitted the job analyst, he will be able to secure data for jobs which may establish definite values at key points in the jurisdiction's position-classification and pay structure, even though the jobs were not included in the original list of key classes.<sup>25</sup>

WHEN the correspondence questionnaire method is the principal medium of contact with contributors to the study, an agreement to cooperate is first secured through a preliminary letter or, if possible, through a personal call. The questionnaires are then forwarded to selected organizations with directions for filling them out. Generally it is necessary to follow these up by subsequent letters or, locally, by telephone calls if not personal visits.

The usual correspondence questionnaire method covers a large number of firms or jurisdictions at relatively low cost to the surveying agency, the rest of the expense be-

<sup>25</sup> See United States Personnel Classification Board, *Report of Wage and Personnel Survey*, H. Doc. 62, 70th Cong., 2d sess., (Washington, Government Printing Office, 1929), pp. 64-66.

ing passed on to the contributing agencies. It will, however, secure fairly reliable salary data only on the more routine and more easily understood key classes, and then only if the reporting agency assigns the task to an employee who is competent to find out or determine whether the actual work done for the salaries he quotes matches any of the job descriptions furnished.

The correspondence method is far from being as reliable as the personal interview method on the less routine classes, discussion of which is usually necessary to assure mutual understanding of work-content and comparability of salaries quoted. It is not very difficult to make inquiry and comparison of routine positions in stenography, typing, and office appliance operation; it is more difficult for accounting or supervisory clerical positions; and it is still more difficult for professional, scientific, or executive positions located in different companies or jurisdictions. Such inquiry and comparison do not lend themselves effectively to correspondence methods.

The greatest value of salary data as a medium of comparing wage levels is attained only when the positions concerned are grouped according to common elements of duties, comparable in difficulty and responsibility and requiring for their proper performance like degrees of skill and knowledge. . . . Accordingly, the first essential of a government survey of salaries in non-government enterprises, having as its object a comparison of those salaries with the rates of pay for similar or comparable work in the government service, is that there must be a substantially accurate classification or stratification of these positions into classes of positions or zones of difficulty whose bounds agree with those of the classes and zones in which government positions have been arranged. Only under such circumstances is direct comparison possible. And even under this procedure, as positions in the higher zones of difficulty are encountered, comparisons become more difficult and less effective. Experience has demonstrated that the higher positions, embracing as they do varied combinations of tasks, complexities of exercised authority, and certain rather intangible phases of responsibility, can be effectively classified or zoned only by trained field agents. . . .<sup>27</sup>

<sup>27</sup> U. S. Personnel Classification Board, *Salaries for Routine Clerical Work in Private Industry* (Washington, Government Printing Office, 1929), p. 3.

Personal interviews, furthermore, are more likely to secure a wide variety of collateral information that will aid in tabulating and utilizing salary data. They also are better calculated to conserve time and expense for reporting participants, to remove misunderstandings and create confidence, and therefore to result in effective cooperation.

THE cooperation of participating agencies involves more than willingness to fill out a questionnaire; it requires an understanding of the purposes of the survey and a desire to report salary data carefully in accordance with the job descriptions furnished. To some concerns the procedure may be strange, or perhaps the reporting of salaries may not be in accordance with their policy of secrecy in that respect.<sup>27</sup> Objection or reluctance on this score calls for explanation of the soundness and significance of the survey and the usefulness of the data which private firms can contribute. It should also be emphasized that the information submitted will not be publicized by companies; that it will be consolidated in such a way that no one company is identified.<sup>28</sup> Further, it can be emphasized that the survey is of equal service to contributors; some one else will do most of the work and they will receive a final report covering a large number of employers in the region. To persuade

<sup>27</sup> "The secrecy which surrounds salaries in business organizations is not without significance. The persons with a monthly salary are expected to treat their remuneration as a strictly confidential matter. Hourly rates and usually weekly rates are known, and the employee is under no obligation to keep the size of his pay envelope to himself. But for all persons paid by the month or year, secrecy is the rule." George A. Graham, "Personnel Practices in Business and Governmental Organizations," Monograph 11, in *Problems of the American Public Service*, The Commission of Inquiry on Public Service Personnel (New York, McGraw-Hill, 1935), pp. 383-84.

<sup>28</sup> In periodic wage survey reports prepared by a private industry, each contributing company is identified by a code number. When final reports are presented, the contributing company is informed of its own code number only and that of the surveying company. Samuel L. H. Burk, "Translating Ratings into Rates," in *Putting Job Rating to Work*, Personnel Series No. 49 (New York, American Management Association, 1941), p. 14.

along these lines effectively, however, requires personal conference.

Too much stress cannot be placed on well-conducted personal interviews as a means of assuring comparability of the work for which salaries are being requested, quoted, or compared. Obviously, it is better to collect facts by which the degree of comparability between positions can be determined than to assume a status of equality from superficial items. To secure the privilege of personal interviews in the conduct of salary surveys requires funds, time, and perhaps considerable salesmanship, but the results amply repay the additional effort.<sup>29</sup>

#### SALARY SURVEY QUESTIONNAIRES

DEPENDING upon the method adopted, salary survey questionnaires or schedules may range from comprehensive and detailed to little more than summarizations.<sup>30</sup> In a comprehensive wage survey in 1928, the United States Personnel Classification Board used a "Schedule for Miscellaneous Employments" for recording the duties, qualification requirements, and salaries of positions in private industry, other than those of key classes. (These latter were reported on a "Specific Information Schedule.") It also used a "General Information Schedule" for reporting collateral information about the personnel policies of the firms covered in the other schedules. Field agents filled

<sup>29</sup> "Wage surveys are of rather limited value toward rational wage setting, unless the surveyors are rather intimately familiar with the jobs in question, and collect data by interviews and observation of the work, not merely by questionnaires. Undoubtedly, routinized methods of collection, even when based on excellent job analyses and specifications, will not be interpreted in like fashion by all the people who send in data; and here is a serious weakness of most occupational wage surveys. Careful and competent interviewing and inspection is necessary for the most adequate interpretation of wage quotations," Z. Clark Dickinson, *Collective Wage Determination* (New York, The Ronald Press Co., 1941), p. 244. See also J. R. Rue, "Techniques of Salary Administration," *Office Management Series No. 92* (New York, American Management Association, 1940), p. 12.

<sup>30</sup> For a helpful treatment of the design of questionnaires generally, see John M. Pfiffner, *Research Methods in Public Administration* (New York, The Ronald Press Co., 1940), Chap. XI.

out these schedules by the personal interview method.<sup>31</sup>

In any event, the information recorded should include the following items:

1. Name (or code number) and location of reporting organization; kind of business; some indication of its size, such as approximate number of employees.

2. Name and description of the positions to which the data relate.<sup>32</sup>

3. Number of employees in each key class of positions at each rate of pay, or at least at rates shown as "low, usual, high," or "entrance, average, maximum."<sup>33</sup>

4. Standard limits of pay for the class, if any have been established by the reporting agency.

5. Number of regular hours of work per day and per pay period, accompanied by information whether the rates quoted include payment for non-work days, e.g., Saturday afternoons, Sundays, and holidays.

6. Overtime pay practices: whether extra pay is granted for work in excess of the regular hours of work per day, or extra days a week, or on Saturday afternoons, Sundays, or holidays.

7. Character and amount or value of other benefits or privileges, such as temporary or other cost-of-living bonuses or differentials; vacation or sick leaves; bonus, profit-sharing, stock-purchasing, or group insurance plans; medical and dental services, etc.

8. For institutional classes, such as those in hospital organizations, the character and value of quarters, meals, laundry service, or

<sup>31</sup> U. S. Personnel Classification Board, *Report of Wage and Personnel Survey*, pp. 473-475. For examples of summary forms, see Baridon and Loomis, *op. cit.*, p. 61; Kress, *op. cit.*, p. 26; Donovan, *op. cit.*, p. 9.

<sup>32</sup> In correspondence inquiries, the descriptions of key classes, if sufficiently brief, are usually printed on the survey questionnaire itself; but sometimes are shown in accompanying instructions.

<sup>33</sup> In one salary survey conducted by a private concern, pay rates were reported separately by groups of employees in the same occupation according to their length of service, e.g., 3 to 5 years, 12 to 18 months, etc., depending on the occupation. This additional information, it was stated, made the data more useful, as salaries tend to increase with length of service. "No salary survey can be significant or informative which fails to present data as to length of service as well as salary." Kress, *op. cit.*, pp. 25-26.

other maintenance items which are furnished in addition to the salary reported.

Questionnaires designed to be filled in by private firms cannot, for practical reasons, be as comprehensive or detailed as those intended as data sheets or schedules for members of the salary survey staff. If filling out a correspondence questionnaire appears too burdensome a task, a private employer is apt to disregard it as requiring unreasonable time and effort. It is worth noting that even if the questionnaire calls for only a summary, it will receive a more favorable reception when it is confined to classes of positions occurring in the employer's type of business. In a 1939 salary survey for the Minnesota State Civil Service Department, five separate questionnaires were prepared, each containing descriptions of classes of positions expected to be found in: (1) all reporting firms; (2) hospitals and institutions; (3) manufacturing concerns and grain elevators; (4) lumber and nursery companies; and (5) construction and engineering firms. These questionnaires were submitted to contributors in accordance with their lines of business.<sup>34</sup>

#### TABULATING DATA

**TABULATING** the salary data gathered usually includes the following steps:

1. Checking the questionnaires or other salary survey forms for accuracy of allocation to class, where the form contains sufficient information for this purpose about duties, responsibilities, and qualification requirements.

2. Converting, if necessary, quoted hourly or weekly rates to a uniform monthly or annual basis (whichever is used in the jurisdiction), adjusting them, as may be required, to the common base of the regular number of hours of work required in the surveying jurisdiction for a month's or year's salary, and taking into consideration any special

<sup>34</sup> "Concerns employing large numbers of persons in a restricted variety of positions usually reflect most accurately the prevailing rates for those kinds of work, and any such employers in the vicinity should be singled out for special contact." Donovan, *op. cit.*, p. 10.

benefits, such as cost of living differentials, that can be measured in monetary values.

3. Consolidating the data (through mechanical tabulation or hand process, whichever is available and appropriate) by preparing a salary distribution table for each class of positions, all reporting companies or jurisdictions combined, showing the number ("frequency") of employees at each quoted salary rate.<sup>35</sup> This may involve critical examination of exceptional "lows" and "highs" and their elimination if the accompanying information about such rates warrants such action. Where for large groups, specific non-monetary benefits or privileges, such as leaves with pay, are important, the facts applicable to these groups may be shown in keyed footnotes. Usually, there is no way of adjusting salary data mathematically to compensate for differences in these factors, and when they are radically different from those in the surveying jurisdiction, it may be necessary to eliminate the corresponding salary quotations from the tables.

4. On the basis of the data in each such frequency distribution table, computing the weighted average, and determining by inspection (or computing statistically) the first quartile, median, third quartile, and mode.<sup>36</sup>

5. Further consolidating these data in a summary table. The names of the classes of positions are listed vertically in the stub at the left of the table; the box heads horizontally across the top of the table may read: Low (or Minimum); Average (or Mean);

<sup>35</sup> Sometimes it is necessary to tabulate data by salary intervals instead of by single rates. In such cases the midpoint of each interval is used as a basis for computations.

<sup>36</sup> The "weighted average" (arithmetic mean) is computed by multiplying each salary rate by the number of employees receiving that rate, adding the products, and dividing by the total number of employees. The "first quartile" is the point among the salary rates, arranged in ascending order, below which one-quarter of the number of employees fall. The "median" is the middle point, on either side of which one-half of the number of employees fall. The "third quartile" is the point above which one-quarter of the number of employees fall. The range between the first and third quartile points is known as the "interquartile range," and marks off the limits within which fall the middle half of all the individual employees' salaries in the distribution. The "mode" is the single salary rate which occurs most frequently.

High (or Maximum); First Quartile; Median; Third Quartile; Mode.

Other tables or distributions, of course, may be found useful. For example, the data for each class may be shown by reporting concerns, using code numbers to conceal their identity, or consolidated by types of business or by "large," "medium," and "small" concerns. It is customary, also, to summarize the data separately by private industry and governmental jurisdictions.

In public jurisdictions wherein position-classification plans include administratively or legislatively established "classification grades" or common zones of difficulty and responsibility of work,<sup>37</sup> still further consolidation of data may be effected by grouping into such grades the salary data for the appropriate classes. This procedure has certain statistical advantages in such a situation, because it increases the numerical strength of the data to be analyzed and compared with existing pay scales in those grades within the service.<sup>38</sup>

In order to utilize the tabulations of salary data, it is necessary for the responsible officials to decide which "measure of central tendency," e.g., the average, median, interquartile range, or third quartile, they will use as a guide in interpreting and applying the data. The "outside" average is frequently used in determining the new "inside" average of the corresponding class. However, the median rate is to be preferred because, compared to the average, it is less distorted by unusually high or low rates. Emphasis may also be placed upon the representativeness of the interquartile range (of which the median is the mid-point), since it eliminates the lower and upper fourths of all the rates quoted for a given class.<sup>39</sup> In most instances, the particular figure to be selected depends upon a decision of general pay policy. For example, it may be decided to pay somewhat

higher rates than the average of private industry, in which event the third quartile may be selected as a guide to the desired median rate for the class concerned. Or, for the desired median rates of key classes, it may be decided to adopt approximately the median rates of other public jurisdictions or the third quartile rates of private salary data, whichever are higher.

#### USE OF SALARY DATA IN DETERMINING RATES

THE general practice in utilizing comparative salary data in determining government salary levels involves the consideration of many additional factors at the same time. Some of these, like salary data, can be set forth in statistical tabulations; e.g., trends in the cost of living, or effect upon expenditures for personal services in the jurisdiction. Other factors to be evaluated in connection with salary data provide little, if any basis for mathematical adjustments; e.g., relative advantage or disadvantage to employees of the jurisdiction compared with employees covered in the salary data, concerning vacation and sick leaves, and other non-salary benefits previously indicated. Some factors are rather intangible matters of general policy, such as relative security of employment, or the level of qualifications desired of public employees in the particular government. Occasionally, also, there is a desire to compress all pay rates in the jurisdiction between a "social floor," below which it would be unwise to pay any employee working for the state or city, and a jurisdictional "ceiling," represented, for example, by the salary of the governor, mayor, or the elected heads of city departments. Usually, decisions are made by the exercise of judgment based on all these factors and their varying degrees of persuasion or dissuasion.

Realistically, therefore, prevailing salary surveys are not devices for solving mathematically the problem of adjusting salaries in a public jurisdiction. They are essentially samplings and in view of their limitations,

<sup>37</sup> *Position-Classification in the Public Service*, pp. 210-14.

<sup>38</sup> U. S. Personnel Classification Board, *Salaries for Routine Clerical Work in Private Industry* (Washington, Government Printing Office, 1929), p. 6.

<sup>39</sup> Kress, *op. cit.*, p. 27. This article also includes exhibits of tabulation forms, pp. 28-30.

previously indicated, they do not obviate the necessity of balancing conflicting personnel, economic, and fiscal considerations in determining public pay levels. Certainly, in the interests of internal consistency and equity of the jurisdiction's pay plan, there can be no perfect matching of inside and outside salaries for all the key classes. The general trend of the relationships existing between inside and outside salaries can, however, be followed by anchoring the jurisdiction's pay scales to the outside rates at several key points, leaving the rates at other points to be worked out under the relationships of the position-classification plan.

**I**N THE actual process of overhauling the pay structure, following the salary survey, the order of events might be somewhat as follows:

1. By reference to the salary data and other factors mentioned, the existing pay scales for all the key classes are reviewed. Revisions, when decided upon, are expressed in terms of the desired median, or sometimes the minimum, rate of each key class selected for this purpose.

2. These key rates are then used as a frame of reference for establishing median (or other) rates for other key or non-key classes. This is done by "interpolation," requiring consistency with class-relationships shown in the position-classification plan. Some modification of the key rates may be required to work these relationships out properly. In addition, compliance with any decision as to a jurisdiction-wide "floor" or "ceiling" is necessary. In this whole process the use of administratively established classification-grades is a convenient device in the larger jurisdictions.<sup>40</sup>

3. Pay scales for each class are then constructed in accordance with (a) decisions governing the normal physical structure of pay scales such as spread between minimum and maximum, number and amount of steps, or overlapping or non-overlapping in the same series of classes; and (b) specific char-

acteristics of any classes requiring variations in these respects.

4. Initial and subsequent cost estimates are then prepared on the basis of these pay scales, the rules for adjusting salaries when the revision will become effective, and any salary advancement features of the pay plan.

5. These cost estimates are examined by the appropriate authorities. This step may lead to approval or to new basic decisions requiring a repetition to some extent of the foregoing processes.

**I**N CONCLUSION, it may be of interest to refer briefly to a procedure used by some well-known industrial companies which have position-classification plans based on "point systems" or "factor-comparison methods" of job evaluation. Industrial companies using these methods are in a position to chart the prevailing rate curve or slope which can be used graphically to find the rate for a non-key class by interpolation. To draw the curve, job evaluation points are first laid off on the X-axis, and salary amounts on the Y-axis. Points representing rate quotations (Y) for key classes of given point ratings (X) are then plotted. This gives a scatter diagram. The line of best fit is drawn through the points. The rate corresponding to any number of evaluation points can then be read or computed from the chart. In this way, job evaluation points for any class are convertible into salary guides in conformity with the trend of prevailing rates as shown by the salary survey of key classes.<sup>41</sup>

The making of salary surveys should be regarded as one of the continuing functions involved in the administration of a pay plan for a public jurisdiction; frequent spot checks of prevailing rates and more thorough salary surveys of key classes when necessary will keep salary data reasonably current and will disclose broad trends.

<sup>40</sup> For examples of such a chart, see Eugene J. Benge, Samuel L. H. Burk and Edward N. Hay, *Manual of Job Evaluation* (New York, Harper & Bros., 1941), p. 144; J. R. Rue, *op. cit.*, p. 13; C. Canby Balderston, *op. cit.*, p. 40.

<sup>41</sup> *Position-Classification in the Public Service*, p. 213.

# Organizing for Personnel Administration

LAWRENCE A. APPLEY

LITERARY  
C.P.D.

**T**O DAY, every civil service commission is challenged with the greatest opportunity of its career. As a result of its activities in this emergency, it will go down in history as either a vital, living, realistic agency that tangibly and continually contributed to the successful culmination of this country's war effort, or as an agency that hampered progress, that should be restricted in its jurisdiction and possibly abolished.

Government personnel executives are facing exactly the same challenge. They will either be individuals whose advice is sought, whose influence is felt, and who are considered towers of strength in their own organizations, or they will be extremely unpopular individuals because of their identification with an agency that will be in disrepute. This possibility should, in itself, shake some of us out of our complacency and cause us to look around for the purpose of seeing what is going on in the other fellow's back yard. The civil service commission was created to assist the government. Strange as it may seem to some, the government was not created for the purpose of making civil service possible.

The typical civil service law, and its interpretations and restrictions, put us in a most difficult position. To put it in modern lingo, those of us identified with the civil service

LAWRENCE A. APPLEY, Vice President of the Vick Chemical Company, is also acting in the capacity of Expert Consultant to the Secretary of War on civilian personnel matters. He was formerly Educational Director of the Socony-Vacuum Oil Company. This article is adapted from an address delivered at the 1941 annual meeting of the Civil Service Assembly.

activities are squarely behind the "eight ball." By that I mean that the law has placed us in a position that makes our success as a service agency difficult. The law holds the commission responsible for policing civil service procedures. This is distinctly an undesirable position for any personnel agency to be in.

It is absolutely impossible to separate responsibility for successful results from the responsibility for the people who have to attain those results. That means that the responsibility for personnel policy and procedure is that of the line and staff executives who supervise the personnel. A personnel department, to be successful in any organization, must gather its strength from the quality of the advice and service rendered to executives and supervisors, rather than from the jurisdiction and authority exercised. As civil service administrators, we must, by the attitude and facility with which we work, overcome the unfavorable position in which the law has placed us.

## BASIC FUNCTIONS OF PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION

**I**N ORGANIZING for personnel administration, it is necessary to have a clear conception of the basic functions of a personnel department or agency. In my thinking, these are three in number. The first is *Influence* upon the operating executives. The second is *Research* in the field of personnel policies and procedures. The third is *Administration* of certain plans and procedures that cannot be more efficiently

handled within the operating departments. Let us consider these functions one at a time.

The *Influence* that civil service executives exert upon the operating executives, is, in my opinion, the most important of the three basic responsibilities. It is, at the same time, the most neglected. Influence requires initiative. It requires self-discipline. It requires careful planning and patience. It is not a definite, tangible activity that reduces itself to a schedule or to accurate measurement. It is somewhat like that phase of a salesman's activity which involves getting new business and developing new customers. Many salesmen hope that routine details of their jobs and the requirements of present customers will keep them so busy from day to day that they will not have to exert the effort required to look for new contacts and new business. Many personnel people are like that.

To influence operating executives, we must contact them. I wonder if there are any of us who have a sense of relief when a telephone call to a chief executive results in the response that he is out or not available. Are there any of us who are perfectly satisfied to have top flight executives place contacts with us in the hands of some subordinate officer down the line?

As personnel executives, we are dealing with the most important activity that there is in any organization—the human element. No activity can be handled efficiently without proper attention to the personnel involved. There is no activity with which any executive deals that is as important as the people in his organization. Why should we apologize for taking the time of top management, or how can we be satisfied to be shoved off by reference to subordinates? After all, the subordinate will not act until after clearance with the chief, and, personally, I would rather tell the chief the story myself than to have it go to him second hand. Contact with top management is necessary if our influence is to be proportionate to our responsibility.

AS YOU all know, there is an increasingly serious shortage of skilled workers. The government agencies requiring such workers are subject to the competition of huge industries looking for the same type of people. If we abolish piracy, which somehow must be abolished, then skilled workers are not available. We must take any individuals we can get and help them develop the required skills. Such a program necessitates school rooms, instructors, equipment, training media, and similar facilities.

A large industry in this country, now filling large government contracts, recently made an exceptional offer to the United States government. This industry agreed to build housing facilities, to construct and equip a school, to furnish the instructors, and to meet all the expenses involved, including board and room for 1,500 to 2,000 government workers at a time, for the purpose of making mechanics out of them. The correspondence involved was passed on down the line until it fell into the hands of "underlings." A visit was made to the industrial plant by these subordinates. Top management was not contacted. As a result, a report was submitted which led to a rejection of the offer. This was tragic, but at the same time inevitable when important questions involving personnel are delegated to anyone less than chief executives.

In contacting top management, our job should be to convince that management of executive and supervisory responsibility on personnel matters, of the importance of clear-cut personnel policies and adequate procedures, of the supreme importance of personnel work in the organization. When top management is convinced along these lines, personnel work is far more effective and is done with greater willingness, promptness and simplicity by all involved. Line management, when it accepts a responsibility, can do more in relation to that responsibility than any staff officer or department.

Top management wants and expects such efforts from its staff executives and particu-

larly from its personnel people. A chief executive sets up a competent staff for the purpose of advising him correctly. He wants experts representing the various activities for which he is responsible. The caliber of a chief executive may often be determined by the quality of the staff with which he surrounds himself. The average chief executive does not want "yes men." He wants men who have individual judgment and convictions based on sound experience and mental capacity. If a staff executive does not get to top management on important matters and those matters suffer thereby, the chief executive can hold no one else responsible but the staff executive.

Naturally, big men do not want to be bothered with trivial matters. Check with your chief on basic policy, on fundamental assignment of responsibility, on main issue, on trends and long-range planning. Once we have gained decision in relation to these broad and important issues, then it is up to us to provide proper handling for individual cases. Possibly our experience with top management has been unfortunate because we have tried to secure its attention on very minor matters.

#### IMPORTANCE OF RESEARCH

THE second basic function of a personnel department is *Research*. Personnel people in private enterprise or civil service executives in government circles should be the best informed individuals on personnel matters in their organization. We should have thorough and clear knowledge of sound personnel policy and practice in the field of private enterprise, as well as the public service. We should be fully acquainted with trends and developments in civil service practice both in this country and others. We should know actual practice within our own organization so well that we can accurately anticipate management and employee reaction to proposed changes or innovations. Such research is required in order that we may be in a position to assist management in arriving at sound decisions.

A personnel man has one foot in the grave when he adopts an attitude common to so many executives in all types of activities . . . "It has always been done this way. We have been successful, and I see no reason for change." People are changing, conditions are changing, society is changing. The field which is the most susceptible to altering practice is the field of personnel. It is necessary for us to keep alive to what is going on and to be wide open mentally to the consideration of better ways of doing given tasks. Mental alertness and awareness to the necessity for change and progress are absolutely necessary if the civil service is to survive.

There is some talk, as well as activity, at the present time in connection with revision and improvement of efficiency ratings. Research in connection with revision should include a careful and accurate study of supervisory and employee reactions to efficiency ratings in their present form, and to any possible changes. These ratings are of little use if the supervisors who make them out are not convinced of their importance or value, and if bad morale is created among the employees.

Sometimes we are inclined to work toward perfection of form and procedure in connection with rating plans. An efficiency rating system that supervisors appreciate and use and that employees welcome and benefit from is far superior to an absolutely perfect system technically, which may be too complicated and too perfect for the organization to use. This particular procedure is mentioned to emphasize the all-inclusive nature of personnel research.

#### THE PLACE OF ADMINISTRATION

THE third basic function to which I am drawing your attention is the *Administration* of the routine operations required in connection with established plans and procedures such as examination, recruitment, classification, certification, efficiency ratings, etc. While necessary, this function, in relation to the other two, is the least im-

portant. It is, however, the one that consumes the time of most civil service executives. When a personnel worker becomes so tied down with forms, reviews, approvals and clearances that he does not have time to contact the operating executives whom he is serving and to conduct the intensive research which is so essential, it has a deadening effect upon all the work of the personnel department.

One of the large government agencies in Washington employed a personnel director. Because he was one of the best in the country and already had a high-paid job with private industry, they could get him only on a dollar-a-year basis. He and his company were willing to make the sacrifice if his service would be of value to the government in this emergency. His introduction to his new work was rather startling, since he soon found himself involved in "serious" questions, such as whether or not a certain stenographer should receive \$1620 a year rather than \$1440. He was deluged with requests to increase classifications of certain jobs, to find ways and means of getting around established laws and procedures. These were administrative details with which he had not dealt for years.

When this particular gentleman discovered that that was the common conception of what a government personnel man was supposed to do, he withdrew from the job. Whether or not his final action was correct, the situation itself contains a moral for you and me. Experienced, capable personnel people should not, at any time, become involved in work that far lesser people could handle satisfactorily. In order to avoid such situations, we must analyze continually the relation of what people are doing to the actual potential of those people, and adjust work assignments accordingly.

Let's be honest with ourselves. How many of us are well pleased when we find on our desks in the morning sufficient routine and detail work to keep us busy all day. This gives us an alibi for not contacting the executives whom we should contact and for

not reading, studying and attending conferences that will enlarge our viewpoints and fund of knowledge. Routine does not require initiative. It does not require self-discipline and push. We do it automatically and keep busy at it. Influencing others and conducting research requires the very best that is in us.

The atmosphere of emergency sometimes causes undue confusion and unnecessary work as a result of panicky attempts to appear to be doing one's part. Just as soon as a situation demands sacrifices, some of us are like the famous knight who returned from the wars to discover that during his absence his wife had been besieged by another suitor. Upon learning that his competitor for his wife's affections had left the palace only a few hours before his arrival, the knight ran out into the courtyard, jumped on his horse, and rode off "in all directions."

There comes to my mind a personnel officer who, when the President of this country called for longer hours of work, immediately put his office on a two shift basis. He is a great big rugged sort of a chap who beats his chest and cries to the world that there will be no holidays, no Saturday afternoons and no Sundays. Because of the added pressure on the people in his office, absence for illness began to increase. Physical breakdowns appeared. Sizeable increase in the number of people was necessary. This called for an investigation.

It was interesting to discover that this particular executive had an established practice requiring him to read every document or piece of mail leaving his department every day. In the course of reading, he had never been known to allow anything to go out the first time as it came to him. In over 60 per cent of the cases, the letters and other material rejected by him required three editions before final signature and release. Investigation of the corrections made by him proved them to be trivial and insignificant. On the face of it, such a situation would seem to be downright criminal.

## THE NEED FOR READJUSTMENT

IT IS fairly safe to say that there is not a person in this assembly that has complete comprehension of the terrific adjustments that lie ahead in regard to civil service. The whole merit system in all of its developments since 1883 is liable to blow up in our faces if we do not streamline, simplify, cut red tape, pay enough money, and act quickly enough to get the skill and mind power into the government service that is required in this defense emergency that may, at any time, be actual war.

What value is there in having a government office in San Bernardino send a personnel form to a civil service office in Los Angeles which later forwards it to San Francisco, where it is rubber stamped, and returned to San Bernardino before an employee can be put to work? What value is there in having a great number of people in government departments spending days and nights trying to arrive at classifications that will not be rejected by the civil service commission? What is there to be gained when five hundred people are required to handle detailed routine and paper work in connection with the employment and maintenance of a government employee organization of 17,000? It would seem that much of the routine required before government employees can be put to work could be eliminated, and in its place a system of post-auditing instituted that would catch serious cases.

Possibly our research should include a study of the number of serious situations avoided by all this tremendous volume of paper work. If a pre-audit of five thousand cases avoids twenty mistakes, it is possible that it might be better to take a chance in view of the present emergency, eliminate pre-audits, and catch up with those mistakes later on.

Some may feel that this is heresy at a Civil Service Assembly meeting. It is presented, however, with a feeling of confidence, because I know that these are the sentiments

of the United States Civil Service Commissioners, and the Civil Service Commission of Canada. I know that the Commissioners in this country have instituted many short cuts, have cut much red tape, and are preaching the policy of post-auditing. The difficulty arises in the lower levels of the civil service where these viewpoints have not been accepted, and in the personnel departments of government bureaus and agencies. The civil service has been criticized by government field establishments for restrictions and requirements in relation to personnel that the Commission itself has never requested and, in many cases, has been trying to abolish. Many of these have been instituted as a part of bureau or departmental personnel practices.

One of the members of our own United States Civil Service Commission boiled this attitude into a very simple and understandable statement by saying that, whereas two years ago we were interested in "one hundred and one" different civil service activities in relation to government employees, our attention must now be focused upon one—the successful discovery and recruitment of employees who can be put to work at once.

## THE HUMAN ELEMENT

SO FAR in this presentation, three basic functions of a personnel department have been discussed with the hope that they might be of assistance in organizing for personnel administration. Aside from these basic functions, there is a philosophy that is required for successful and full realization of personnel objectives. That is the philosophy that personnel work is a human activity. Because of the great volume of paper work and routine, we are inclined to think in terms of forms, figures and patterns, rather than in terms of vital, living, interesting individuals.

Some of you may be interested in baseball and may have attended some of the large games where very complicated and complete scoreboards are used. Possibly you have

noticed that every once in a while one of the numbers on the scoreboard slides back and a human face peers out at the field. If you are dealing with personnel statistics, remember the scoreboard. If you just push the numbers back, you see behind them human faces. All the figures reflect the activities of people, and you can only change the figures by changing people; changing their habits and attitudes, increasing their skill and improving their knowledge. People cannot be handled by cut and dried regulations, procedures and patterns. If the civil service or any personnel agency loses the human touch, it has lost its greatest effectiveness.

Last evening, I was brought back here from the dinner at the club by the sergeant of the Jacksonville police force who has been so faithful and gracious in looking out for the welfare and interest of those attending this assembly. As we drove along, police calls came in over the short-wave radio in the car, and I asked him if the car is a part of the patrol equipment. His affirmative reply caused me to wonder why the car shows no identification of being a police car. It is no different in color, and there is no identification that would make it distinctive from the ordinary passenger car.

In reply to my question, the sergeant said that the car is used for women and children. The purpose of making it look like any other car was to save children, particularly, from any sense of arrest or conspicuousness in relation to the plight in which they found themselves. The sergeant told me that it is against police practice in Florida to arrest children. As he says, they are simply "detained" in cases of difficulty, and no records are kept. The purpose of this story is to suggest that here is an illustration of complete recognition of the human element in the responsibility of the Jacksonville police department. Despite the fact that people may have done something wrong and may be in trouble, they are treated as human beings and not as culprits.

If you ever have difficulty in going to sleep at night, here is a suggestion which may

surpass the common practice of counting sheep: Consider the fact that there are no two people in this world that are alike, and no one of us is the same this minute as he was a minute ago or will be a minute from now. In your endeavor to comprehend just what that means, I guarantee that you'll fall off to sleep. Full comprehension of it might help in understanding the point that I am trying to put over here—that you cannot handle all people alike according to established routines and practices. Personnel work is a human activity and must be adapted to each individual involved.

**I**N SUMMARY, the message of the moment is this: In organizing for personnel administration, keep in mind first, that the activities of a personnel department divide themselves into basic functions that must be kept in proper balance; second, three suggested basic functions are influence, research and administration, of which the last is the least important; third, that personnel work as such is a human activity and must be individualized, even to the sacrifice of pet procedures, forms and patterns; and fourth, this emergency demands that we contact top management and convince that management of the importance of the activity with which we are identified and of the absolute necessity that line executives and supervisors accept their rightful responsibility toward personnel. It also demands that we simplify, streamline and reduce to an absolute minimum the paper work and routine which interferes with efficiency and even causes us to neglect the human factor in our organizations.

The civil service commission, as the personnel agency of the government, is dealing with the most interesting activity in this world of affairs—people. Because of the inherent nature of that activity, the civil service is a vital, living, changing, growing institution. Executives and subordinates charged with the responsibility of the successful operation of the civil service law are of the finest. I challenge you to gather to-

gether the representatives of any profession from any area at any time and find any better, more capable group of people than you will find at gatherings of those who have dedicated their lives to personnel work. As I look into your faces this noon, I have no doubt as to what your answer is going to be

to the challenge of the present situation. My plea is that we continually take individual stock of ourselves and our activities to make sure that we are mentally alert and that we maintain proper balance in relation to a world in which the tempo of change grows swifter every day.

# The Committee on Wartime Requirements for Specialized Personnel

LIBRARY  
C.P.D.

STEUART HENDERSON BRITT

THE demands of the Army, the Navy, and those war agencies having jurisdiction over highly technical matters, are combining to cause an unusually heavy drain on specialized personnel today. As a result of more and more calls from private industry and government for scientists and other specialists, there have been serious depletions in the ranks of technical workers, teachers, professors, and research workers. Because of the increasing demands for specialists and the limited number available, a special committee was appointed by the National Resources Planning Board on January 2, 1942 to advise the National Roster of Scientific and Specialized Personnel<sup>1</sup> on this problem, and to develop a plan for the guidance of national policy with reference to the continued supply of professional manpower.

This Committee, termed the "Committee on Wartime Requirements for Specialized Personnel," functioned as an integral part of the National Roster of Scientific and Specialized Personnel. The members of the Committee were asked to formulate recommendations regarding various problems concerning scientific and specialized personnel of the country, and to report to the National

Roster and to the National Resources Planning Board as quickly as possible, preferably within sixty days. In other words, the first task of the Committee was to study war needs for professional manpower and the ways in which those needs might be adequately met.

## MEMBERSHIP OF THE COMMITTEE

THE Committee on Wartime Requirements was divided into an Advisory Committee and an Operating Committee. The following named persons served as members of the two groups:

### ADVISORY COMMITTEE:

OWEN D. YOUNG, General Electric Company,  
*Chairman*

LEONARD CARMICHAEL, Tufts College; Director,  
National Roster of Scientific and Specialized  
Personnel

E. C. ELLIOTT, Purdue University

GUY STANTON FORD, American Historical Association

MARION B. FOLSOM, Eastman Kodak Company

GENERAL LEWIS B. HERSHEY, Selective Service System

EDWARD F. McGRADY, Office of the Under Secretary  
of War

MONSIGNOR JOHN A. RYAN, National Catholic Welfare Council

JOHN W. STUDEBAKER, United States Office of Education

BALDWIN M. WOODS, University of California

### OPERATING COMMITTEE:

JAMES C. O'BRIEN, Executive Officer, National Roster of Scientific and Specialized Personnel

HENRY A. BARTON, American Institute of Physics

MAXWELL DEVOE, United States Department of Agriculture

MICHAEL DRESE, George Washington University

JOHN M. GAUS, University of Wisconsin

ELI GINZBERG, Columbia University

<sup>1</sup>For a description of the Roster, see Leonard Carmichael, "The National Roster of Scientific and Specialized Personnel," *Public Personnel Review*, April, 1941, pp. 130-33.

STEUART HENDERSON BRITT is a Consultant of the National Roster of Scientific and Specialized Personnel. He is also Executive Director of the Office of Psychological Personnel of the National Research Council, and Assistant Professor of Psychology at George Washington University.

C. S. MARSH, American Council on Education  
 C. B. MATTINGLY, Association of American Railroads  
 JAMES MITCHELL, Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada  
 WILLARD PARKER, Department of Civil Service, State of Louisiana  
 HENRY REINING, National Institute of Public Affairs  
 LLOYD SHORT, University of Minnesota  
 KENNETH P. VINSER, University of Louisville  
 ARNOLD S. ZANDER, American Federation of State, County and Municipal Employees  
 STEUART HENDERSON BRITT, George Washington University; National Roster of Scientific and Specialized Personnel; *Executive Secretary of Operating Committee*

#### MAJOR ACTIVITIES OF COMMITTEE

MANY different agencies concerned with technically trained personnel have again and again urged the formulation of a national manpower policy, in order to provide an adequate supply of well qualified technically trained individuals in the proper proportions for the armed services, private industry, colleges and other training agencies, and federal, state, and local government. Accordingly, the Committee concerned itself with four major activities:

1. Obtaining estimates of numbers of professionally trained personnel needed by the Army, Navy, industry, education, research, and federal, state, and local government.
2. Discovering sources of additional trained personnel in the professions and sciences, and numbers of such personnel who may be available both now and at stated times throughout 1942 and 1943.
3. Ascertaining those institutions which by virtue of equipment, staff, location, etc., may be able to furnish an increased number of graduates trained for certain types of employment.
4. Furnishing information to institutions concerning fields in which need is most urgent, for use in guiding students and in shaping educational policy.

Since one of the principal tasks was the preparation of an estimate of the country's needs for technically trained manpower for the war effort during the coming years, the

Committee turned for its information directly to the suppliers and "consumers" of professional men, that is, to the Army, Navy, industry, education, research, and federal, state, and local governments. However, as a "cross-check" in confirming or questioning the accuracy of estimates obtained from these sources, various professional societies were also asked to make such surveys as they could and to prepare estimates of needs and supply in their respective fields.

The members of the Operating Committee divided themselves into a series of sub-committees, concerned with the following areas: (1) federal government (including Army and Navy); (2) state and local government; (3) industry; (4) education; (5) research; (6) professional societies; and (7) Selective Service. The month of January was devoted largely to securing information by questionnaires, mail, personal visits, and other means, of the possible shortages and surpluses which might exist in the various scientific and professional fields. No attempt was made at this point to secure quantitative data, but rather the emphasis was on "judgment estimates."

The fields studied by the members of the Operating Committee are set forth below.<sup>2</sup> An asterisk preceding an occupation indicates a reported shortage in that field as of January, 1942.

#### *Management and Administration*

- \*Accounting and Auditing
- \*Budget Administration
- \*Organization and Procedure Analysis
- \*Personnel Management
- \*Purchasing and Procurement\*

#### *Agriculture and Biology*

- Agricultural Economics
- Agricultural Engineering
- Agronomy and Soil Science
- Animal and Poultry Husbandry
- Botany
- Dairy Science
- Entomology
- Fish and Wildlife Resources

<sup>2</sup> It should be noted that the members of the Committee were assigned the function only of estimating the needs in the professional fields, and were not to concern themselves with sub-professional fields.

Forestry and Range Management	*Engineering, Marine
Genetics	*Engineering, Mechanical
Plant Pathology	*Engineering, Mining, Metallurgical, Mineral Technology
Zoology	
<i>Medicine and Related Fields</i>	
Anatomy	*Engineering, Radio
*Bacteriology and Pathology	*Engineering, Safety
Cancerology	*Engineering, Sanitary
*Cardiology	*Engineering, Testing of Materials
*Dentistry	*Engineering, Transit and Traffic
Dermatology	*Geophysics
Dietetics, Metabolism	*Geology
*Endocrinology	*Mathematics
*Gastroenterology	*Meteorology
*General Practice	Motion Pictures—Engineering, Production Direction
Gynecology and Obstetrics	*Physics
*Hygiene, Public Health, Sanitation	
*Immunology, Infectious Diseases	<i>Social Sciences</i>
*Industrial Medicine	Anthropology
*Internal Medicine	*Economics
*Neurology	Education, Physical
*Nutrition	Education, Secondary
*Ophthalmology	Education, Vocational
Optometry	*Geography
Pediatrics	History
Pharmacology and Experimental Therapeutics	Law
Pharmacy	Library Science
Physiology	Political Science
*Psychiatry	*Psychology
*Radiology	*Recreation Leadership
Speech Pathology	Social Welfare
*Surgery	Sociology
*Tropical Medicine and Parasitology	*Statistics
Tuberculosis	
*Urology, Venereology	<i>Arts and Languages</i>
*Veterinary Medicine	Dramatic Arts
*Nursing (R.N.)	*Foreign Languages
<i>Engineering and Physical Sciences</i>	Graphic Arts
Architecture, General	*Journalism
*Architecture, Naval	Music
*Astronomy	Sculpture
Ceramics and Glass	<i>Clergy</i>
*Chemistry, Analytical	Clergymen
*Chemistry, Biological	
*Chemistry, Inorganic	
*Chemistry, Metallurgical	
*Chemistry, Organic	
*Chemistry, Physical	
*Engineering, Aeronautical	
*Engineering, Architectural	
*Engineering, Automotive	
*Engineering, Chemical	
*Engineering, Civil	
*Engineering, Communications	
*Engineering, Electrical	
*Engineering, Heating, Ventilating, Refrigerating, and Air Conditioning	

## THE WORK OF THE SUBCOMMITTEES

AFTER non-quantitative data had been secured, the various subcommittees began the task of securing quantitative estimates so far as obtainable in all fields. The information secured may have a very direct bearing on national policy with reference to the training and most effective utilization of scientific and specialized personnel. Although the entire report of each subcommittee cannot be set forth here, a few major conclusions in each case may be of interest.

*Subcommittee on Federal Government.* The members of this Subcommittee secured a great deal of factual information from the Army, the Navy, and various branches of the federal government. Although the totals obtained may not be looked upon as precise quantitative data, they have an important function as a basis for rating extent of demand on a qualitative scale. In other words, the occupational fields in which there are serious shortages on the one hand, and those in which no shortages are anticipated in the years ahead, are rather definitely known. The Subcommittee concluded that a continuing fact-finding service is essential for the war effort.

*Subcommittee on State and Local Government.* The members of this Subcommittee consulted with authorities in various areas of local government, and made personal contacts with a considerable number of public officials, organizations, and personnel agencies. The governors of each of the forty-eight states were asked to name a special representative with whom the Subcommittee could work. Materials received from these representatives entered into the final report of this Subcommittee. Also, through the co-operation of the Bureau of Public Administration of the University of California and the International City Managers' Association, a questionnaire was sent to all cities of the United States with populations of over ten thousand.

Although no quantitative data can be released, two conclusions of this Subcommittee are of special interest. First, state and local governments probably will continue relatively stable in spite of the war; estimates indicate that nearly all state and local agencies will continue to operate with about present staff requirements. Second, even though the total number of technical and specialized personnel required for state and local operations continues almost unchanged, there are vacancies of long standing in some fields, and needs are intensifying because of losses to federal service and to industry.

*Subcommittee on Industry.* Probably the most significant fact disclosed by the investigation of industrial needs for scientific and specialized personnel in industry was the almost complete lack of collective information on the subject. Studies of industrial labor supply requirements have emphasized almost entirely the skilled trades or occupations of a sub-professional level, and have failed to spell out specific needs in the scientific and professional areas. Since a comprehensive appraisal of the supply of, and need for, professionally trained personnel within industry would require a complete classified industrial census of such workers and an accurate determination of the pattern of industrial employment under the impetus of the "war production program," precise quantitative data are largely lacking.

However, some indication of the industrial needs for scientific and specialized personnel can be inferred from the very magnitude of the war production program in terms of total employment and monetary outlay. As of the end of 1941, a total of 5,000,000 workers were engaged in war production, but by the end of 1942 such employment is expected to be in excess of 15,000,000 workers (exclusive of those in the armed forces). Also, the fact that total annual expenditures by the federal government on the war effort will approach one-half of the national income in 1942 is indicative of the demands that will be made of industry, with attendant needs for specialized personnel.

*Subcommittee on Education.* Most of the quantitative data concerning the prospective supply of professionally trained personnel were obtained through the cooperation of the American Council on Education. Acting for the Committee, the Council sent appropriate questionnaires to over eighteen hundred colleges and universities. They were asked to supply detailed information concerning the "output" of undergraduate and graduate students at various periods up to and including January, 1943; to provide data regarding possible shortages and surpluses of faculty personnel; and to submit

information concerning present or potential special training capacities available. After the final processing of these data, the general results will be released to the colleges, universities, and technical and professional schools of the country to assist in their guidance programs. The information collected suggests the desirability of:

1. Subsidizing able, needy high-school students.
2. Emphasizing mathematics and physical sciences in the high-school curriculum.
3. Subsidizing the able high-school graduates to enable them to enter college.
4. Limiting the indiscriminate volunteering and "drafting" of students with specialized training.
5. Assigning students to the armed forces, industries, or research so as to enable them to make the maximum contribution to the war effort.
6. Registering and assigning all women with scientific and specialized training.

7. Revising the curricula for women's colleges in the light of ascertained shortages so that college women may make a greater contribution.

Perhaps the most far reaching conclusion of this Subcommittee is that *at the very time when there is the greatest need for scientific and specialized personnel, the sources of the potential supply are actually being reduced.*

*Subcommittee on Research.* This Subcommittee dealt primarily with the problem of shortages and surpluses among various research organizations.

*Subcommittee on Professional Societies.* As indicated above, the estimates of shortages and surpluses in the various professional fields by the professional societies were compared with data obtained by the other subcommittees.

*Subcommittee on Selective Service.* This Subcommittee was concerned with relating the data secured by the other subcommittees to the total picture of technically trained men subject to training and service under the provisions of the Selective Training and

Service Act of 1940. An analysis of the problem in terms of the British experience indicated the desirability of greater emphasis on "availability for the war effort" rather than on "deferment from military service," and on careful analysis of the special skills of those subject to induction into the Army.

In this connection, the National Roster of Scientific and Specialized Personnel has for some months been engaged in the collection of special information about men in certain fields who are registered both with the National Roster and with Selective Service. Under a cooperative plan the Roster, *in certain cases only*, transmits to the office of the National Headquarters of the Selective Service System in Washington, D.C., appropriate information about technically trained persons of military age, and that office in turn may send letters about these men to the State Directors of Selective Service and in turn to the Local Boards, to assist them in their problem of classification.

Also, whenever a man registered with the National Roster notifies the Roster that he is likely to be inducted into the Army, information is sent to the War Department indicating his educational training, occupational experience, and other pertinent data. This has been of practical use to the Army in assigning technically trained individuals.

#### FINDINGS OF THE COMMITTEE

**A**MONG the many findings of the Committee as a whole, two conclusions are of special significance: (1) The existing shortages in specialized personnel emphasize the necessity of securing as soon as possible information concerning women with professional training, for they represent the largest unutilized supply of specialized personnel in the nation. (2) The problem of the supply of and demand for technical and professional personnel is receiving too little attention; and a marked discrepancy between demand and supply in many professional fields is resulting in wasteful competitive bidding between the Army, the Navy, the public service, industry, education, and research.

# Improving the Civil Service Essay Test

NORMAN J. POWELL

LIBRARY  
C.P.D.

AT THE height of the objective testing movement, when a multitude of studies were being issued all of which united to indicate that the essay test was thoroughly objectionable, it appeared that the essay test, like the buffalo, was doomed to extinction. But the essay test has proved to be exceedingly robust and has not only refused to perish from the face of the earth but has, on the contrary, recently begun to be used more widely and to have increasing research attention focussed upon it. The newer approach is that of attempting to improve the essay test and to use it in those situations in which its usage is appropriate rather than to eliminate it altogether.

This paper will consider briefly the possible techniques for making the essay test maximally useful. Though geared especially to the problem of essay test rating, this paper will explore to a degree test construction aspects inasmuch as construction and rating are inextricably intertwined.

## ADVANTAGES AND DISADVANTAGES OF ESSAY TESTS

IT IS helpful first to examine the traditional defects and virtues of the essay test. Consideration of these factors will suggest techniques for improving both the construction and rating of essay examinations. Among the principal defects of the essay test in civil service are the following:

NORMAN J. POWELL is Director, Bureau of Classification and Research, of the New York City Civil Service Commission, and is Editor of the publication, *Public Personnel Quarterly*.

1. *Unsuitability for many jobs.* A rather high degree of verbal facility and language command is required in order to perform adequately in the essay test situation. In the case of many positions such facility is wholly unrelated to the job to be done. The clearest illustration lies in the trade areas. There is a vast distinction between soldering joints, for example, and writing an answer to some such question as "Describe briefly how a joint should be soldered." Manual dexterity would appear to be quite unrelated to verbal fluency and verbal fluency would appear to be a prime qualification for organizing and setting forth the response to the question, granted even that the candidate possesses the required information.

2. *A rather high grade of rater is required.* Inasmuch as no key can possibly enumerate all the combinations of acceptable and comparatively acceptable responses to free type questions, it becomes necessary for the rater to possess a sufficient breadth of information and judgment to appraise varying grades of responses. Further, in many instances it is difficult even to decide whether a particular phrasing in a candidate's response conveys a meaning identical with the different phrasings to be found in rating keys.

3. *Unreliability and subjectivity of rater.* There is a plethora of studies which find that independent ratings by equally competent examiners do not agree in their appraisals of particular responses. The importance of this fact lies in the apparent inevitability of the conclusion that a rating

which a particular candidate will receive is in very large part an accident—the accident of the personality who happens to be doing the rating.

4. *Poor sampling.* The number of questions included in essay tests is ordinarily severely limited so that few informational or judgmental areas are measured. The significance of this fact lies in the inference that candidates' scores are presumably in large part the accident of the particular questions selected. Assume that, in an examination consisting of four essay questions, a candidate does well in one and badly in three of the four. Assume further that the particular three questions which comprise the part on which the candidate's performance had been poor had been replaced by three altogether different questions, the different questions looking perhaps as acceptable as those actually utilized in the examination. The research findings indicate that the chances are by no means slight that the candidate might have performed much better on those different questions. This point is quite closely related to the one previously mentioned. Here we are concerned with what is usually called split-half reliability; in the preceding point we are concerned with the correlation between independent ratings. One is rater reliability, the other is test reliability.

5. *Injection of extraneous elements.* It has been found that factors other than those intended to be measured affect examiners' markings. Such subtle and irrelevant elements as handwriting, punctuation, and so on, may influence the examiner to a considerable extent.

6. *Slow rating.* It is evident, of course, that rating 100 examination papers, each of which consists of perhaps a dozen pages of manuscript, is a much slower and burdensome task than that of rating 100 examination papers which can be scored by means of a stencil and in which only the number of letters or numbers agreeing with the key need to be counted.

7. *Relative indefensibility of marks.* Judgment enters sizably in the determination of rating. And judgments differ. What is reasonable to A may be utterly fallacious to B. If A is the examiner and B is the candidate, there may flow from this conflict an impairment of the prestige value of the public service. Candidates are more likely to consider that they have been unfairly treated, and be grossly dissatisfied with their markings.

8. *Vagueness of instructions and questions.* This is apparently no necessary and inherent difficulty of the essay test. Certainly both questions and instructions may be vaguely phrased in objective tests as well. But the fact appears to be that the incidence of vagueness and ambiguity in essay tests is much greater than that found in objective tests. The causal factors presumably are of one or both of two types. Either it is intrinsically more difficult to estimate in advance a large variety of possible and undesired interpretations, or less attention is given in essay tests to this phase of the problem.

THE virtues of the essay test are qualitatively significant. They are summarized as follows:

1. *Effective measurement of complex abilities.* These complex abilities might include that of organizing and systematizing information in response to an intricate situation, the ability to reason well, to write well, to analyze a totality, to select and evaluate elements within the complete unit, and similar talents. The assumption here is that the objective test is a less efficient instrument for getting at such abilities. The point should be made that this is not necessarily true in all situations. In some jobs it is altogether possible to measure complex functions like reasoning by means of multiple choice tests. Even such an activity as the ability to write well, it is claimed, can be measured adequately by means of objective tests, though the technique that has been utilized for this

purpose might well be of questionable usefulness in public personnel administration.

2. *Economy of construction.* Essay tests are quickly constructed. Perhaps, too, less informational competency in the job is required. Obviously essay tests consume less paper so far as question booklets are concerned, and are more cheaply stenciled and mimeographed. To be sure, essay tests consume considerably more paper so far as candidates' responses are concerned.

3. *Examiner defects minimized.* This point is well illustrated by a conference recently held by representatives of a municipal civil service commission with the local police department in which police department officials complained that the multiple choice test allowed candidates no freedom of expression; that in many instances they were confronted with a group of objectionable options and were required to differentiate between microscopics and infinitesimals. The point was that candidates might have a vast amount of information and still not be able to demonstrate their capacity because of the limitations of the phrasing of the individual items. In essay tests, on the other hand, the candidate does have the opportunity to be free in interpretation and expression. Since rating keys and scales in essay tests are, to a degree, dependent on the nature of candidates' answers, bad guessing as to item difficulty and meaning on the part of the examiner is masked in that, unlike the rating of the objective test, the key can be adjusted to accommodate any deficiencies disclosed.

4. *Wide usefulness.* As test constructors well know, some kinds of material are practically impossible to put in objective item form. The item may be important and even informational, but what happens is that it is so difficult to construct plausible and correct options that the selection of the correct answer becomes a test of intelligence rather than of the other capacities, the measurement of which is sought.

#### IMPROVING ESSAY TESTS

**S**UGGESTIONS for improving essay test construction issue directly from the nature of the flaws and advantages of the essay test. It is to be noted that raising the quality of the test construction facilitates more satisfactory rating. The following suggestions may be made:

1. *The essay test should include a rather large number of questions.* Precisely what constitutes the minimum number cannot be stated with any assurance, but twenty questions is perhaps a not unreasonable guess. The New York City Civil Service Commission has collected some data which appear to document the hypothesis that split-half reliability may be greatly increased by increasing the number of question items. In a promotional test for Police Lieutenant given in November, 1939, there were included three parts, each of the parts consuming three and a half hours of testing time. One part consisted of four general essay questions; the second of twenty-five essay questions, and the third part of one hundred multiple choice questions. All covered roughly the same area of police administration, rules and regulations, and law. The reliability of the first, the long essay part, was .55. The reliabilities of the others were .91 and .89 respectively. The test was constructed by a group of persons, and the same group worked with each of the parts so that the abilities of the examiners is a constant factor here.

Manifestly, a reliability coefficient of .55 is wholly unacceptable, for it means that the precise rating given to any candidate is in very large measure an accident of the particular questions selected for inclusion in the examination. Had another group of four questions apparently comparable to those actually used comprised the test, many of those who failed the actual test would probably have received high marks in the hypothetical test not given, and many of those who actually received high marks would have obtained low grades or failing grades

in the test which might well have been given. The conclusion is that a four-question test is grossly unfair to the candidate and constitutes an extremely defective instrument for appraising ability.

On the other hand this deficiency does not appear to be an inherent weakness of the essay test itself. It is inherent only in the essay test which consists of a small number of questions. When an examination samples more widely and consists of as many as twenty-five questions, though the total testing time here remains identical with that required for the four question tests, the reliability mounts to .91, a coefficient which is as good as that ordinarily achieved by the best objective instruments. The coefficient of .91 obtained in this case is comparable with coefficients which have been obtained on many question essay tests given for other positions. For example, in a promotion test for captain in the Department of Correction a forty-item essay test yielded a reliability of .93. Another forty-item open competitive test for Superintendent of Industries yielded a reliability of .92.

The objection may be made that the essay test containing only a small number of questions samples quite as effectively as the essay test with the larger number of questions. The difference, it may be contended, lies in the character of the sample which is taken. In a four item test the sampling is intensive. All the information within quite narrow areas is investigated while, in the twenty-five item test, some of the information in virtually all the areas is investigated. The argument might conclude that there is no evidence to show that extensive sampling is superior to intensive sampling so far as their relative merits are concerned in selecting persons well equipped informationally to do a particular job. Yet the fact denies the hypothesis. Where the number of questions is extremely limited, reliability is limited as well.<sup>1</sup>

**2. Essay examinations should be tried out on experimental populations in the same manner that objective tests are tried out and for precisely the same reasons.** As generally agreed, it is desirable that instructions and examination questions be explicit, detailed, and definitive. This attribute is the same as that desired in objective tests and is secured by the use of two general methods. The first is that of consciously setting out to accomplish this purpose and attempting to think out possible interpretations other than those sought. Yet it remains a truism that the person preparing a set of essay test questions will be biased in the direction of the interpretation which he is seeking, and that he may be purblind to other equally reasonable ways of reading the question. This difficulty may be surmounted to some degree by administering the test to persons who might be considered as nearly typical of the examinees as is possible to obtain. Administration should be under conditions resembling actuality as closely as possible. It is useful, following such a trial administration to inquire of the test subjects about their general reaction to the test and about specific interpretations with which they were concerned in responding to the test situation. The bulk of the evidence will, of course, be derived from the examination of the tryout candidates' replies to the questions.

**3. The matter of testing time should be specifically considered.** The customary defect in setting time limits for essay tests is to provide inadequate time in which candidates may reply satisfactorily or feel that they have been given the opportunity to demonstrate their competence. This has been especially true in cases where questions have

is of less significance than the all-important factor, validity. The answer lies in the fact that there is no means available for estimating validity, so that no external validation criterion is available for use here. Reliability is readily measured and has been measured here. Focal in the evaluation of the elements in the situation must be the fact that an unreliable test cannot be valid; that is to say, awareness of reliability values is negatively useful. Though split-half reliability does not insure validity it is known that there can be no validity if there is low split-half reliability.

<sup>1</sup> It may be remarked that the discussion of this question has centered about reliability, a test attribute which

been few and considerable time in terms of absolute units has been provided. Though an hour per question may be allowed, the question may be so large that an hour of effort makes but a slight dent in the problem. The difficulty may be circumvented in two ways—first by recognizing the problem and setting, tentatively, time limits which appear to be ample. A second method is that of obtaining relevant evidence from the experimental tryout of the questions concerning the adequacy of time limits.

4. *Questions and instructions should be adjusted to the level of the candidate.* It is ridiculous, for example, to use big words and complex sentence structure in writing questions for trade jobs. It must be remembered that what is being sought in some kinds of jobs is a measure of information and not the ability to comprehend complex language.

5. *The unique values of the essay test should be localized and exploited.* For example, the essay test is a superior instrument for the measurement of organizing ability and the objective test is especially well adapted to getting at detailed information. It is improper, in general, to set up an essay test which requires detailed information in lieu of the ability to organize.

6. *It is very helpful to sprinkle the examination with the title of the job for which the test is being given.* Usage of this type tends to make the examination appear to be more practical and more closely allied to the duties actually to be performed in the position to be filled.

#### RATING THE ESSAY TEST

THE first step in the rating process is that of preparing the key. Perhaps the most logical point for doing this is at the time when the test questions are written. With each question there should be prepared both a model response and some indication of the scale on which answers are to be evaluated. The advantages of this procedure are two-

fold. On the one hand, it will help improve the questions in that it will be more or less readily discernible that some questions do not have ratable responses. In addition, such early key preparation helps to make the final key a more adequate measuring instrument.

In key preparation, of course, all available sources should be investigated. These may include recourse to the literature and the consultation of experts. Where citations to published references are possible, it is well for the examiner to indicate the exact source of the material at the time he writes both the question and the tentative answer.

Up to this point what we have is a somewhat unreal key, for it may be found that none of the candidates approach either the form or content of the key. To make the key more realistic, it is necessary to sample candidates' answers. Assume that a twenty-question examination with a tentative key that has been set up without any reference to what the candidates have said. The next step is to go through the candidates' papers horizontally, question by question, in order to add items to the key or to strengthen the basis for the specific values to be awarded to specific responses. At this point in the development of the key, great emphasis must be laid on the search for interpretations of questions which, though differing from those originally intended, may, nevertheless, be satisfactory.

The term, "scaling," previously mentioned, means the fixing of the numerical values to be accorded to answers of specified degrees of merit. It is the purpose of the scale to answer questions concerning the type of response that is to be given one or another marks. The problems involved are two. First, there must be a determination of the number of points to be used on the scale. Are values only, for example, of zero, 1, 2 or 3 to be used, or are ratings ranging continuously between zero and 100 to be used? The second problem is that involving the manner in which the points on the scale are to be defined.

#### TYPES OF RATING KEYS

**I**N GENERAL, the key may assume variants of any of five forms. A model answer may be set up and each candidate's response compared with this model. In this case only one point, perfection, is explicitly defined. It is necessary, then, to describe in some terms the technique of making deductions from perfect scores. It might be indicated, for instance, that qualitative deficiencies of a specific character will invoke penalties of 10 per cent, 15 per cent, or some other penalty. Quantitative flaws will be handled in the same way.

A second general method for developing the key is to write out explicitly answers that represent several degrees of merit. For example, an answer warranting a grade of 100 per cent may be formulated; another typical answer warranting a mark of 75 per cent may be written out; and a third answer carrying with it a failing mark may be set forth. The examiner then compares each candidate's answer with this key making judgments as to whether the answer falls at a particular point on the scale, or at what intermediate point the answer lies. It must be noted that such scaled answers are theoretically possible but that in practice the nature of answers varies widely and that the procedure is extremely time-consuming so far as the preparation of the material is concerned. It may be expected, however, that the speed and adequacy of rating will be increased. Both this procedure and that of setting up only a model answer place a considerable burden on the judgment of the examiner. Both assume high grade examiners who are familiar with the content of the examination.

A more objective method is to fix the number of ideas or items to receive varying amounts of credit. For example, it may be indicated that four worthwhile ideas in an answer will receive "A" per cent, six worthwhile ideas will receive "B" per cent, and so on. Though this technique makes for objectivity, it makes also for a loss of what may be presumed to be the major value of the

essay test. Scoring of this nature tends to make the essay examination a bad completion test rather than an essay test. What is being sought for measurement are, perhaps, the ability to write effectively, to think well, and so on.

Loss of validity at the cost of increased objectivity may be diminished in part by supplementing quantitative ratings on the basis of number of ideas or other units by qualitative considerations. There may be provision, perhaps, for adding to or subtracting from the total score arrived at through the use of the straight counting procedure, points assigned for the quality of organization or the discussion of the ideas, etc. For example, assume that, by counting the number of acceptable items in an answer it is found that the rating should be "A." Nevertheless, the organization of the response is distinctly superior. A credit of "P" may be added to the initial "A" so that the applicant's final mark is "A + P." Possibly four levels of quality of organization are capable of differentiation. The top may be credited "P," the bottom "S" and the two middle levels "Q" and "R." In this illustration, "A," "P," "Q," "R," and "S" refer to whatever percentage marks or other numerical ratings are judged to be appropriate.

Finally, the key may consist of a weighted enumeration of the elements to be rated. These elements are isolated at the beginning and may consist of content, form, or more specifically of content type A, content type B, form species 1, form species 2, etc. Then a scale is set up for each element. The scale may be established on the basis of any of the procedures already described. Because of the well known halo effect in rating, it is desirable to read answers for single elements or small groups of elements at one time.

What appears to be the optimum form of rating key may be established on the basis of the available research evidence. Assuming that there are 25 questions in the test, each question should be marked separately. The number of types of credit should be severely limited. Four qualities of response are per-

haps as many as an examiner can distinguish and, by and large, are as many as he needs to distinguish. The argument in support of having few steps on the rating scale is that examiners disagree widely when they mark on fine bases. That a fine scale is unnecessary arises from the fact that a large number of questions is used. In the multiple choice test, for instance, each response receives either full credit or no credit. This procedure is valid because the large number of items makes it possible to appraise candidates reasonably well when scores on the single items are summed to yield final scores. Similarly, in the scoring of essay tests on a four-step scale the evaluation of answers to single questions is coarse, but the ultimate measure comprised in the final score is not at all coarse.

The rating key, then, may consist only of model answers for individual questions with the addition that general guides may be indicated for the quality of response meriting ratings of 0, 1, and 2. Marks of 3 are, of course, defined by the model answer. In determining percentage equivalents for numerical scores, the examiner will consider the number of vacancies likely to occur during the life of an eligible list, the recruiting effort that has been made, and the character of the job to be filled in relation to the apparent calibre of the applicants.

One of the weaknesses to which key answers are liable is that the key answer may be more or less unique to the examiner and reflect his subjective notions. It is quite possible, for example, that had the key been prepared by Jones and not Smith, quite different keys would have resulted and, therefore, different scales applied to the same answers so that different scores would be obtained. This difficulty may be minimized by having all keys reviewed by persons other than those responsible for the immediate key preparation. Review should be of all the elements in the key, the correctness of the "right" answers, the values for degrees of wrong answers, and all other material in the rating keys and scales.

Here, a suggestion may be made. Why not publish tentative keys for essay questions and handle appeals from tentative keys in the same manner as tentative key answers for objective tests? The experience of the New York City Civil Service Commission makes quite clear that even where highly competent persons work most carefully with the narrow units of data comprising the individual items in objective tests that, not infrequently, they err. The average rate of change in tentative keys is 5 per cent of the items included in the test. Certainly key preparation for essay items is substantially more difficult and much more liable to serious errors on the part of the examiner. There is not the faintest question but that such publication would improve markedly the quality of the keys and, as a result, the quality of the rating. The sole problem which emerges is that of the time and personnel required to handle such appeals and the practical possibility of administration. Yet an effective examination system forms the very heart of proper civil service administration. The necessity for both justice to the applicant and the maintenance of the quality of the competitive examination process is recognized by a commission which, acknowledging that objective test answers prepared by examiners may be wrong, accordingly sets up a procedure whereby appeals by candidates on tentative key answers are considered prior to the adoption of the final key. Such an action is altogether praiseworthy. But the action is insufficiently thorough. The subjectivity of determination of key answers in the essay test is even greater than that in the objective test.

#### THE RATING PROCESS

**C**ONCERNING the process of rating it self, the first point is that there should be at least two examiners rating independently. Independently, it must be emphasized, refers to markings without consultation prior to the recording of scores for specific candidates. In order to be sure that the independent examiners are utilizing compa-

not  
ions  
wers  
the  
ision  
oughly  
with  
the  
in  
t in  
e of  
the  
key  
cially  
e to  
ner.  
that  
eddy  
the  
lelm  
per-  
and  
ion.  
orms  
min-  
e to  
the  
proc-  
ach,  
wers  
, ac-  
ap-  
wers  
the  
aise-  
hor-  
n of  
ater

able standards and values, it is wise that there be periodic comparison and that a record be kept of unadjusted scores. Running analyses may disclose trends toward remediable types of discrepancies, biases and the like. It may be wise even to have an occasional spot check by a person not assigned immediately to the rating job in order to be sure that both raters are not veering from the original course.

The points in time at which there should be comparison and adjustment cannot be defined explicitly. Where there are fifty candidates adjustments may be made after the first five candidates, the second five candidates, the next ten, and then perhaps if it is indicated, not again until the rating has been completed. The determining factors will be the total number of papers to be rated and the degree to which the unadjusted scores, that is to say, the standards, of the two examiners agree. The size of the admissible discrepancy between the independ-

ent raters will depend on the number of points on the rating scale and the number of questions. The number of points on the scale will itself be determined in a measure by the number of questions in the test. Where discrepancies of inadmissible magnitude occur there must in all cases be re-rating of candidates' answers in order to clarify the causes and so formulate a basis upon which there can be closer agreement of issues.

**T**HE point of view in this paper has been that essay tests are extremely useful devices if properly used. Proper use must be defined in terms both of construction and rating. If the important safeguards are taken, it may be validly assumed that the essay test is both as reliable and as valid as the objective test, yet it must be emphasized without proper precautions the use of the essay test is quite as haphazard a selection technique as flipping coins.

# Exhibits as a Medium for Public Reporting and Positive Recruiting

BARBARA L. BRATTIN

LIBRARY  
C.P.D.

**F**EW civil service agencies in the country have completely effective programs for reporting their activities to the general public. Nor is any civil service agency as successful in its positive recruiting efforts as it might be. The Michigan State Civil Service Department does not claim that it is more successful than are other agencies in carrying on these activities; however, it is eager to try new methods to improve the job it is doing. Toward this end the Research and Training Division of the department conducted an experiment in the use of a pictorial exhibit at the 1941 Michigan State Fair in Detroit. In the following pages the results of that effort have been set forth in some detail in order that other agencies may profit from Michigan's experience.

It had long been known that the reporting activities of the Department were failing to obtain adequate coverage. It was not expected that many people in the state would have much of an idea about the policies and procedures of the department. Nor was it expected that many of them would be vitally interested in civil service or its problems. Yet, despite the fact that the people of the state had recently voted to place the basic principles of civil service in the state constitution, it was a startling revelation to discover how completely uninformed most of the public was about the issue on which it had voted less than a year before.

The fact that so many people had been

BARBARA L. BRATTIN is a staff member of the Research and Training Division, Michigan State Civil Service Department.

completely missed by any kind of a reporting device helped to determine the objectives set by the Department in planning the exhibit. These objectives were twofold: (1) to report to the public the activities undertaken by the agency, its aims and policies, and some of the results it has achieved in the four years during which the merit system has been in effect in Michigan; and (2) to recruit qualified personnel for the state service by emphasizing its career possibilities. It was hoped that these objectives would be realized by the use of the exhibit, not only at the fair in Detroit, but also later at civic group meetings such as the League of Women Voters, the American Association of University Women, the Rotary Club, and at county fairs throughout the state.

## STRUCTURE AND ARRANGEMENT OF EXHIBIT

**T**HE exhibit was completed within two weeks of the time the plan was conceived. The exhibit booth, roughly "U" shaped, was built to occupy a space approximately twenty feet wide and fifteen feet in depth. The walls of the booth were made of masonite fastened to a strong wooden frame. This frame was hinged at four places so that, for transportation purposes, the walls could be folded up to occupy a compact space. The masonite panels formed the rear wall of the exhibit, and two similar wing panels, projecting at an angle from the rear wall, formed the rear part of the two sides. The fore-part of the side walls consisted of blue velvet draperies. The floor was carpeted to the walls in dark red. Three comfortable

chrome chairs were placed in the front section of the exhibit in order that people who were walking by might stop and rest for a minute if they wished. Needless to say, many of them did. Two desks and chairs in the same modern style were placed at the back corners to be occupied by members of the civil service staff, who served as combination information clerks and public relations representatives.

On a table in the center of the floor space were provided public announcements of examinations which were current at the time. These copies were placed on the table, not for distribution, but for the information of those interested people who visited the booth. Also available was a list of the examinations which were tentatively scheduled before the first of the year, so that questions on current and near-future examinations might be readily answered. A specification book, giving job descriptions, salaries, and minimum entrance requirements for all positions in the state service, was available for the use of the representatives of the Civil Service Department in answering specific questions asked by people who came into the booth. Sample application blanks were also provided so that those who cared to might actually file an application on the spot for a current examination.

THE opportunities for careers in the state civil service claimed most emphasis in the pictorial portion of the exhibit. This theme was expressed in bold letters across the top of the back drop, "YOUR STATE CIVIL SERVICE OFFERS CAREERS IN . . ." The completion of this sentence was found in a simplified organization chart which covered the remainder of the back drop in the form of a list of all state departments, boards and commissions, with the exception of those smaller ones employing very few civil service employees. The agencies were arranged in three groups. Across the top of the chart, immediately under the box labeled "Executive Office," appeared the names of the agencies whose chiefs are elected by the people, such

as the Department of Public Instruction and the State Highway Department. Next came the larger state departments, those employing a large number of civil service employees, such as the Liquor Control Commission, the Unemployment Compensation Commission, and the State Department of Social Welfare. Last were the smaller departments and examining boards, such as the Planning Commission and the Board of Examiners of Barbers.

Covering the two masonite side panels were two large identical maps of the State of Michigan, showing each of the state institutions which comes under the jurisdiction of the state civil service. These maps, in conjunction with the organization chart, gave a graphic picture of the geographical and jurisdictional extent of civil service throughout the State.

The fact that the art work on the display was done by a professional "graphic presentation designer" raised the entire exhibit above the amateur level and gave it a professional appearance well worth the slight additional expense. It was far removed from either the blatant confusion or the uninteresting fact-stating which is so often the essence of an amateur educational exhibit. Most observers felt that the display was interesting, well-designed and well-executed.

An "action" feature was given to the exhibit, adding interest value, through a series of slides portraying different state jobs. These were shown by means of slide-film equipment located behind the exhibit booth and projecting onto a translucent screen in the center of the back wall. The slides explained the duties of a selected list of positions, gave their entrance salaries, and outlined possibilities for promotion. Following each written description of a position was a picture or group of pictures showing state employees actually working on the job. The positions covered in this presentation were chosen for several reasons. Some were selected because of their appeal to the general public, their power to draw people in to see the exhibit. Others were picked for their

variety—some inside jobs and some outside, some for women and some for men, some for technically trained people and some for those with little or no training. The film worked continually, shifting from description, to picture, to another description.

#### DRAWING POWER OF EXHIBIT

**S**INCE the objectives of this experiment were dual—reporting and recruiting—the results of the effort should be measured in the same terms. For this purpose an attempt was made to determine the total number of persons who observed the display long enough to carry a definite impression away with them, and also the number of persons interviewed concerning job opportunities.

The accomplishment of the second objective, the recruitment of qualified personnel, was directly related to the reporting objective. Obviously, the better the reporting job was done, the easier would be the task of recruiting for the state service. The *modus operandi* developed to accomplish this second task involved the maintenance of a card file of all those persons who indicated an interest in gaining a position with the state. Each person who came in to the exhibit and asked questions about a particular kind of work or indicated an interest in one, was asked to sign his name, address and occupational interest on one of the cards. This card file was brought back to the central office of the Department, and a procedure was set in motion for mailing an examination announcement and application blank to each person who had indicated such an interest.

A sample tabulation kept for an average day at the fair, multiplied by the number of days, revealed that approximately 2000 people came into the booth to talk about civil service positions. (This group included 500 who actually filed cards.) The count made of the number who stood in the outer aisle, read the heading, looked at the pictures, perhaps read an announcement or two and then moved on, indicates that number to have been ten times that large. This brings the

total number of people who saw the exhibit, however slightly, to about twenty thousand.

#### RESULTS ACHIEVED

**T**HE simple statement of these figures means very little since there is no way of knowing how much the 20,000 assimilated, or how many of the 500 who showed real interest will ever actually be appointed to civil service positions. However, this much is certain: twenty thousand people were "exposed" to information on civil service, and five hundred indicated interest in civil service positions. These are both obviously inconclusive statements, and the skeptic might well say that, if the only results obtained by the exhibit are those shown in these figures, such reporting is a waste of time and money.

Such a view is, however, a very short-sighted one. It does not take into consideration the fact that, by reason of the utter lack of knowledge and appreciation of the Michigan state merit system program by a great percentage of the citizenry, anything which focuses attention on its activities in as satisfactory a light as an exhibit of this kind is worth a great deal to the agency. Experience in Michigan has shown the worth of a well-informed citizens group, for such a group was in great part responsible for the passage of the first civil service act. Later, when this group relaxed its vigilance somewhat, the act was emasculated. Still later, when it was decided to present a civil service constitutional amendment to the vote of the people, it was necessary to re-educate them, even to achieve the bare margin by which the amendment passed. Even with the present amendment incorporated in the constitution, future efforts toward crippling the program are not beyond the realm of possibility. It is imperative, now as always, that the citizenry of the state be kept well informed on the status of civil service. This is not true of Michigan alone, for very few agencies elsewhere in the country are satisfied with their present status or appropriation, or the appreciation and understanding they receive.

An informed and militant group of citizens might be one answer to their problems.

**I**N ADDITION to the concrete results already mentioned, there were others less tangible although equally important. In Michigan there have been three different and distinct eras of civil service administration within the last five years. Incumbent employees have been required to take qualifying examinations under one law and competitive examinations under another. They have been classified, then unclassified, and finally classified again. There have been three separate sets of rules and regulations. All of these changes have had their effect upon the morale of the rank and file. As change followed change, state employees have become more and more confused, more convinced that they were being unfairly treated, more certain that the merit system administration was incompetent.

With such a situation as background, it is evident that there was a fertile field for public relations work among the state's own employees. The members of the Civil Service Department staff who worked in the exhibit were able to answer many questions about policies and procedures followed by the agency, questions about possible transfers, about salary increases, promotions, maintenance, and allocations. The all-important current questions about incumbents of positions placed in the classified service by the constitutional amendment were answered over and over again. Many accumulated misunderstandings and grievances that had never previously been explained were cleared away. A definite beginning was made toward acquiring the valuable support of the present employees, support which the agency has lacked since its inception in January, 1938.

From the general public came many special requests. There was the high school commercial teacher who wanted public announcements of clerical positions for her pupils; the school principals and superintendents interested in civil service as voca-

tional opportunities for their students; college students interested in government as it concerned their courses; and all the different types of job seekers. This last group was composed of people with many different levels of ability and interest, from the youth just out of high school who had not yet decided what he would like to do to earn a living, to the trained public health scientist who had recently moved to Michigan and wanted to take an examination to obtain a state job.

Of interest were the psychological aspects of the exhibit and their effects upon the audience. The use of color, of movement in the slides, of pictorial rather than written material, and of comfortable chairs for the weary, all served to attract the interest of passers-by. The importance of movement and of the pictorial material were clearly demonstrated when the projection equipment was purposely shut off for half of one day. The number of people who came in to ask questions that half-day was noticeably smaller, although the other attractions remained the same. Other evidence supporting the importance of these factors was the fact that more inquiries were made about jobs for conservation officers, fingerprint clerks, agriculture inspectors and other positions pictured and described on the screen than for many other larger classes which were not pictured.

#### GENERAL CONCLUSIONS

**A**NALYSIS of the results listed indicates several general conclusions which may be drawn. First, the job of positive recruiting was not accomplished as satisfactorily as it might have been if it had been more carefully planned. Some of the opportunities presented by the exhibit went undiscovered until too late. For example, the list of examinations tentatively scheduled for the next few months should have been analyzed in advance by a member of the Recruiting Division staff in order to single out those which, on the basis of previous experience, were likely to present definite recruiting problems. Sections of the pictorial dis-

play could then have been built around those classes of positions, rather than on the basis of a heterogeneous selection of positions chosen for their variety, their appeal, or the availability of good pictures. If it had been found difficult to recruit dietitians, slides showing dietitians at work and a description of their duties, together with salary and promotional possibilities, might have been shown on the screen. Particular attention might have been given to those who entered the exhibit booth to inquire about a position in that class. Such persons might also have been able to suggest other qualified dietitians, agencies, or recognized authorities in the field who might make further valuable suggestions for the recruitment of fellow-members of their profession. In short, if exhibits are to become a regular means of recruiting employees, the recruitment effort must be pointed in specific directions.

Another finding, particularly applicable to the classes of work being given special attention because they present a recruiting problem, is the importance of preparing printed material in brochure form for interested people to take home with them. No material was prepared by the agency for distribution and the lack of it was definitely felt. It would probably be advisable in a similar case to prepare either a small amount of printed material on specific classes of work, or an amount sufficient for everyone on a more generally applicable phase of the program. It is believed that this type of sales program is necessary, even under normal circumstances. During the war years which lie ahead, activities of this sort may become imperative. Faced with the problem of reaching entirely new portions of the labor market, many agencies will be obliged to employ techniques such as these if they are to compete satisfactorily for employees.

One significant conclusion concerns the necessity for the careful selection of the persons assigned to dispense information at the exhibit. Ideally, such persons should be personnel technicians who are naturally adept at, or carefully trained in, public relations.

The person who is an incorrigible technician may be able to give the correct answers, but he all too often may win his point at the expense of the other person's understanding of, or interest in, the merit system program. On the other hand, a person skilled only in public relations, but unversed in the methods and procedures of the personnel agency, must plead ignorance when called upon to answer any but the most general questions. There is little to choose between the unfavorable public reaction to a pedantic response and an evasive one, and either may well nullify whatever positive public relations might otherwise have been achieved.

**I**N GENERAL, the results of the experiment have convinced the Department of the wisdom of establishing an exhibition program upon a permanent basis. The first step is the permanent addition to the agency's staff of a person capable of planning and drawing up new forms of exhibits and other forms of publicity, maintaining them, arranging for their transportation, serving as public relations man for the department during exhibitions, and writing news releases and radio scripts when necessary. Some of the future projects outlined for this staff member include the making and showing of exhibits in bus stations, in busses and street cars, on state automobile ferries, and at many conventions and group meetings throughout the State.

When the program is completed, it is expected that many thousands of Michigan citizens will have learned that they do have a state civil service agency—one that is working to help bring about better service from better satisfied workers at less cost. Many of them will have learned the primary aims of the agency and will be informed of their implementation and the efficacy of their results. It is hoped that, in years to come, the informed people of the state will constructively criticize the work of the agency, will work effectively for reforms when such action is necessary, and will champion civil service when it needs their support.

# The Use of Open Eligible Registers in Public Personnel Selection

LITERARY  
CPO

RALPH MUELLER AND GEORGE A. WARREN

Maintaining employment registers with an adequate supply of qualified eligibles to fill positions in the services over which public personnel agencies have jurisdiction has, in the past year, presented problems which call for a reexamination and analysis of recruiting procedures. A general falling off of applicant response at all stages of the recruiting process has been characteristic. This has been especially true in the case of examinations for positions in the technical and professional fields. Increased opportunities in private employment and service in the armed forces of the country, occasioned by the war, have taxed the available sources of applicants. Coupled with this has been the expansion of services by public agencies which usually follows increased activity in private fields. In general, public personnel agencies today have more positions to fill and, at the same time, there are relatively fewer applicants.

The methods employed to meet this situation have varied. Most characteristic has been the scheduling of examinations at more frequent intervals. This practice in itself, however, has not produced adequate results. More attention has been devoted to methods of attracting desirable applicants to examination. This includes procedures used in announcing and advertising examinations and methods designed to reduce the

time taken in the whole recruiting procedure. Residence restrictions have been removed by many agencies for certain types of positions. Examination standards have been lowered where possible. Attempts have been made to "deskill" operations, so that less skilled workers might be recruited.

## THE OPEN REGISTER AS AN AID IN RECRUITING

Among the procedures which have been employed to meet the present situation is the open register. Essentially, an open register may be defined as an employment register established for a particular class of position, and to which additional qualified eligibles can be added from time to time. This differs in many respects from the traditional closed register which is required by law or by rule in most public personnel agencies. For example, there is no prescribed period during which applications must be filed. Instead, applications may be filed at any time during the period the open register is in effect. All candidates who are subsequently successful will not necessarily have been placed on the register by passing exactly the same examination, as in the case of the closed register. The eligible's position on the open register is not only affected by the number of placements made from those above him on the list but also by any better qualified applicant who may be placed above him at a later date.

Other differences between the two types of registers, as well as a comparison between the open register procedure and the more

RALPH MUELLER is Senior Personnel Examiner on the staff of the Detroit City Civil Service Commission.

GEORGE A. WARREN is Junior Personnel Examiner on the staff of the Detroit City Civil Service Commission.

traditional form will be treated more specifically in the discussion which follows. It will be apparent in the course of this discussion that most of the improvements in recruiting techniques suggested for use in conjunction with the open register will have almost equal value when used with the closed register. As an illustration, the development of informative and attractive examination announcements is based upon principles which apply with equal importance, regardless of whether it is intended to attract applicants to a closed register or to an open register.

#### IMPORTANCE OF ADEQUATE PUBLICITY

**N**EWSPAPER advertising has long been employed as a method of announcing examinations. The customary practice is to place advertising in the classified sections of the major daily newspapers of the jurisdiction, describing the position, its salary, the approximate number of vacancies, and place where applications may be obtained at the time the application filing period begins. At times, additional advertising of the examination may be inserted during the filing period of examinations, in order to stimulate applicant response.

The adapting of this phase of the recruiting procedure to conform with additional factors which are involved in administering the open register should not require any basic changes in the method of its use. Some attempt should be made to describe the positions involved more adequately, in the sense that the more attractive aspects of the position be highlighted, and to use the more common titles by which the position is known when these differ from the classification title. It must be recognized that this will increase the length of the advertisement, which, coupled with the inevitable increase in the number of advertisements run, will substantially add to the cost of this portion of the recruiting process.

It is necessary to place such advertising on a continuous basis, in order to obtain the benefits of using the open register in recruit-

ing. In some instances it may be advisable to institute the use of foreign-language advertising, or to increase its scope if this method has already been utilized. Another advertising medium which may produce desirable results is that which appears in street cars and busses. This space may either be furnished to the personnel agency gratis or purchased by it in regular fashion.

General news releases, too, have their part in assisting to obtain qualified applicants. Here, as in the case of other means of information, the value of such releases may be greatly diminished by a misinterpretation of their content by unqualified individuals seeking positions which may not concurrently be open. Such a result, from the public relations standpoint, is quite undesirable and at times may counterbalance any positive results obtained through such publicity.

The results obtained from the use of these types of advertising may be measured by the increase in the amount of personal inquiry and correspondence they arouse from qualified applicants.

It should not be assumed that the increase in the scope and type of advertising that comes with the institution of the open register is an integral factor of the technique. The use of the one does not *per se* predicate the necessity of the use of the other. The fact that wider advertising is associated with the use of open registers is probably due to the fact that most public personnel agencies which have been faced with the problem of diminishing personnel returns have paralleled the inauguration of the open register with an increase of the other means of attracting qualified applicants and have simply considered the open register as another means of accomplishing this end.

**T**HE usual examination announcement consists of a mimeographed or multi-lithed sheet, which carries the title of the position, examination date, last filing date, induction salary, number of vacancies, residence restrictions, subjects and weights of the examination, place where applications

may be obtained and further provisions concerning military leaves, and also may carry the complete specification for the position.

The experience gained in adapting the actual examination announcement for open register use indicates that a beneficial effect is secured by using the complete specification for the position, particularly for positions requiring a high type of physical condition.

The value of the examination announcement as used in any type of recruiting procedure must be considered in terms of its ability to attract the attention of qualified applicants, while at the same time furnishing a means of deterring those applicants who would be eliminated at some later step of the examination procedure. Utilization of the open register technique of recruiting does not presume the necessity for encouraging patently unqualified candidates to apply.

Copies of the examination announcements are usually mailed to labor organizations, fraternal groups, schools, other governmental departments, and similar sources of applicants, where they may be posted on bulletin boards and in other prominent places. For some positions, by making use of the mailing list of professional societies, college senior lists, and trade organization membership lists, announcements may be sent directly to individuals who might be interested in the position. A copy of the examination announcement should be enclosed in the general application issued to each applicant.

The distribution of examination announcements in coordination with the use of the open register calls mainly for an intensification of the effort to reach the attention of the qualified applicant. Past experience indicates that the response produced by mailing examination announcements directly to possible applicants has justified the added expense entailed. This has been particularly true in the securing of applicants for technical positions. How much further it is practical to follow this

procedure for other positions depends on the ability to direct the announcement to the attention of the applicant. The practice of sending the examination announcements to labor organizations and other societies, as described above, has had value only to the extent that the individuals receiving such announcements relay the information to their membership. Too often the announcements never leave the desk of the recipient, or they are posted on obscure bulletin boards where no one stops to read them.

#### USE OF "REQUEST CARDS"

THE rules of most personnel agencies definitely limit the period during which applications for examinations are issued and accepted. The method of handling interested applicants who appear or make inquiry concerning positions at times other than the prescribed filing period vary from agency to agency. In Detroit, a "request for notification card" file is maintained for use with the closed eligible register. A standard form of post card size has been adopted. The front of the card provides space for the name and address of the applicant, and the back of the card is used to list the position in which the applicant is interested. Persons who are interested in types of positions not currently scheduled for examination are given these cards, to be filled out and filed with the personnel agency. The cards are then stamped with the date on which they were made out and filed by position. When an examination for a position is announced, the cards in the file bearing titles of that class, and in some cases related titles, are mailed. The individual then comes in and makes formal application.

Adopting the open register obviates the use of such a procedure; but in the case of the closed register, the value of the request card procedure still merits its retention, both as a means of securing applicants and from a public relations standpoint. This is especially true in instances where the normal needs of the service make it necessary

that an examination for a particular type of position be given only once or twice in a period of two or three years. Under these circumstances, many applicants make inquiry concerning positions at times outside the prescribed filing period; in many instances these would-be applicants appear shortly after the filing period has been closed. So long as an agency maintains both types of registers, the use of the request card as a means of contacting qualified applicants for the taking of examinations should be maintained. It is possible that the benefits obtained by using these cards may be transferred to open register positions when recruitment on that basis is begun.

#### REVAMPING THE EXAMINATION PROCEDURES

**I**N ORDER to attract applicants and hold their interest today, it is necessary to use procedures which reduce the time between the filing of the application and placement on the job. In this way the recruiting procedure will approach the conditions which exist in private industry, with which the public personnel agency must compete on somewhat uneven terms at present. Analysis of examination statistics at various stages of the recruiting process indicates that a large percentage of the applicants who are initially attracted by the examination announcements have dropped out and are no longer interested in the position by the time the certification stage is reached. Thus, reduction in time is basic in the principle of the open register. Its use calls for a scheduling of examinations at frequent intervals, development of quick-scoring tests, and improved procedures for rating training, experience, and personal attributes of applicants.

The agency which adopts the open register as a means of recruiting qualified applicants must recognize and evaluate a number of the more important consequences that such action may have on the service. Whenever the amount of applicant response tends to decrease, and improved methods of at-

tracting qualified individuals fail to counteract this tendency, a natural tendency is to seek means for removing restrictions and lowering standards. The part of the recruiting process to which such steps are generally applied include the removal of residence restrictions, the broadening of age limits, and the lowering of medical standards, written test standards, and training and experience qualifications. Relaxation of such standards is usually gradual, since it must be considered in the light of the permanent effect it will have on the service.

Many jurisdictions require a year or more of residence for most positions before accepting applications from interested persons. This rule has occasionally been waived for those in the military service or formerly in such service. When an examination is announced for a position for which there are not enough qualified applicants who meet the residence requirements, the public personnel agency may be granted the authority to open the examination to non-resident citizens. A very limited type of extension of the residence restrictions may be found in the case where only residents of surrounding communities are admitted to the examination, in addition to local residents. Examinations for the higher grades in the technical and professional fields are usually open to the country at large.

As the scope of open register recruiting spreads to more types of examinations, the problem inherent in the procedure will increase. The local reaction to the waiving of residence restrictions will be a reluctant acceptance of "outside" personnel. Quite often, critics will not accept the plain fact that the jurisdiction does not contain a sufficient number of qualified persons who will accept the positions offered at the present time.<sup>1</sup> In connection with this, the agency may of necessity be forced to grant

<sup>1</sup> A question that concerns itself with the future of the service will arise if and when the present situation is reversed, and the lack of qualified residence applicants suddenly disappears. The surfeit of such applicants surging back to seek positions in the public service may well arouse a situation which will not be easy of solution.

preference to local residents on the eligible register, regardless of comparative ratings of non-residents.

At the present time, however, waiving of residence restrictions should prove to be of considerable value, especially in the recruiting for technical positions. The extent to which this practice should be followed can best be gauged by the agency which is faced with the problem of recruiting qualified personnel. The difficulty here involved is of a different nature from that connected with the relaxation of age and physical factors, as the type of applicant available may be perfectly suitable for the position, whereas the danger involved in the latter practice goes to the fundamentals of the recruitment process. The choice lies between the adoption of a measure which, while sound in itself, may arouse public criticism, and the adoption of measures which, although popular, may well bring about a deterioration of the service. If an agency does embark on a course of waiving residence restrictions quite generally, it is highly desirable to forestall criticism by informing the public fully concerning the considerations at stake.

The readjustment of age limits on various types of examinations is another point at which the recruiting problem may be attacked. While a broadening of age limits may occur without recourse to the open register, those factors which lead to the revision of the one also lead to the adoption of the other. It should be recognized that the indiscriminate easing of these requirements may reflect itself in the general fiscal structure of the local governmental unit, as well as in the physical makeup of its personnel. Inducting employees who are close to the age of retirement has a depressing effect on attempts to keep pension plans operating on an actuarial foundation. The quality of work of the employee grown old in the service may vary markedly from that of the inexperienced older person, and the comparison show up to the latter's detriment throughout the organizational structure of the unit.

#### RELAXATION OF MEDICAL STANDARDS

**M**EDICAL standards are usually interpreted as delineating the minimum requirements for a position. In a well-organized recruiting system, these are fitted to the various classes of positions in such a fashion that they operate as an automatic factor in obtaining a grade of applicant who has the physical potential to handle his assignment properly.

The open register does not primarily affect this portion of the examination procedure. The inevitable result of a scarcity of sufficient applicants through the regular channels is the gradual lowering of medical standards; this often begins with an increase in the range of the age limits, which is an indirect measure of physical ability in itself. Although the primary reason for the reduction of the standard may have been forgotten by the time the open register is adopted, the open register need not be considered as the reason for having lowered the medical standards.

The possibility of tapping a reservoir of applicants who were once rejected for various physical defects but who would be considered as eligible under a modified set of medical standards is one for which the open register is well adapted. Many applicants, once considered as unsuitable, can be placed on the eligible register immediately after being given a medical reexamination, without the necessity for taking another written test. The desirability of any candidate for a position is relative. If the applicant who was rejected on a previous examination is the physical equivalent of, or the superior of the successful candidate in a current examination, such a procedure is justifiable and may be considered as one of the more helpful aspects of the suitability of the open register as a means to relieve the situation.

Careful judgment must be exercised concerning the extent to which the agency should go in this direction. Certain positions require such a high physical standard that any appreciable lowering of the medical

standards is reflected in the type of personnel certified to the position. On other positions, requirements may have been set up on an exclusion basis, and a relaxation of such standards will not prove to be as significant.

A number of personnel agencies follow the practice of giving the physical examination before placing the eligible on the register. This is a practice which was consistent with conditions prevailing during the period in which the closed register was adequately furnishing personnel. For certain positions, a medical examination is often given prior to the acceptance of the application. In such instances the policy is usually one of rejecting the application if the applicant does not pass the preliminary physical examination.

Much of this procedure is not suited for use in connection with the open register, as all applicants are not examined during the same period of time. Another factor concerns the desirability of reducing the large numbers of applicants who fail to return for subsequent portions of the examination by giving them the written portion of the examination as early in the recruitment process as possible. The reason for this is that the applicant who takes and passes a written test may feel that he has obtained an equity in a place on the eligible register. The alternate procedure is to place successful applicants on the eligible register on a "physical examination when certified" basis. Experience will probably show that this procedure can also be beneficially applied to those examinations still conducted on a closed-register basis, insofar as keeping the interest of the applicant is concerned. In either event, it should be recognized that the actual physical condition of the candidate no longer carries any weight in the rating that places him on the eligible register.

#### WRITTEN TESTS

**W**RITTEN tests are generally used as part of the examination procedure for most classes of positions in the public service. To be effective, such tests must possess high reliability and validity. Certain factors in-

herent in the administration of written tests tend to reduce the reliability, even though they have a high reliability when properly controlled. Among such factors are the possible effects of practice and coaching, effects which cannot be overlooked if the same test is administered frequently in the same locality. Since the open register does not involve the simultaneous administration of the tests to all applicants, frequent administration of tests is characteristic of its use.

To meet this problem, it is necessary to develop a series of alternate forms of the test. The correlation of one alternate form with any of the other alternate forms of the test used must be positive and high, because different applicants will be ranked on the same employment register on the basis of any one of the alternate forms.<sup>2</sup> In those public personnel agencies where it is the practice to publish key answers for purposes of review before the final rating of the applicant is made, the use of the open register would require a new form for each administration of the examination.

In order to hold the applicant's interest, the usual delay between the time of application and placement must be eliminated as much as possible. This applies as well to the operating agency interested in obtaining employees. The time required to score the examination must be considered. Tests should be adapted for quick scoring if at all possible. The short-answer type of test items used by most public personnel agencies meet this requirement and are generally more reliable than the essay-type question.

#### RATING PROCEDURES

**T**HE techniques employed in rating applicants' training and experience from applications and questionnaires are essentially the same when the open register is used. In either case, definite standards should certainly be developed. It is probably true that most examiners will rate with

<sup>2</sup>Editor's Note: See the article, "Placing New Examinees on Open Eligible Registers," on pp. 133-37 of this issue.

greater reliability when rating a group of applicants at one time than when they are required to rate applicants at separated intervals of time. Whether or not the group as a whole is rated close to the passing point or at a point considerably above the passing point does not change the internal ranking on the list. As long as the relative rank of the individual eligible remains unchanged on the register, he gains or loses little. On a closed register, the individual eligible's rank is seldom, if ever, adversely affected. On the open register, however, it is a common occurrence for some of the original eligibles to find themselves with a lower rank on the register than the one originally assigned, due to the appearance of better qualified applicants at a subsequent date. If only for this reason, it is important that uniform rating standards be maintained throughout.

Much the same problem exists in the rating of the applicant's personal characteristics and general suitability for the position. Interview techniques, when employed to rate these factors, will be as difficult to resolve into equitable appraisals as is the case when the personnel agency is faced with the problem of rating widely scattered applicants by using several interviewing boards. When the open register is used, it is more than likely that the composition of the oral board will vary from time to time. The development of standard forms and instruction, as well as training of oral board members, will make appraisals of the personal attributes of the applicants more reliable.

#### REVISING CERTIFICATION PROCEDURES

In order to operate an open register, some personnel agencies may find it necessary to revise the mechanics of their certification procedures. The statutes and charter provisions under which they operate may not provide adequate authority to alter these procedures, and revisions in the basic law may be in order. The problems involved are different in the case of the agency which certifies the eligibles in strict register order,

rather than by the "rule of three." The question may arise as to how far the principle of dovetailing eligibles into their respective places on the register should be carried, insofar as the period of time which elapses between the placing of the first eligible on the register and the beginning of certification to the requisitioning departments.

The open register may also be used at times to build up a reserve of eligibles for an anticipated heavy demand. When this is done, it is often the case that a candidate who passes the examination and is assigned a number on such an eligible register finds that his position has been materially lowered by subsequent additions to the register. The solution to this situation may be found in a variation from the general practice of notifying each eligible of his standing. Possibly, the eligible's notice of examination results should contain only the percentage received on the examination, without any reference to position on the register, even though this be contrary to the previous procedure of most agencies.

#### CONCLUSION

IT MAY be concluded that the value of the open register procedure lies chiefly in the elimination of delay in getting the applicant on the employment register. In most personnel agencies operating under the closed register system, a prescribed filing period is required by law or rule before the examination is held. Such regulations often designate the time which must elapse from the first announcement of the examination to the date when the examination may be administered. The time delays occasioned where a series of examinations for the same class are held with the closed register rule in effect is evident. Any modification of the closed register rules to avoid such delays approaches the open register procedure. Another advantage of the open register closely related to the above is its value in holding the applicant's interest. Giving the applicant the opportunity to obtain the actual application and to be examined within a few

days will do much to accomplish this end.

The disadvantages of the open register arise from the inability of the agency employing this procedure to cope with the problems occasioned by its use. The lack of an adequate staff to prepare the alternate test forms required to offset coaching effects, undue delays in scoring examinations, and unsuitable rating procedures—these are all basic problems which must be solved.

Certain other problems will arise when standards, restrictions, and qualifications of applicants are changed during the period in

which the open register is in effect. When this occurs, it must be decided whether or not applicants who have been previously rejected, but who would be acceptable under the new standards, should be re-rated and be required to go through the entire examination process again.

In conclusion, it must be again pointed out that many of the improvements in recruiting procedures mentioned in the foregoing discussion may be applied to the closed register procedure, for they are not characteristic of the open register alone.

# Placing New Examinees on Open Eligible Registers

C. R. ADAMS AND C. H. SMELTZER

**B**Y WAY of introduction, it should be mentioned that the Employment Board of the Pennsylvania Department of Public Assistance functions as a civil service agency to recruit, examine, and certify eligible applicants for positions in the Department of Public Assistance. The Department has approximately seven thousand employees of whom over 98 per cent are under civil service. The personnel of the Employment Board, which has fluctuated from one hundred to over three hundred persons, must also have civil service status. From the inception of the program in 1937, the employees engaged in examining procedures were not permitted to take examinations because of their intimate contact with them. As time passed, however, it became increasingly necessary to bring all employees under civil service with the exception of special examiners which the law specifically exempted.

Although a few employees, especially those employed in 1939 and thereafter, had civil service status as a result of examinations taken prior to their employment, many of the initial personnel were still employed on a provisional basis. Since they were rendering ostensibly satisfactory service, it was deemed poor personnel practice to dis-

miss them when they had been constantly barred from taking examinations. Consequently there was the problem of examining those employees so that they could be compared with persons previously examined over the state and who now were on the respective registers from which all civil service appointments were being made.

The first problem consisted of bringing under civil service some seventy clerical and stenographic employees hired prior to the 1939 examinations. The Employment Board was opposed to blanketing in these employees. Neither did it desire to administer new state-wide open competitive examinations. This would have created the identical problems faced heretofore. It desired to utilize a procedure that would duplicate as far as possible the conditions of the 1939 examinations.<sup>1</sup>

**T**HIS immediate problem was overshadowed by a potential one of even greater importance. Due to the emergency expansion of governmental activities, the demand for operating personnel, such as stenographic, clerical, and even supervisory employees, was greater than existing eligible

C. R. ADAMS, formerly Director of Personnel for the Pennsylvania State Emergency Relief Administration, is Assistant Professor of Psychology at Pennsylvania State College.

C. H. SMELTZER is Acting Chairman of the Department of Psychology, Temple University, and is serving as Consultant to the Employment Board of the Pennsylvania Department of Public Assistance.

<sup>1</sup>The 1939 state-wide open competitive examinations consisted of two series: (1) a series covering six typing, stenographic, and secretarial levels or grades; (2) a series covering five levels or grades of clerical positions ranging from junior to principal clerk. Both series of examinations consisted of objective test items designed to test the various abilities needed in these positions. The typist-stenographer examination was also supplemented by performance tests which measured accuracy and speed of typing, and accuracy and speed of stenographic transcription.

lists could supply. These lists, already established, could be used until depleted; however, it was desirable to develop techniques that would make it possible to extend the usefulness of such lists by placing on them additional names selected by subsequent examinations. The problem of such "dovetailing" of two lists, recruited by separate, although similar examinations, presented certain technical difficulties that had to be resolved.

#### ELEMENTS OF PROBLEM

**B**ASICALLY the problem was to determine a procedure that would accomplish two things: (1) test the individuals with new, but comparable, test material; (2) utilize the results so that individuals taking the examination could be placed on the 1939 eligible lists at points comparable to the ranks they would have earned had they taken the 1939 examinations.

The major problem was even more complex. As the demand for eligible employees exceeded the supply, an increasing number of agencies have been adopting the "open" eligible register technique. Essentially this consists of the continual acceptance of applications for certain positions, especially those positions for which eligible lists are insufficient. When eligible lists are nearly exhausted, or when the volume of accepted applications justifies, another examination is held. The resulting eligibles are then "dove-tailed" or fitted into the existing register.

It can be seen that the procedures suggested for the solution of the immediate problem might point toward a practical solution to the major problem. Because of the possibility of test information getting into unauthorized hands through leaks, but more especially because of the practice increment gained by persons taking the same examination a second time, it seems wisest to develop one or more alternate forms of the original examination. However, some equating procedure must be developed if the results obtained from the second exami-

nation are to be treated so that persons found eligible by that examination are to be fitted into the existing list resulting from the original examination.

#### PROCEDURE FOLLOWED

**T**HE following procedure was set up to achieve the objectives outlined for the immediate problem.

1. New tests were to be constructed and administered by persons not regularly employed by the Employment Board.

2. These tests were to follow the pattern of the original tests but all test materials were to be new. For example, if 10 items in the original test dealt with punctuation, a proportionate number of items in the new test would deal with punctuation.

3. Both the original and new tests were to be administered to a control group of persons and through the use of the standard score technique the results of the two tests were to be equated with each other.

4. The same education and experience formulas used in evaluating applicants in 1939 were to be used with the clerical personnel of the Employment Board.

5. The original and new procedures were to be identical in every respect except for the substitution of new tests for the original tests.

6. The resulting final scores would be inserted in the proper civil service registers at the points earned by the examinees.

When the new tests for both series of examinations were constructed, both the original and new tests were administered to a control population made up of upperclassmen enrolled in secretarial, commercial and business curricula at the Pennsylvania State College and Temple University, and many persons holding stenographic or clerical positions. The tests were scored, using exactly the same scoring and weighting formulas used for the 1939 examinations. Distributions of test scores were made for each position and the means and standard deviations calculated. Each raw test score was then converted into a standard score.

This score was the quotient resulting from the division of the difference between any raw score and the mean score by the standard deviation. Thus a series of standard scores were produced for each distribution ranging from about  $+3$  to  $-3$ . Each person in the control group had a standard score on the original test and a standard score on the new test. Due to the fact that the two tests were composed of comparable material, there was a very close correspondence between the standard score earned on the original test and the standard score earned on the new test.

The accompanying table will clarify the procedure. Assume that the average or mean score of the control group on the original test is 90, and that the standard deviation of the group is 10. A person whose raw score is 110 has a standard score of  $2.00; \frac{(110-90)}{10}$ . A person whose raw score on the new test is 48 has a standard score of  $-1.50; \frac{(48-60)}{8}$ . Standard scores for intermediate raw scores are similarly determined.

TABLE SHOWING RAW TEST SCORES AND STANDARD SCORES ON ORIGINAL AND NEW TESTS

Raw Score on Original Test	Corresponding Standard Score	Raw Score on New Test	Corresponding Standard Score
120	3.00	84	3.00
110	2.00	76	2.00
100	1.00	68	1.00
90*	0.00	60**	0.00
80	-1.00	52	-1.00
70	-2.00	44	-2.00
60	-3.00	36	-3.00

\* Mean = 90; S. D. = 10

\*\* Mean = 60; S. D. = 8

Standard scores for each grade of position for both the original and new tests were calculated. A standard score of one test was taken as the equivalent of a standard score on a second test. For example, a standard score of 1.00 on the original test for stenographer was the equivalent of a standard score of 1.00 on the new test for the same position. If the raw score corresponding with a standard score of 1.00 on the original test was 100, and the raw score corresponding

with a standard score of 1.00 on the new test was 68, then a raw score of 68 on the new test could be converted into an equivalent raw score of 100 on the original test. If a raw score of 72 on the new test has a standard score of 1.50, and a standard score of 1.50 on the original test is equal to a raw score of 105, a person earning a raw score of 72 on the new test should have earned a raw score of 105 on the original test if he had taken it.

Conversion tables were constructed showing the raw score that should be earned on the original test when only the raw score earned on the new test was available. The new tests were then given to all eligible employees of the Employment Board. Their raw scores on the new test were thus converted through the use of the tables to equivalent scores on the original tests.

These raw scores were then combined with the scores obtained from evaluating the education and experience background of each person into final composite scores. As stated before, the evaluation of the education and experience background was done with the same formulas as used for the original state-wide examinations. After the final composite score was obtained for each person it was possible to insert each one into the distributions resulting from the state-wide examinations.<sup>2</sup> The placements within these distributions were scattered throughout the entire range.

AFTER the placement of each employee within the distribution the following procedures resulted: First, all those who failed to reach the critical or passing point established for the respective registers had to be released as soon as possible; second, those who placed above the point where appointments had already been made from the register were automatically appointed to the respective positions as probationary

<sup>2</sup>It should be pointed out that the employees of the Board were placed in the distributions originally made up for the state office registers only. The registers for the state office represent those with the highest scores throughout the state. Thus the employees were competing with a very select group.

civil service employees; third, those who placed above the passing point for the register but below the point from which appointments were being made were retained provisionally. Appointment of these persons is now being made as their rank is reached. Those who are on the register but perhaps so far down that their rank will not be reached for a considerable time are being released as rapidly as possible without impairing the work of the program.<sup>3</sup>

This general procedure and technique proved extremely successful both from the standpoint of letting the employees feel that they were being treated fairly and from the standpoint of scientific defensibility. After the employees of a commission are once under civil service the problem of allowing a few periodically to compete in examinations is not serious. However, to allow all those who are constructing, administering and scoring competitive examinations to be among the competitors presents serious problems no matter how many controls have been set up. Furthermore, it is poor personnel administration to give such a group experience and training and later release them. The technique described here may be of value to other agencies which have sprung up rapidly and now are faced with the same problem of bringing their own employees under civil service.

#### PROCEDURE USEFUL FOR OPEN REGISTERS

THIS procedure had solved the immediate problem. From the results so obtained it is possible to draw tentative conclusions as to its value in solving the major problem of extending eligible lists, so that qualified applicants resulting from subsequent examinations can be dove-tailed into existing lists. In this connection, the following considerations may be mentioned:

1. It is evident that most personnel agencies must adopt some form of "open"

\* Approximately twenty per cent of the employees failed to get on a register. About twenty per cent placed above the appointing place on the register and the remaining sixty per cent were scattered from this point down to the end of the register.

eligible register technique for the duration of the war.

2. Such a technique should not only preserve the existing eligible registers but also make it possible to extend their life by periodic subsequent examinations and the use of "dove-tailing".

3. It is desirable because of "leaks" and "repeaters" to develop alternate forms of the original examinations.

4. Through the use of the standard score technique described in detail, or through the even more refined method of correlation, resulting in a regression equation, raw scores on subsequent examinations can be converted into raw scores that the examinees should have earned had they taken the original test.

5. All other procedures of evaluation remaining equivalent or identical, final examination scores could be computed, so that resulting eligible persons could be fitted into existing lists.

6. This equating procedure is so flexible that it can be used in a variety of situations.

#### SUMMARY

EMPLOYEES hired prior to 1939 were not permitted to take the 1939 examinations because they had to assist in the administration of these examinations and the preparation of eligible lists. In order that they could have the opportunity of earning civil service status, new but comparable tests were constructed and administered to them. This created the problem of devising a method by which raw scores on the new tests could be converted to equivalent raw scores on the original tests.

Both the original and new tests were administered to a control group. Raw scores were converted into standard scores and, since the original and new tests were composed of comparable material, a standard score on the new test was taken as the equivalent of the same standard score on the original test.

Conversion tables were then constructed showing the raw scores on the original test

equivalent to the obtained raw scores on the new test. At this point the new tests were administered to all eligible employees in the civil service division. Following the administration and scoring, it was then possible to convert, through the use of the above tables, the attained raw scores on the new tests to the equivalent raw scores on the original tests. It should be remembered that the original tests were the ones administered on a state-wide basis about a year previous. Now the employees of the Employment Board have raw scores based on the original tests perhaps as objectively and scientifically determined as possible, even though they took an entirely new examination.

The remainder of the work including the scoring of education and experience, combining all scores, placing the employees in the already established registers at the proper place and setting the critical or passing points was a matter of technical routine exactly like the procedure originally followed.

This procedure proved so successful that it seemed a solution to the major problem of extending the life of existing eligible lists. Certain tentative conclusions are drawn which seem to make this technique particularly adaptable to agencies which have adopted the "open" eligible register technique.

# The Management Training Conference Plan

W. P. LEHMAN

LIBRARY  
C.P.D.

ALL administrators at one time or another have had to seek means, and sometimes special means, for insuring proper understanding and proper execution of a broad program. It is invariably necessary to take steps to insure that a common understanding of the management's objectives and procedure existed among the various strata of the organization and between parallel units in the organization.

The management training conference system is a means to this end. This system is in use in a number of organizations, but this discussion will be confined to its application in the United States Civil Service Commission,<sup>1</sup> and more especially in the Commission's Interdepartmental Placement Service.

The management training conference system is designed as an instrument for the improvement of organization performance. The system is based upon the essentially democratic principle that the greatest good will result to a group if each of its members understands the common objectives and is vested with the fullest responsibility consonant with order in the group. The plan

<sup>1</sup> More than two years ago, Commissioner Arthur S. Flemming called upon Mr. Lawrence A. Appley, then of Socony-Vacuum Oil Company and now Vice President of the Vick Chemical Company, to act as consultant and advisor in introducing the program into the United States Civil Service Commission. Mr. Appley's successful application of the method in the oil company had brought him to the forefront of the industrial personnel field and had resulted in his being frequently called upon by a number of concerns for advice on training programs.

W. P. LEHMAN is Chief, Interdepartmental Placement Service, United States Civil Service Commission.

seeks to attain its end by imparting to each member of an organization a complete concept of his position in the organization and of his relationship to other members of the organization (especially his immediate supervisor and immediate subordinates), and by providing him at the same time a constructively critical voice in the management of the organization. The plan in operation should result in discipline by consent rather than by dictation.

The mode of action by which this purpose is accomplished is the establishment of a series of conferences at every well-defined stratum of authority in the organization, providing thereby for regular meetings between each supervisor and the persons under his immediate supervision. For instance, the United States Civil Service Commission's "A" Conference is composed of Commissioner Flemming as leader and of the chiefs of divisions and other top officials of the Commission. The various divisions of the Commission have established "B" Conferences composed of the chief of the division as leader and of the heads of sections and immediate assistants to the chief. Several sections of various divisions have in turn initiated "C" Conferences composed of the head of the section and his immediate subordinates. It will be seen that with the conference system in full force, most supervisory employees of the Commission will be members of one conference and leaders of another. Provision is thus made for a natural communication of ideas from one stratum of the organization to the strata above and be-

low it. The line of authority of which the Interdepartmental Placement Service forms a part will serve as an illustration of this relationship.

*"A" Conference of the Civil Service Commission.* Commissioner Flemming is leader, and the Chief of the Examining Division is one of the members.

*"B" Conference of the Examining Division.* The Chief of the Examining Division is leader, and the Chief of the Interdepartmental Placement Service is one of the members.

*"C" Conference of the Interdepartmental Placement Service.* The Chief of the Interdepartmental Placement Service is leader, and the Head of the Qualifications Analysis Section of the Interdepartmental Placement Service is a member.

*"D" Conference of the Qualifications Analysis Section.* The Head of the Qualifications Analysis Section is leader, and the analysts and coders are members.

At each of these conferences are defined, discussed and criticized all aspects of the organization's purposes and activities which are pertinent to the work of the members of the conference. The conference either accepts the elements of the organization's program as presented or, if it disapproves of some aspect of the program, devises improvement and makes suitable recommendation to the proper authority for action.

#### BASIC ELEMENTS OF CONFERENCE PLAN

IN ORDER that measurable, maximum benefit may be obtained from the conferences, it is necessary that each conference pursue its consideration of the management program in an orderly fashion. It would be possible, of course, to gain some good by haphazardly selecting and considering those elements of the program in which the members of the conference happened to have most immediate interest. This method, however, leads to much wasted and misdirected effort, as has been illustrated by the experience of various organizations in which the

plan has been put into effect. The very fact that management is in some degree a science, invested with a logical order and form, indicates that its consideration by the conferences should follow a definite pattern. The pattern of conference action in the United States Civil Service Commission is based upon and follows a management formula. The formula consists of six major steps in management action:

1. *Organization Clarification.* This consists of a definition of the purpose of the organization, an analysis of its activities (including the objectives of such activities and the methods and procedures whereby the activities are affected), and a definition of the organizational structure established for carrying out these activities, showing the relationships which exist among individuals or units engaged in the activity. The clarification of the organization is complete when the conference has provided a definition of the duties and responsibilities of each of its members.

2. *Standards of Performance.* Following the clarification of the organization with its attendant definition of the activities of each unit and individual, standards for the performance of these activities, by unit and/or individual, should be set.

3. *Individual Analysis.* The work of each individual (and/or unit) can then be analyzed in the light of the standards established for the performance of the work, and disclosure is made of any gaps which may exist between performance and standard.

4. *Determine Help and Information Needed.* Determination is then made of what help and information are required by the unit or individual in order to close the gap between performance and standard.

5. *Source From Which Help and Information May Be Obtained.* When the kind of help and information needed has been defined, it is necessary to find a source from which such help may be obtained. This source is very often the supervisor himself, and the help and information are frequently supplied through consultation between the

individual and his supervisor. When the gap between performance and standard is common to a number of individuals performing the same job, a training course may be indicated, the instructor being drawn either from within or from outside the organization. The information needed cannot always be supplied from within the organization, and in such cases the source for such information may be a course in an available school, or required reading, or may be provided by the engagement of a consultant.

6. *Set a Time Schedule for Closing Gap by Training.* Not only should the needed help and information be obtained and utilized, but a time schedule should be set within the limits of which the discovered gaps should be effectively closed.

THE foregoing formula dictates the approach which the management training conferences follow. The first action of the conferences is the clarification of the organization. The objectives, policies and activities of the organization are defined, analyzed and criticized. A record of the discussions and conclusions reached is kept in the management training conference manual. This manual contains the analysis of every activity of the group represented in the conference, and is an operating manual for the members of the group and an instrument for the orientation of any new employee added to the group. This means that the analysis of activities must record what is being done. If the conference evolves improvements in the performance of the activity, such improvements are recommended to the proper management authority; upon approval by that authority they become a part of the record of activities.

The setting of standards of performance, the analysis of actual performance in the light of these standards, and the institution of training and remedial measures when such are required, do not await the complete analysis of all activities, but are carried out as the need is indicated. Thus, when a need for training measures is uncovered in the

analysis of one activity of a group, such measures are instituted and in force concomitantly with the group's analysis of its next activity. The conference may or may not participate, actively as a conference, in these steps which come subsequent to organization clarification.

The preliminary or "once-over" completion of the analysis of activities does not represent the conclusion of the conference's work. All organizations are and must be dynamic in nature, partly because of the changing requirements which they face and partly because of the ever-present possibility of, and necessity for, improvement in human institutions. This means that there is a constantly changing picture of activities and of methods of performance. It is the task of the conferences to keep abreast of these changes and in many cases to instigate them.

#### MISCONCEPTIONS TO BE AVOIDED

IN SOME places in which this plan has been adopted, a troublesome misconception of its purpose has arisen. It has been regarded as in some degree a substitute for authoritative action by a supervisor. Supervisors have delayed action on problems brought to them in order to present them to the conference for solution. This is a dangerous misuse of the management training conference. The conference is an adjunct to the authority of the supervisor; it is not to be used as a substitute for the normal exercise of that authority.

It is this misconception which quite often leads to impatience among conference members who wish to leave an orderly analysis of their activities in order to take up a special and immediate problem which confronts them. Such problems should be referred to the proper authority for solution, and the person to whom the problem is referred should handle it by virtue of the authority reposed in him. The supervisor may very properly confer with such of his assistants and subordinates as he thinks fit, but a supervisor is shirking his responsibilities when he finds it necessary to interrupt con-

stantly the planned program of his management training conference in order to enlist the aid of that conference in the solution of daily supervisory problems. Ordinarily it is best for the supervisor to take his authoritative action. The action will be subject, in the regular course of events, to the discussion and criticism of the group, and any member of the group who questions meanwhile the propriety of the action can consult with his supervisor on the matter. It should be emphasized, however, that no attempt should be made to replace the exercise of the normal responsibilities of the supervisor with conference action.

The authoritarian type of boss sometimes errs in just the opposite direction. Sometimes the conference head forgets himself and uses the conference simply as an audience for the expounding of his own ideas and understanding of the program. This results in the strangulation of ideas which might otherwise well up from the ranks of the conference. The enrichment which often results from cross-fertilization of ideas between organization strata is replaced by the comparative barrenness of the lecture platform. A man can hardly be a good manager without also being a good instructor, and the conference is a means through which teaching may be accomplished; but every member of the conference, including the leader, must function both as teacher and student. The method must be the true forum method, the discussion must be kept open, and the leader must be receptive.

There should be no conflict between these concepts: (1) that the management training formula is not a substitute for administrative action, but rather an adjunct to the flow of executive authority; and (2) that the plan is designed to obtain the maximum participation of the individual in the whole program. The two concepts are brought together by the need for an orderly democratic process which will insure the consideration of every pertinent part of the program by each interested party, and which at the same time does not interfere with the speedy, in-

cisive action possible only when there are clear lines of authority.

The management training program insures that each person is given opportunity to express himself effectively and openly on that part of a whole program with which he is directly concerned. The management training conferences are not, however, merely a valve to "blow off steam." The employee has a serious responsibility when he participates in the program and is expected to make constructive suggestions. The ideas which are presented before a conference are not so presented because the supervisors are not aware of possible solutions, but rather in the hope that a better solution may be obtained by group action.

#### THE CONFERENCE SYSTEM IN ACTION

THE system described was introduced in the Interdepartmental Placement Service almost coincident with the inception of that service in July, 1940. The Interdepartmental Placement Service faced very difficult management problems. It was organized for the purpose of establishing a federal employee qualifications file which could be utilized to facilitate interdepartmental transfers and promotions.<sup>2</sup> The program had to be executed with emergency speed, since it was conceived and carried out as an integral part of the Commission's recruitment for national defense. More than 600 employees were placed on duty within the first month of operation, and were put to work on a three-shift, around-the-clock basis. Almost all of these employees were inexperienced and untrained in personnel work. Only nine of the employees, besides the Chief, had had experience in any phase of selection and placement or any other per-

<sup>2</sup> This program involved the submission by nearly a million federal employees of Personnel Information Sheets (a kind of personal history sheet), the analysis by the Interdepartmental Placement Service of the qualifications shown in each sheet, the coding of qualifications and other employment data, establishment of a punched card file by means of which mechanical searches could be made for persons with specified qualifications, and the institution of methods and procedures whereby this file could be employed in effecting placements.

sonnel work. There was a fairly large percentage of recent graduates from colleges and universities who appeared to be potentially good, and a number of persons who were experienced in various occupations and whose occupational knowledge could be put to good use once those persons had learned the principles of selection and placement.

Nearly 450 of these employees were set to the task of analyzing and coding occupational qualifications. These persons were sent through a preliminary training course of two weeks in which they were taught the use of the qualifications coding system adopted by the Interdepartmental Placement Service and a few of the rudiments of qualifications analysis. It was evident that a great deal of additional training would be required, but the need for speed was so paramount that plans had to be made for providing the additional training on the job.

THE first few weeks of operation demonstrated how varied were the needs for additional training. Supervisors were faced with hundreds of questions from their subordinates; difficulty was encountered in achieving consistency in the application of standards for evaluating qualifications; qualifications analysts and coders were not sufficiently aware of the characteristics and limitations of the mechanical punched card set-up through which they had to operate; and the clerical and administrative sections were still feeling their way through the Commission's organizational structure and administrative procedure. There were more questions and more problems than the supervisors could handle through ordinary supervisor-subordinate relationships, and even the nine experienced employees occupying the top administrative positions were not yet fully acquainted with all aspects of their jobs.

It soon became evident that the employees needed instruction in the examining practices and principles of the Commission, in the application of examination standards, in punched-card mechanical operations, in the

organizational structure of the Commission, in the principles of selection and placement, in the principles of management, and in other matters. What they needed above all else, however, was an understanding of the basic philosophy of the program of which they were a part.

#### RESULTS ACHIEVED

THE management training conference system in use in the Commission was adopted by the Chief of the Interdepartmental Placement Service and his immediate subordinates in the first weeks of the existence of the unit. Its extension to the subordinate levels of the organization had been planned for some undetermined date in the future, after the organization had begun to function properly. The system led to so rapid a coherence in the top supervisory levels, however, that it was decided to extend it immediately to the lower levels.

Within three months of the inception of operation, all Interdepartmental Placement Service employees were members of management training conferences. The conferences were provided with drafts of the objectives, policies, and procedures of the organization, and these were studied, discussed and improved in conference sessions.

Gratifying results became evident almost immediately. The great melange of questions previously addressed to supervisors began to take order and became classifiable. The supervisor was able to identify the basic difficulties confronting his subordinates, and to take steps to eliminate them. The employees no longer repeated the same question in a variety of forms—an indication that they were now grasping the philosophy which dictated management decisions. Recommendations by subordinates for changes in procedures, standards and action became pertinent and constructive.

Production rates lagged for a month or two, but the quality of the production improved greatly. The work became consistent and standardized. By the third month production rates began to rise, and the quality

## MANAGEMENT TRAINING CONFERENCE PLAN 143

of the production still improved. Production rates have accelerated steadily ever since that initial rise. The increase can be traced directly to the greater confidence of the employees and to improvements in procedures and methods, most of which resulted from conference recommendations or from individual recommendations based on conference study and discussion.

#### DEFINING TRAINING NEEDS

THE needs for special training, previously mentioned, became clearly defined. Two special courses for typists were instituted; several employees were placed in regular training courses offered by the Commission; several more employees were placed on training details in other sections of the Commission, the work of which was related to that of the Interdepartmental Placement Service; and a number of employees, upon the advice of their supervisors, enrolled in courses offered by local colleges and universities. These training requirements continue to be defined as the conferences progress, and the training program is regarded as a continuing thing.

Most important, however, of the training activities have been the steps taken by supervisors themselves to provide needed instruction. The conference discussions have enabled the supervisors to determine not only the group training needs, but have served also to reveal characteristics, needs, and the strengths and weaknesses of individual employees. The supervisors can accordingly direct their supervisory activities more intelligently and fruitfully. A theory subscribed to by all Interdepartmental Placement Service supervisors is that a good supervisor must be a good instructor. Special instructions are issued, and special conferences both with groups and individuals are held. Supervisors are thoroughly impressed with the fact that training is management's job—their job.

The Interdepartmental Placement Service, being a new organization with new supervisors, found another important use in

the management training conference method. It afforded top management a quick and tangible means of measuring the quality of its intermediate and lower strata of supervisors. The system demonstrated the need for "help and information," which were quickly supplied. After reasonable periods of trial, the supervisors who failed to meet the standards set were transferred to non-supervisory posts, or encouraged to seek places outside the organization.

#### EFFECT UPON MORALE

THE results described are the more tangible effects of the management training conference system. They do not, however, represent the most valuable fruits of the system. Lawrence Appley has said, "Efficiency as an end is an evil, but as a by-product of good morale is a just reward." The quality of the morale engendered by the conference system must, of course, be measured indirectly. The effects described above serve to demonstrate in some degree the spirit which exists. It appears pertinent, however, in this connection to note that small groups of employees who transferred to similar positions in other organizations complained that their new work was dull and routine. The job classification sheets for their new positions were almost identical with those of the positions that they left in the Interdepartmental Placement Service. It became evident in the discussions with these people that their complaint against the routine, uninspiring nature of their new work arose directly from the nature of the relationship between them and their supervisors. The supervision was of the strictly authoritarian type, and the employee had no opportunity to participate in guiding and developing the program of which he was so small a part. These employees, it should be noted, did not complain of their supervisors. They complained instead of the "unimportance" of their work and the lack of interest in it.

The most valuable result of the management training conference system is the self-

respect and sense of responsibility which it engenders in the mind of each employee. The mutual understanding and common footing which it provides for supervisor and subordinate is invaluable. The supervisors have been forced to analyze the work of their own positions in order to maintain their leadership; as a result this leadership has become natural and respected. The employee knows his work and the purpose of it, and

his contributions—on the line and in a recommendatory capacity—are increased. A coherence and an integration exist in the entire working force which would otherwise be difficult if not impossible to realize. The employees understand the reasons underlying administrative action, and their reasoned concurrence with the action frequently leads to enrichment of the concept in its practical application.

in a  
ed. A  
n the  
rwise  
The  
lderly-  
oned  
leads  
actical

# COURT DECISIONS

EDITED BY H. ELIOT KAPLAN

LIBRARY  
C.P.D.

Document Record

## CONSTITUTIONALITY OF LOUISIANA MERIT LAW

**C**ONSTITUTIONALITY of the new Louisiana law adopted in 1940, as well as the constitutional amendment ratifying the civil service act, was subjected to an all-out attack on many fronts in the District Court of Louisiana, (*Ricks v. Department of State Civil Service Commission, et al.*), decided December, 1941, opinion by Holcombe, J. As this is being written, word has been received that the court has been upheld on all points in a subsequent appeal to the Louisiana Supreme Court.

A resumé of the major issues involved in the proceedings will prove interesting to those who appreciate the lengths to which political opponents of the merit system go in seeking to upset merit system laws. No possible ground of unconstitutionality was overlooked, from "home rule" to "undue process of law."

The federal Constitution was violated by the new law, the plaintiff contended, because the act violated the Fourteenth Amendment of the Constitution: (1) the act was arbitrary and discriminatory and denied equal protection of the law to all citizens alike; (2) the act abridged the privileges and immunities of the citizens and deprived them of life, liberty and property, without due process of law; (3) the act discriminated arbitrarily among employees at the time of its adoption in that some were covered in and others were required to take qualifying tests; (4) the statute provided a preference for veterans; (5) there was arbitrary discrimination in exemptions from the competitive provision among the positions placed in the un-

classified service; (6) it denied priority of right of appointment by permitting the choice of one out of the three highest certified from the list; (7) restriction of political activity of employes was denial of their rights as citizens; (8) the act conferred on the personnel director and the Commission arbitrary authority; (9) it gave a preference to persons over 21 years of age, and so discriminated against those under 21. The federal Constitution was further violated, contended the plaintiff, because the new act imposed excessive penalties or fines for violation of some of the terms of the statute, particularly those relating to political assessments and political activity. The new act, it was charged, also violated the Louisiana State Constitution in many respects.

The court overruled all of the contentions. It held that the new constitutional amendment and the new law dealt with matters logically viewed as a comprehensive single plan. "Civil service in cities of the state having a population of one hundred thousand or more does have a logical and vital connection with state civil service," stated the court. "The legislature might well have put into one and the same statute provisions for civil service with respect to state and municipal employees in cities having a population of one hundred thousand or more without danger of successful attack that the act contained more than one subject, this because state and municipal civil service are interrelated and directly connected one with the other." The court, following the ruling in an earlier Louisiana case, *Gilroy v. Jones*, 1 So. (2d) 65, held that the Louisiana constitutional provision requiring that constitutional amendments shall be so submitted as to enable the electors to vote on each amendment separately, "does not mean that each and every change to be made in a section or article of the Constitu-

H. ELIOT KAPLAN is Executive Secretary, National Civil Service Reform League, and is a practicing member of the New York Bar. He is assisted in the preparation of this section by IRVING SCHWARTZ, former member of the staff of the New York University Legal Research Bureau.

tion shall be the subject of a separate and independent concurrent resolution."

The new law was subject to attack also on the ground that part of the act became effective immediately and other parts of the act became effective at a much later date. It was contended that because the Louisiana Constitution provides that no enactment of the legislature shall take effect until 20 days after approval, the Louisiana law was invalid. The court held that the provision in the Constitution requiring that no act shall take effect until 20 days after the adjournment of the legislature was designed to provide a minimum period during which it would be possible for citizens of the state to familiarize themselves with the acts of the legislature, before they became effective, and that at the most, the act could not become effective until 20 days after its adoption.

**C**OMMENTING on the process of blanket-ing-in without examination, of incumbents of positions in the state service, the court stated:

When laws such as the law here under attack are passed and a system of civil service is inaugurated, it is essential in order to prevent confusion, that experienced employees and officers should be continued in office. Laws with respect to the holding of public office and position, it must be remembered, are not enacted for the benefit of those who are appointed to office, but are intended in the interest of the public. Hence, they should be construed by the courts from that standpoint. Viewed in this light, I do not believe that the provisions of the Act relating to the so-called "freezing in" or "blanketing in" of experienced employees is violative of the Fourteenth Amendment of the Constitution of the United States.

Holding the preference accorded veterans constitutional, the court stated that "it has been fairly well settled that a civil service statute giving preference to certain persons by reason of military or naval service, when they have stood the required test, and otherwise complied with the law, is not violative of the Constitution of the United States."

The court upheld the legislature's delegation of authority to the Civil Service Board to make rules and the authority of the personnel director to administer the system as "necessary to effect the purposes of the civil service act."

The court dismissed without merit the contention that the law infringed upon the rights and privileges of citizens by prohibiting employee's political activity and political contri-

butions. Such provisions were enacted "to further insure the immunity of the civil service from political control" and these are "legitimate exercises of legislative discretion."

In upholding the authority of the legislature to provide fines and penalties for violation of the civil service provisions, The Court contended that "any law of this nature to be properly enforced must provide a penalty of some kind for its violation." The act itself "does not impose any fine." The Court pointed out that the Commission could not fine anyone. On the contrary, no fine can be imposed except by a court of competent jurisdiction, and "it must be presumed that in exercising this duty, the courts will act with fairness and impartiality, in that excessive fines or penalties will not be imposed."

This was not all. Attack was also made on the validity of the legislative appropriation for the state Civil Service Commission. It was claimed that the appropriation might possibly be used in establishing the system for the city of New Orleans, and that such use violated the Louisiana State Constitution. In the absence of any proof that the appropriations made were used other than for the State Department of Civil Service, the Court overruled the objection as without merit.

#### CONFLICT BETWEEN HOME RULE AND GENERAL STATUTE

**I**N CONSTRUING state constitutional grants of home rule legislative powers to municipalities, the courts recognize the principle that legislative acts of home rule municipalities are superior to state legislative provisions only in matters of purely "local" concern, and that within a field affecting the state at large, a conflict between state and municipal legislative provisions must be resolved in favor of the state statute.

In *State ex rel. O'Driscoll v. Cull*, 37 N. E. (2d) 49 (Ohio), the court applied this principle to invalidate a rule of a municipal civil service commission to the effect that graduation from high school was required for eligibility to take a civil service examination for the position of patrolman. A general state statute forbade the promulgation of rules or regulations "setting up educational requirements as a condition of taking a civil service examination...." The commission rule was passed pursuant to

the Cleveland home rule charter and, of course, was deemed to have the force and effect of the charter, from which it was derived. Thus, the court was directly presented with the question of conflict between general state law and home rule charter. The court relied on the broad ruling of prior decisions to the effect that "matters pertaining to police protection are of state-wide concern and under the control of state sovereignty. It follows that civil service as applied to the police department of a city is subject to state regulation and the statute must prevail."

(*Editor's Note*: It would seem, as pointed out in the dissenting opinion, that the commission rule does not amount to local police, sanitary, or similar regulation. The mere fact that a regulation is prescribed for the examination of prospective policemen does not make such a regulation a local police regulation. Therefore, the rule of the Cleveland Civil Service Commission, is a valid exercise of the power of local self-government. It is important to note that the majority of opinion is necessarily restricted to police examinations. Since the question of what matters are of "statewide" rather than "local" concern is too broad to admit of clear, well-defined test, an advance determination of just which local departments must yield to the force of general statutes in regard to civil service regulations in home rule localities presents a confusing and difficult task.)

#### CONFLICT OF STATUTES

THE application of civil service provisions of the Florida Unemployment Compensation Law was considered in *State ex rel. Hathaway v. Williams*, 5 So. (2d) 269 (Fla.). Relator had been appointed as director of the Florida State Employment Service, after passing a competitive examination. He was subsequently removed by the Governor, which removal was affirmed on appeals to successive administrative bodies: the Merit System Council, and the Florida Industrial Commission. Relator thereupon brought this action seeking a writ of certiorari to review the judgment of removal. The court granted certiorari, and quashed the order of the Merit System Council approving the removal of relator.

The primary question presented to the court was whether civil service protective provisions contained in the state Unemployment Compen-

sation Law applied to the relator, so as to allow his removal only on a showing of good and sufficient cause. The state law contains two apparently contradictory provisions with respect to this question. One section of the law specifically provides that directors of the Unemployment Compensation Division of the State Employment Service shall be appointed by the Governor, and "shall hold office at the will of the Governor," indicating that such directors were removable without resort to civil service requirements. However, another section provides that the Industrial Commission shall determine qualifications of applicants for positions by examinations, and "such personnel shall be appointed on the basis of efficiency and fitness as determined in such examinations," indicating that such employees were subject to civil service provisions, and were therefore entitled to protection against summary removal. The court gave effect to both sections, by holding that the civil service protective provisions were applicable, and that the removal power of the Governor was also retained, with the limitations that the removal must be for cause. The court said:

Both provisions should be construed to harmonize and be given a field of operation if possible. The declared policy of the act was to improve the personnel efficiency by making appointments and promotions under the merit system and thereby encourage efficient and faithful service. Such was the policy of the United States Employment Service with which the State Employment Service was required to cooperate.

The court emphasized the point that the state had accepted the federal Wagner-Peyser Act relating to the administration of state unemployment compensation laws, "and it was agreed that on acceptance of the Wagner-Peyser Act, a Director of the Florida State Employment Service would be appointed under the merit system."

Thus, the result of the court's interpretation of the state statute is that "prior to the completion of the probationary period, the Governor may appoint the Director of the Florida State Employment Service from a list of eligibles under the merit system and cut off his tenure at will, but after the probationary period is completed and he is approved for permanent tenure, he is subject to removal for cause only." The court found that there was insufficient evidence to justify the order removing the relator.

## SCOPE OF CLASSIFIED SERVICE

THE extent of the new civil service amendment to the Michigan constitution was considered in *De Maggio v. Attorney General*, 1 N. W. (2d) 530 (Mich.). The plaintiff was an assistant attorney general of the state, appointed by the attorney general, and holding office "at the pleasure of the attorney general," as provided by state statute. The attorney general's term expired December 31, 1940 and at the general election held November 4, 1940, the electorate adopted a civil service amendment to the state constitution. The plaintiff claimed the amendment applied to his position, and resulted in giving him tenure, protecting him against dismissal by the newly elected attorney general.

Plaintiff contended that, pursuant to the state constitution, amendments take effect thirty days thereafter, so that the new civil service amendment became effective December 6, 1940, prior to the expiration of the term of the attorney general, who appointed the plaintiff. However, the civil service amendment specifically provides that it shall take effect on January 1st following its passage. The court ruled that this proviso takes precedence over the general thirty day provision in the state constitution. "It seems clear," stated the court, "that the purpose of the 30-day clause (in the constitution) is to enable the public to become acquainted with the provisions of an amendment after it has been approved. There is nothing in the Constitution which prohibits the postponement of the effective date of the operation of the amendment."

Plaintiff has contended that his term of office did not expire with that of the attorney general who appointed him. The court relied on cases holding that, where a subordinate holds "at the will" of the appointing power, his term expires with the term of the one appointing him.

Although not necessary for the decision, since the court already ruled that relator having been removed prior to the effective date of the amendment, was not "covered-in," the court went further and expressed its opinion on the applicability of the civil service amendment to assistant attorneys general. The first paragraph of the constitutional amendment reads:

The state civil service shall consist of all positions in the state except those filled by popular election, heads

of departments, members of boards and commissions, employees of courts of record, of the legislature, of the higher educational institutions recognized by the state constitution, all persons in the military and naval forces of the state, and not to exceed two other exempt positions for each elected administrative officer, and each department, board or commission.

The Court held that assistant attorneys general are not expressly excepted from the operation of the amendment. "It is a general principle of statutory construction," stated the court, "that it is impossible to change positive constitutional and statutory provisions by way of implication."

A CITY charter and general statutory civil service provisions relating to cities were held to apply to employees of the city Board of Education in *Tanner v. Civil Service Commission of City of Minneapolis*, 1 N. W. (2d) 602 (Minn.). Janitors and engineers in the maintenance department of the city Board of Education are within the classified service as defined in the civil service statute applicable to the city. The statute lists those in the unclassified service, and includes therein "superintendents, principals, supervisors of teachers and teachers in the public schools." Thus, the specific enumeration of those school employees indicates that other school employees were intended to be placed in the classified service. This is an application of a settled principle of statutory interpretation: *Expressio unius est exclusio alterius*.

Furthermore, the provision of the city charter giving the municipal civil service commission authority over classified city employees applied to employees of the city board of education, despite the fact that the board was organized as a separate corporate entity. The board was referred to in the city charter as a "branch of the city government," and there "was no reason why the board could not be a separate corporate body and still be a branch of the city government." The court therefore upheld the right of the municipal civil service commission to order promotional examinations for the employees in question.

(Editor's Note: See *Brenan v. Kraus*, 176 Ill. 620; *Vaughan v. City of Chicago*, 227 Ill. 445 (81 N. E. 370); *Lewis v. Board of Education*, 258 N. Y. 117; and *Schieffelin v. Comfort (Board of Elections)*, 212 N. Y. 84.)

## COVERING-IN INCUMBENTS

PRIOR to May 1, 1934, the City of Chicago had been divided into twenty-two independent park districts, only three of which were governed by civil service provisions. On May 1, 1934, the Chicago Park District Act went into effect. This statute consolidated the independent districts into one Park District, to be governed by civil service provisions. The question before the court was whether employees of the nineteen independent districts, which were not subject to civil service provisions, were "covered in" by the consolidating statute. The court construed the Park District statute so as to give civil service status to all employees of the independent Park Districts. *People ex rel. Kelly v. Dunham*, 38 N. E. (2d) (Ill. App.).

The Park District Act, consolidating all districts, specifically adopted the Civil Service Act relating to Parks. This latter statute specifically provides: "In any park district which is now, or which hereafter may become, subject to the provisions of this act, all persons who at the time when this act takes effect or becomes applicable, hold offices or places of employment which this act provides shall be classified, shall be included under the provisions of this act and shall become members of the classified civil service of such park district, without original examination." The specific legislative provision the court held served to extend civil service provisions to incumbents at the time the consolidating statute took effect.

## ADMINISTRATIVE DISCRETION IN DETERMINING SALARY GRADES

THE function of an administrative department and that of the civil service commission (and the court, enforcing civil service provisions), came up for consideration in *Monahan v. Dep't. of Water and Power of City of Los Angeles*, 120 Pac. (2d) 730 (Cal. Dist. Ct. App.). The plaintiffs held the civil service positions of "journeymen linemen" in the Department of Water and Power of the City of Los Angeles. They alleged that pursuant to salary classifications made by that department, other "journeymen linemen" in the department, performing the same duties as plaintiffs, were designated as "troublemen," and were paid \$255 per month, while plaintiffs received only \$195 per month. Plaintiffs therefore brought action seeking a declaratory judgment that they

should receive the same salary as did the "troublemen." The court denied relief.

Even admitting that the higher paid employees were performing duties similar to those performed by plaintiffs, the court held that this fact does not give plaintiffs a right to judicial relief. The salary question was properly within the province of the administrative department. Under the terms of the city charter, the Department of Water and Power had the authority to fix the salaries of its employees. The court made this rather disturbing observation:

This for the reason that the charter imposes upon the department the duty to create the necessary positions in the department and to fix the salaries and duties of every employee thereof. Under that provision of the charter it is clear (except for applicable civil service rules, of which there are none) that the department might establish positions by rank, grade or otherwise, even though such positions were all within one class as determined by the Civil Service Commission. The latter's duty was to classify generally, and not specifically; and it had no authority to set the wage. . . .

Accordingly, then, as under the charter the department may rank or grade linemen or troublemen, and may vary the pay as to each even though the work is the same or substantially the same, we may not inquire into the motives that affect the commissioners in their selection. Executive heads in the fields of government, as in the fields of commerce, must have a certain amount of discretion if they are to function.

## CHANGE IN METHOD OF SALARY PAYMENT

IN *Ross v. La Guardia*, and *Lewin v. La Guardia*, 287 N. Y. 28, 38 N. E. (2d) 117, the New York Court of Appeals defined the function of the civil service commission in fixing salary grades. It illustrates the limitations of the personnel agency over salary adjustments under the laws in most jurisdictions. Physicians in the New York City Department of Health had for many years been paid on either an annual salary basis or on a per-diem basis. The civil service commission had fixed their grades on an annual salary basis. The city's fiscal authorities changed the basis of payments from annual or per-diem rates to a new plan of payment for each "session" of assignment. The assignments were left to the Health Department in its discretion. The petitioners had sought to compel the city Board of Estimate to restore the line appropriations in the budget adopted for the fiscal year 1940-41, and to restore them to annual salary grade positions they enjoyed prior to July 1, 1940. The Court upheld the authority of the city Board of Estimate to revise the method and basis of payment, holding that the gradings of the civil service commis-

sion could not preclude the Board's action. Stated the Court:

A distinction must be recognized between the rights and duties pertaining to a given position and the rights and duties of the incumbent of that position. The power to create and to abolish *positions* is vested in the Board of Estimate, . . . which, in the absence of mandatory salary legislation, may also fix the compensation payable to the holder of a position, whoever he may be. . . . When once the position is established and an appropriation has been made by the Board of Estimate, the appointing officer or body . . . may select the *persons* who are to fill the various positions and receive the salaries attached thereto from among those declared by the Municipal Civil Service Commission to be eligible to discharge the duties of the office and to be entitled to the compensation paid therefor. . . .

If the Board of Estimate so chooses, in the absence of special legislation, it is for the Board to determine whether or not to dispense with a given service or whether or not and on what basis to maintain a given appropriation. . . . Petitioners point to no provision of law which forbids the Board of Estimate to make appropriations on a per session basis rather than per annum.

#### RESTRAINING SALARY PAYMENT

**A** GENERAL taxpayer's action cannot be maintained to enjoin payment of salary to an employee appointed in violation of civil service requirements, according to the Wisconsin Supreme Court. [*McClutchev v. Milwaukee County*, 300 N. W. 224 (Wis.), motion for rehearing denied 300 N. W. 917.] The Court's premise for this conclusion is:

It is fundamental that in order to maintain such an action the taxpayer and taxpayers as a class must have sustained or will sustain some pecuniary loss. . . . It is obvious that the taxpayers have not sustained nor will sustain any pecuniary loss by continuance of Boucher in the position he is occupying. He is filling and has ever filled the position adequately. . . . Had he not been appointed, some one else would have been appointed to the place, and the same salary paid to such appointee or appointees. . . . This action is brought merely to vindicate and prevent evasion of the civil service law, and there is no statute authorizing a private person to bring such action.

To meet just this possible situation, Section 28 of the New York Civil Service Law was enacted specifically authorizing a taxpayer to maintain a proceeding to restrain payment of salary to any person illegally employed in the civil service. The New York courts have, however, gone further than this (even in the absence of specific statute) and have held that any citizen may maintain a mandamus proceeding to compel compliance with the provisions of the civil service law, and restrain payment of salary to one illegally employed. (See *Matter of Andreson v. Rice*, 227 N. Y. 271).

#### APPOINTMENT NOT A FUNCTION OF CIVIL SERVICE AGENCY

**I**N *Bailey v. Kern*, 32 N. Y. Supp. (2d) 386 (Sp. Term), an action by those on an eligible list for appointment as firemen in New York City to compel the Municipal Civil Service Commission to fill vacancies in the city fire department, was held fatally defective for failure to make the Fire Commissioner a party defendant. "The Municipal Civil Service Commission has no power to make the appointments sought by petitioners. It may merely certify eligibles for appointment to the Fire Commissioner, who has the power to make appointments when and if that officer decides to fill existing vacancies."

The court went further and pointed out that "this court has no power to direct the head of a municipal department to appoint eligibles to fill any existing vacancy. The determination of such matters as the time when vacancies should be filled, must rest in the discretion of the appointing officer. . . . The petitioners did not possess a vested right to appointment by reason of the fact that their names were upon an eligible list. Their only right, as long as their eligible list remained in force, was to insist that no appointments be made to vacant positions except from that list."

(Editor's Note: See *Tonkin v. Leary*, 256 N. Y. 510.)

#### RIGHT TO COMPEL CERTIFICATION

**T**HE issue of certification of eligibles to a position in a lower grade than the position for which the eligible list was originally created arose in *People ex rel. Corbett v. Allman*, 38 N. E. (2d) 810 (Ill. App.). The relators were on an eligible list for the position of "telephone operator." Pursuant to the civil service statute applicable to the City of Chicago, the Civil Service Commission had classified all positions in the city, and the position of "police clerk" was placed in the same classification as "telephone operator," with the exception that the salary grade for the latter was higher than for the former. It was admitted that the duties of the two positions were substantially similar, and that a telephone operator could perform the functions of a police clerk. The Commission, at one time faced with a need for police clerks, had certified 23 names from the eligible list for telephone operator. The relators sought

certification to the position in the lower salary grade, pointing out that there were twelve vacancies in that position. The court granted a writ of mandamus compelling the certification and appointment of the relators.

The court emphasized the fact that the positions involved similar duties. "A decision for the plaintiffs in this case," stated the court, "does not, as the defendants maintain, require the Civil Service Commission to certify all eligibles from a higher grade to a vacancy in a lower grade whenever the vacancy occurs. It merely requires the commission to certify a person for appointment to a position for which he has been examined, when the duties of the so-called lower position are the same as the duties of the so-called higher position, and where no examination is held or deemed necessary for the so-called lower positions. There is no reason for saying that a decision for plaintiffs in this case must go beyond the particular facts . . . : (a) two different titled positions having the same duties; (b) . . . the Civil Service Commission determining by its own action that examination for one position qualifies the person for appointment to the other; and (c) . . . the arbitrary action of the Civil Service Commission in certifying 23 eligibles from the telephone operators' list and refusing to certify the remaining names on said list, though for a period of more than three years from the appointment of the 23 from the telephone operators' list, temporary appointees have been continuously performing the duties of the position for which plaintiffs have qualified by examination."

(Editor's Note: See the recent case of *Friend v. Valentine*, 34 N. E. 2d. 912.)

#### NO RIGHT TO PERMANENT TENURE AFTER TEMPORARY APPOINTMENT

THE recent decision of *Villian v. Civil Service Commission of San Francisco*, 117 Pac. (2d) 880 (Cal.), presented the problem of whether a series of temporary appointments were in reality subterfuges used by the city commission to avoid permanent appointments. The San Francisco city charter provides that the city civil service commission shall determine whether positions are "temporary, seasonal or permanent, and shall notify the candidate in accordance therewith to the end that the candidate may have knowledge of the probable dura-

tion of employment." The charter further authorizes the commission to adopt rules governing temporary and permanent positions, and pursuant to this grant of power the city commission promulgated a rule defining permanent and temporary positions, and providing that appointments to temporary positions shall expire automatically at the end of five months, and the appointees shall be returned to the eligible list, and shall not be considered for re-appointment to a temporary position until "one day has elapsed from the date of termination of the prior tenure."

The plaintiffs stood low on an eligible list for the position of general clerk stenographer, and since those above them waived the right to accept temporary positions, plaintiffs were granted and accepted positions in the county welfare department, which positions were designated as temporary. After an employment for five months, plaintiffs were discharged for one day, and then were re-employed, and this process was repeated for successive periods. Finally, the eligible lists on which plaintiffs held positions expired, and plaintiffs were no longer employed, whereupon they instituted this action for a declaratory judgment holding them to be permanent employees. Plaintiffs claim that they were in fact permanent employees, and that the one day discharge was merely an arbitrary method of preventing the acquisition of a technical permanent status. The court held that plaintiffs were only temporary employees, in substance as well as in form.

At the time of plaintiffs' appointment, prevailing economic conditions necessitating unusual relief to indigents and unemployed, had placed added work on the welfare department. The very nature of the situation made it difficult to determine whether this burden would be a continuing fact or requiring the permanent employment of more workers . . . In fact, had the positions been permanent, they would not have been eligible for appointment to them because of the many candidates with higher rating on the civil service list.

The court held the commission was justified, pursuant to its own rules enacted by virtue of the charter provision, in continuing the classification of the positions as temporary. The expiration of the eligible list terminated the right of the temporary appointees to further appointments thereafter.

(Editor's Note: See *Matter of Hilsenrad v. Miller*, 284 N. Y. 445, discussed in *Public Personnel Review*, July, 1941, p. 239.)

VETERAN'S PREFERENCE FOR DEPARTMENT  
HEADS

**I**N *Tusant v. City of Des Moines*, 300 N. W. 690 (Iowa), the state veteran preference statute provided: "In every public department and upon all public works in the state . . . , honorably discharged soldiers . . . shall, except in the position of school teachers, be entitled to preference in appointment, employment, and promotion over other applicants of no greater qualifications." The statute specifically excepts from its operation "the position of private secretary or deputy of any official or department, or . . . any person holding a strictly confidential relation to the appointing officer." In view of these specific exceptions, the court ruled that heads of departments were also intended to be excepted, and therefore held that the statute did not apply to the office of city assessor of the city of Des Moines, since such city assessor was the head of a department. The Court said:

As to such positions or offices as do not come within the purview of the preference act, exceptions are made as to positions of confidence or as to deputies, for a deputy stands in the position of his principal. . . . And so with the deputies of the assessor, as prescribed by statute, who act for and in place of the city assessor as to a portion of the duties imposed upon him. Their duties are practically the same. The chief deputy performs the duty of the assessor in the event of a vacancy, and yet the deputies are exempted by statute. It is our opinion that when the deputies are so exempt, performing as they do the duties of the head of the department, the law would not have application to the head of the department, whose duty it is to appoint the deputy.

The court cited New York and Minnesota decisions to the effect that veterans' preference statutes do not apply to heads of departments.

PROBATIONARY PERIOD RULE HELD VOID

**T**HE Civil Service Commission of the State of Colorado was held to have no power to pass a rule providing for a probationary period of appointment, during which time the probationer, under the rule, was removable summarily where the "employing authority is of the opinion that such dismissal shall be for the good of the service." *McDewitt v. Corfman*, 120 Pac. (2d) 963 (Colo.).

The state civil service statute gave no express power to provide for probationary appointments, and the court held that the state constitutional civil service provision denied the right to make appointments on such contingency. The Colorado provision, more detailed than

the New York provision, specifically provides for removal "only upon written charges, to be finally and promptly determined by the commission upon inquiry and after an opportunity to be heard." The court held that a rule providing for probationary appointments "attempts to subject those . . . who have been certified permanently into the classified civil service, to the hazards of discharge by authority other than the commission, the latter approving with no preferring of charges and without hearing. The commission may not thus divest itself of the power and control which it is required to exercise in the interest of civil service."

(*Editor's Note*: See, however, *Sharp v. Lee*, 3 So. 2d 372, (Fla.), to the contrary, holding that the civil service board may formulate rules for probationary appointments as impliedly authorized in the civil service law.)

ABOLITION OF POSITIONS AND REINSTATEMENT TO  
"SIMILAR" POSITIONS

**S**ECION 31 of the New York Civil Service Law provides that a civil service employee in the competitive class who is separated from the service "through the abolition of a department" shall have his name placed on a preferred list "for any corresponding or similar office or position in the same class, grade, group, or substantially similar or corresponding group as the position he formerly held," and shall be certified from such list before certification of employees from any other list. In *Adams v. Mc Kenzie*, 31 N. Y. S. (2d) 185 (Sp. Term) this section was held not to be available to airport inspectors at New York City's Floyd Bennett Field, who, after that field was taken over by the United States Navy, claimed the right to be employed at La Guardia Airport. The court emphasized the administrative differences between the two airports, so that it could not be said that employees at one airfield were capable of holding positions at the other field.

As the result of the setup created at La Guardia Airport from the beginning of operations, there never was and is not presently, any position vacant there which any of the petitioners is fitted or qualified to fill. The work at La Guardia Field is being performed by qualified persons working under appropriate titles and chosen as the result of competitive examination. To appoint the petitioners to the positions presently filled by such persons at La Guardia Airport would require the city authorities to establish new and unnecessary positions under the title of airport inspector or else

to terminate the setup of personnel and subdivision work which has existed at La Guardia Airport since it came into being and to substitute therefor the setup which prevailed at Floyd Bennett Field until it was taken over by the Navy. This the petitioner may not ask the court to direct. This is not a case where work formerly performed by the petitioners has been absorbed by others junior to them after their discharge. The petitioners are unable to point to any employee at La Guardia Airport who performs the duties formerly performed by petitioners.

#### GOOD FAITH IN ABOLITION OF POSITIONS

**I**N *Ellis v. Allen*, 154 S. W. (2d) 815 (Ark.), the court reaffirmed the settled principle that civil service statutes do not preclude abolitions of positions made in good faith, and refused to issue a writ of mandamus ordering payment of salary to a city chief of police whose position had been properly abolished for reasons of economy. "The purpose of the civil service statutes and of other laws prohibiting the discharge of employees without cause assigned, notice, and a hearing, is to insure the continuance in public employment of those officers who prove faithful and competent, regardless of their political affiliations. These statutes are not intended to affect or control the power of the city council or the executive officers of the city to abolish offices when they are no longer necessary or for reasons of economy. They are not intended to furnish an assurance to the officer or employee that he will be retained in the service of the city after the time when his services are required."

Another recent decision to the same effect is *Thompson v. City Council of Augusta*, 17 S. E. (2d) 161 (Ga.), where the court declined to order the reinstatement of a discharged water meter reader, despite the fact that the city subsequently employed another water meter reader, who was holding the position at the time the action for reinstatement was brought.

The plaintiff is not complaining that while his relations with the city were severed, others who did not occupy the same status, but who had a less permanent one as to tenure of service, were kept. Properly construed, the gist of the complaint . . . is that, having under the charter amendment and ordinances reached the status of a permanent employee, he was laid off solely because of lack of funds with which to pay him. The decisions in general sustain the right to lay off an employee when such action is taken conscientiously for the purpose of effecting economies in the administration of public funds . . . even though the employee held his appointment under civil service rules and regulations. . . . When laid off the plaintiff ceased to be an employee, and the permanent-tenure act did not give him any right to be recalled, which would in fact

be reemployment, when a vacancy occurs in the department in which he was formerly employed.

#### JUDICIAL REVIEW IN REMOVAL

**T**HE familiar principle to the effect that the failure of discharged employees to avail themselves of administrative remedies provided by statute bars their right to appeal to the courts was reaffirmed in *Alexander v. State Personnel Board*, 120 Pac. (2d) 76 (Cal. Dist. Ct. App.). Where civil service employees who were discharged after a hearing failed to petition for a rehearing within thirty days after receipt of the decision, as permitted by the state civil service statute, the court dismissed an action seeking writ of mandamus to compel reinstatement. The Court said:

Exhaustion of the administrative remedy is a jurisdictional prerequisite to restore to the courts . . . where the administrative procedure prescribes a rehearing, the rule of exhaustion of remedies will apply in order that the board may be given an opportunity to correct any errors that it may have made.

The same result was reached in *Allgood v. City of Oskaloosa*, 1 N. W. (2d) 211 (Iowa), where it was held that a discharged city policeman could not maintain mandamus to compel his reinstatement, where the state statute afforded a remedy by way of appeal to the civil service commission. Here the Court said:

As a general rule where a statutory remedy has been provided, it will bar the right to mandamus. . . . To serve as a bar the other remedy must be clear. It must be equally convenient, beneficial and effective. Ordinarily, it must be such as will enforce the right or compel the performance of the particular duty in question—in effect specific performance. . . . It should be noted that in order to serve as a bar it is not necessary that the other remedy be available at the time of applying for mandamus. If such other remedy was at one time available but has since been lost through failure and neglect of the applicant to avail himself thereof, the writ will not lie. . . . The remedy by appeal to the civil service commission . . . meets all of the above requirements.

#### REMOVAL AFTER INVALID APPOINTMENT

**O**NE who is appointed in violation of civil service requirements achieves no "civil service status," and cannot claim the protection of civil service provisions regarding summary removal. (*Daly v. School Dist. No. 2, Town of Hempstead*, 31 N. Y. S. [2d] 207 [Sup. Ct.].)

Relying on *Palmer v. Board of Education*, 276 N. Y. 222, 11 N. E. (2d) 887, which held that the New York constitutional provision on civil service was applicable even to positions in

rural school districts, the court here holds that an assistant janitor in the school district was illegally appointed, since he had not passed any civil service examination for the position. However, the janitor, seeking reinstatement after his summary removal, claims that as an exempt volunteer fireman he was entitled to a hearing upon charges, by virtue of Section 22 of the Civil Service Law, which provides that "No person holding a position by appointment or employment . . . in the public school service . . . who is an exempt volunteer fireman as defined in the general municipal law shall be removed from such position except for incompetency or misconduct shown after a hearing upon due notice upon stated charges. . . ." But the court ruled that Section 22 "refers to a legal employment or appointment and does not apply to the situation herein," citing *People ex rel. Hannan v. Board of Health of City of Troy*, 153 N. Y. 513, 47 N. E. 785.

The same broad principle—that before one can take advantage of statutory provisions regarding removals, one must have been validly appointed—was applied in *State ex rel. Reddick v. Lee*, 4 So. (2d) 336 (Fla.). In that case, the rules of a civil service board provided that an appointment was not complete until service of a probationary period. The court therefore held that an employee who had not fully served the probationary period could not gain the protection of statutory provisions requiring notice and a hearing prior to removal. "In other words, Sections . . . of the City Charter (relating to removal) do not become effective until after the probationary period is completed."

**I**N *State Civil Service Commission v. Lehl*, 118 Pac. (2d) 1080 (Colo.), however, the court ruled that a state civil service employee who had held his position for twenty-three years could not be summarily discharged on the ground that he is an alien, and so was never eligible for the position. Having been appointed as a regular civil service employee he was entitled to the privileges of the civil service provisions requiring removal only upon writing charges after a hearing.

(*Editor's Note*: The court does not specifically state that as an alien, the employee was never eligible for the position, but this seems to be assumed. If this is so, then his appointment was invalid, and the rule applied in *Daly*

*v. School Dist. and State v. Lee* (above) would seem to be applicable here also. Where an appointment was illegal in the first instance, the appointee cannot avail himself of protective statutory provisions against a summary discharge. In this case, however, the court seems to have been impressed by the fact that the employee held the position for twenty-three years. The Campbell case (above) sustained a dismissal made four years after an employee's reinstatement to the service, on the ground that the reinstatement was made in violation of the civil service rules. See also *Seahill v. Druzwicki*, 269 N. Y. 343; and *Palmer v. Board of Education*, 276 N. Y. 222.)

#### REMOVAL FROM POSITION IN EXEMPT CLASS

**C**IVIL service provisions prohibiting removals without just cause apply to all positions in the classified service, including those in the exempt class. (*Young v. Civil Service Commission*, 22 Atl. [2d] 523 N. J.) After holding that the secretary to a county sheriff is a county employee, so that the applicable civil service statutory provisions are those applying to counties (see *Sullivan v. McOskey*, 84 N. J. L. 380, 86 Atl. 497), the court indicated that specific statutory provision placed the position in the exempt class of the classified service. It was contended that those in the exempt class were not intended to have the same protection against dismissals without cause as were others in the classified service. The court upheld the action of the civil service in setting aside the summary dismissal of the secretary to the sheriff, stating:

It seems obvious to us that the purpose of the civil service act was to give protection against dismissal and other types of discrimination to those holding positions which the legislature placed in the classified service. Because of differences in the positions and surrounding circumstances, three general classes were created into one of which every position of a clerical character must fall. These were the exempt, the competitive and the non-competitive. The distinguishing feature, and it seems to us the only distinction sought to be made, was in the requirements prior to appointment. . . . We see no intention to make or reason for making any other distinction between the classes. If the legislature wished to create a position and not give the incumbent the protection and tenure of the civil service act, the position could be placed in the unclassified service. . . .

(*Editor's Note*: See, however, *Fornara v. Schroeder* 261 N. Y. 363, where the contrary rule was adopted under the terms of the New York Civil Service Law.)

## ALLEGATION OF FRAUD IN INDUCING RESIGNATION

**I**N *Moreno v. Cairns*, 118 Pac. (2d) 357 (Cal. Dist. Ct. App.), the relator, seeking a writ of mandamus to compel his reinstatement as assistant fire chief of the city of Los Angeles, alleged in his complaint that he had resigned from the service under duress and by fraud, since he was threatened by the appointing authorities with summary discharge and consequent loss of pension rights unless he resigned. The court held the complaint insufficient. Although the city charter prohibits removals without good and sufficient cause it specifically excepts resignations. The court held that the instant resignation was not induced by fraud or duress. Petitioner alleged no facts showing that the threatened summary discharge, in the absence of his resignation, would have been illegal. The appointing authorities had mentioned the abolition of certain fire service positions. "It is not alleged and is not now claimed that either the statement of the effect of a discharge on pension rights, or that regarding the prospective elimination of positions, was not true, and the other statement, that he would be discharged if he did not resign, was not a statement of fact. Hence the charge of fraud cannot be supported...." Since there was no allegation that the proposed abolition of positions was not in good faith, the charge of duress was held without merit. The resignation was voluntary, and petitioner had no reinstatement right.

## SUSPENSION OF RULES IN REINSTATEMENT

**I**N *Campbell v. City of Los Angeles*, 117 Pac. (2d) 900 (Cal. Dist. Ct. App.), the court held that where a rule of a municipal civil service

commission prohibits reinstatement of an employee after he has left the service for more than one year, the commission has no power to suspend the operation of the rule in favor of any particular employee. "After their adoption, the (civil service) board's power to modify them may be exercised only in conformity with the prescribed mode. Not a word in the charter suggests the investment of a board with the power to suspend a rule." The court therefore held that an employee who had been reinstated after nine years' separation from the service was illegally reinstated, and "it was the duty of the board of public works to discontinue his employment promptly upon discovering its illegality," even though, in this case, the illegality of the reinstatement was discovered some four years later.

Furthermore, the failure of the petitioner to comply with the charter provision requiring a "demand for reinstatement" within 90 days after his discharge bars his right to relief. (Petitioner filed his demand 91 days after his discharge.) "Charter provisions and statutes which require that claims be filed as conditions precedent to the maintenance of actions against municipalities are mandatory."

Finally, petitioner was guilty of laches in that this proceeding seeking mandamus to compel his reinstatement was started fifteen months after the discharge. "Unless facts be alleged which constitute a sound excuse for a delay of fifteen months, such delay in commencing the action is absolutely indefensible. One must proceed with diligence who would compel his reinstatement to a civil service position from which he has been discharged."

## BOOK REVIEWS

LIBRARY  
C.P.D.

**The New Centralization.** George C. S. Benson.  
Farrar & Rinehart. New York, 1941. xxi,  
182p. \$1.50.

The presentation of one of the major problems of our national life in a clear, objective, and succinct fashion is always a praiseworthy accomplishment. Professor Benson has done this for the problem of the allocation of functions among the three levels of American government—federal, state, and local—and the relationships between the units of government.

In a series of chapters titled respectively, "The Present Pattern of Federal and State Powers," "Direct Federal Activities," "Federal Grants-in-Aid," "Federal-Local Relations," "The Place of the States," and "State-Local Relationships," the author describes the current activities of our governmental units and their relationships with each other. Two preceding chapters, "The Brief for Decentralization," and the "Weaknesses of Decentralization," give the reader the principal criteria for appraising current trends in our federal system. In "Proposals for Readjustment," Professor Benson discusses the suggestions of various groups and individuals urging major reallocations of functions and a redrawing of the pattern of governmental units—further extensions of federal powers, regionalism of the Odum school, interstate and federal-state cooperation, and reconstruction of the multitudinous units of local government. The concluding chapter of the book summarizes some of the changes in our federal system which seem to be at once desirable and feasible. An epilogue presents a twelve-point program for American decentralization.

The theme of the book might be stated in this way: Under the pressure of events we have been moving planlessly toward a new centralization that threatens our traditional federal

system. Dangers lie in rapid steps toward either decentralization or greater centralization. We are reminded that "the outstanding charge leveled at decentralization is that of inefficiency; the outstanding charge leveled at centralization is tyranny." If we wish "efficiency plus safety—which seems to be the common goal—readjustments on all levels of government are essential."

One readjustment urgently required is more efficient administration of public services at the state level of government. In large part this is a matter of better personnel. Administrative offices filled for short terms by election, the spoils system, and inadequate salaries prevent many states from developing into efficient units of government. Under the grants-in-aid system—and Professor Benson prefers block rather than specific functional grants—the federal government can promote the improvement of state personnel administration. However, such action should take the form of requiring merit systems meeting certain essential criteria and not of interference with individual appointments or professional standards established by a Washington bureau. "The federal agency may well insist that appointments be made only from eligible registers, that 'political' removals be eliminated, and that the examining and appointing process be free from discriminating factors. On the other hand, states should be able to adopt personnel systems suited to local conditions, and they should be permitted to experiment quite freely with different technical and administrative devices." The author commends the Social Security Board method as the most desirable among the present means of personnel control under the grants-in-aid system.

It is too early to forecast many of the effects

of the war upon our federal system, but even a minor prophet can see that such problems as home security, rationing, movements of industrial workers and communities born of war plants will make exceptional demands upon state and local governments. The efforts to deal with these problems will be complicated by shortages of labor and professional talent, by scarcities in materials and equipment, and by rising prices and growing tax burdens. Fumbling and inept administration, tolerable in peace, may be disastrous in a fight for survival. When considering some of the readjustments deemed necessary by Professor Benson and others, the governing authorities and the citizens in our numerous political units should recall that "too little and too late" may result in more than military debacles.

HIRAM M. STOUT

Military Intelligence Division  
United States War Department

**The Mobilization of the Home Front. The British Experience and Its Significance for the United States.** A report by Eric H. Biddle for the American Public Welfare Association. Public Administration Service, 1942, Publication No. 81, 47p. \$6o.

This brochure, written by an American administrator who had the opportunity to observe at first hand the developments in British civilian administration from September, 1940 to July, 1941 (a period of intense aerial warfare), is an enlightening and instructive document. The author is well aware that it would be foolhardy to attempt to parallel in the United States all the reforms undertaken by the British to increase the efficiency of their relatively decentralized governmental structure and relatively uncontrolled labor markets for a total war effort. He believes, however, that we can profit by the British experience, both by studying what the British did and what they failed to do.

The position of England *vis a vis* Germany and Italy was one of acute vulnerability from the air, a military machine highly inadequate for aggressive warfare, and severe shortages in raw materials and labor for the efficient operation of the armed services and war industries. Mr. Biddle concentrates on outlining the adjustments that the British made to the predicament in which they found themselves after the

fall of France. Failure of the United States to learn from the experience of others would be serious, for this country must save time and resources if it is to accomplish with the aid of its allies the defeat of the Axis powers. But there is another danger, one against which Mr. Biddle fails to guard sufficiently, of this country following the British uncritically. In the past, the United States has suffered as much from an uncritical acceptance of British policy as it has from a failure to learn from successful British experiments. Mr. Hoover's enamourment of balanced budgets and his fear of work relief programs were surely strongly influenced by British thought and policy. But if we are fully on our guard, we can profit greatly from Mr. Biddle's analysis of the British experience.

Highly relevant is the analysis of the British approach to manpower mobilization. In England, the labor supply is viewed as a unity and the Ministry of Labor and National Service has been charged with the responsibility for allocating it among the armed services, war industries, and the civilian sectors. The bifurcation between the military and civilian procurement of manpower, typical of the last war, has been ended, but not before the British suffered from much wasteful volunteering and indiscriminate drafting. In no phase of our war effort are we more backward than in the development of an orderly and integrated system of manpower mobilization. General Hershey recently remarked that we are repeating step by step the mistakes that we made in World War I. Clearly, the principle of "Selective Service" should be expanded to include civilian placement in essential non-military services, and there is no reason to fear public disapproval of such extension. Both in England and in this country, government officials are prone to underestimate the good sense and willing cooperation of the citizenry in the war effort.

In seeking to maximize the efficiency of its labor supply, the British government established new training centers, enlarged old ones, and introduced widespread subsidies for laborers chosen to attend these centers, either to acquire basic skills or to improve skills previously acquired. At first, relatively little attention was paid to women as a potential labor reserve. When it was recognized that women could be used in almost every sector where acute shortages existed, efforts were made to

secure their voluntary entrance into the labor market. Volunteering broke down, but when conscription was employed, it was readily accepted.

In the successful overcoming of the German blitz, morale on the home front played a role second only to that of the R.A.F. Biddle deals at length with the strategic importance of civilian services in a modern war, for if the home front breaks the war is lost. The British experience emphasizes that the maintenance of social services is not sufficient if one desires to cope successfully with the stresses and strains precipitated by war. Some services must be expanded so that new difficulties can be adequately handled.

Probably the United States will be spared many of the problems that the British had to grapple with in protecting the civilian population from air attacks. But there is little doubt that this country will see widespread movements of people in response to the needs of war industries; that family structures will be upset by the employment of mothers and the drafting of fathers; and that many will be affected adversely by the increasing hours and stress of work at a time when consumption will be restricted. Biddle points out, however, that despite inevitable shortages of people and supplies, these new stresses and strains can be overcome, and occasionally even long-time reforms furthered, if government, national and local, is operated imaginatively. But more important than vision is faith—faith in victory and in the future so strong that it fears not the sacrifice of fortune, prestige, and comfort in the successful prosecution of the war.

ELI GINZBERG

Columbia University  
New York City

**Employee Relations in the Public Service.** A report submitted to the Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada by the Committee on Employee Relations in the Public Service. Gordon R. Clapp, Chairman. Civil Service Assembly. Chicago. 1942. xv, 246p. \$3.00.

This volume is one of the series of reports on major aspects of public personnel administration prepared by committees appointed by the president of the Civil Service Assembly in pursuance of action taken by the executive council

of that organization in 1937. Field studies of more than a score of public personnel agencies and jurisdictions conducted by a special Assembly staff furnished factual data and informed opinion concerning policies and practices to the several functional committees. Aided by other materials gathered by the Assembly's Headquarters Office, by consultations with persons and groups acquainted with the problems under investigation, and by their own expert knowledge and familiarity with prevailing practice and ideology, the committees, acting through their chairmen, have been charged with the responsibility of preparing qualitative as well as quantitative syntheses of the most desirable policies and practices on particular phases of personnel management. The committee which is responsible for the report on Employee Relations, under the able guidance and authorship of its chairman, Gordon R. Clapp, General Manager of the Tennessee Valley Authority, has discharged its assignment with remarkable fidelity and has produced a volume which will commend itself to every governmental administrator, personnel officer, and student of administration who is alert to the vital importance of the subject.

The immediate objectives of the report are set forth as follows (p. 2): "It [the report] attempts to identify the facts, problems, and major issues which stand out in prevailing thought and discussion, to present the pros and cons of these issues by those who have observed and studied them, and from such running debate attempts to point to conclusions where possible or unresolved questions where necessary." Such an inquiry is deemed of major importance because "the quality of those [employee] relations determines the effectiveness of the staff above the minimum of mere exertion" (p. 5). An introductory statement of the nature and significance of employee relations in the public service is followed by chapters devoted to organizations of government employees and their activities and objectives, the status of the government as an employer, legislative and administrative policies regarding employee organization, the particular areas where collective dealing between management and employees may take place, and the role of the personnel agency in employee relations. A closing chapter summarizes and restates the conclusions and observations which have been

drawn from past and present theory and practice, and points the way toward future thinking and experimentation.

In these several chapters, the report deals with a wide range of topics. A few of these are: the extent of employee organization in national, state, and local government; the affiliation of government employee associations with organized labor; the attitude of employee organizations toward the merit system and such specific issues as seniority and tenure; traditional concepts concerning government as an employer; restrictive legislation governing the individual and collective acts of public employees; administrative attitudes and practices with reference to dealing with employees and their representatives; strikes; the closed shop; procedures for handling grievances; the functions of an employee relations staff within the personnel agency; and the division of responsibility between personnel officers and line administrators for the cultivation and maintenance of satisfactory employee relations.

The reader of this significant volume will very quickly sense the liberal attitude taken by the committee and its chairman toward government employee organizations and their activities. Such associations are recognized as being essential to an effective system of employee representation. Affiliation with organized labor has certain advantages both to the employees and to the public, and at any rate is a matter to be decided by the employees without denial either by statute or administrative refusal to negotiate with affiliated groups. The concept of the government as an employer whose sovereignty must not be challenged by employee action is seriously questioned. Legislative or administrative prohibition of strikes is not deemed wise on the score either of necessity or enforceability, and strong preference is indicated for a positive policy of providing specific methods for settling disputes. Judgment on the merits of the closed shop or the union shop is withheld until their legality and theoretical implications can be explored further and their results in practice more accurately appraised.

The report, in its conclusions on some of these controversial matters, is in rather sharp contrast with the report of the Committee on Government Labor Relations of the National Civil Service Reform League (see *Good Government*, May-June, 1941, pp. 21-23). It is at

this point that the committee clearly has ventured to "project beyond present policies and practices to more desirable or acceptable ones" (p. viii).

This extremely valuable and provocative report deserves a wide reading. It treats an extensive range of topics and materials thoroughly and interestingly. The advantages and disadvantages of certain policies and practices are explored critically but fairly. Those who wish to study various aspects of the subject further will find the report extensively documented and supplemented by an excellent bibliography.

LLOYD M. SHORT

University of Minnesota  
Minneapolis, Minnesota

**Municipal Management.** Thomas Harrison Reed. McGraw-Hill Book Company, Inc., New York and London. 1941. xii, 665p. \$4.00.

This book tells how to get a job done. That job is the intensely practical one of running a city. Unfortunately, however, too many of the general works on the administration of city government tackle the subject in a kid-glove, academic, or legalistic fashion. This criticism cannot be made of *Municipal Management*, which deals directly with down-to-earth questions of the kind most often confronting mayors, city managers, and department executives.

With an altogether adequate academic background, the author draws upon his extensive experience as municipal administrator and consultant to give a blow-by-blow account of the battle for sound practices of municipal administration. The book is punctuated with vivid phraseology which definitely is in keeping with the vitality of subject matter covered.

The book holds special interest for personnel technicians and administrators. They will find it instructive to review other management functions in relation to their own. The forty-five page Chapter XII on "Selection, Training, and Management of Personnel," while not a handbook in any sense of the word, does give a pointed overview evaluation of municipal personnel administration in this country. The swift moving account gives least attention to service ratings, classification, and payroll certification, the last-named being regarded as a purely routine function of the personnel agency. Other personnel activities are handled

in a way that should challenge the thinking of those engaged in this field.

Without attempting to digest this chapter, a few of Dr. Reed's observations on personnel administration may whet the reader's intellectual appetite. Although admitting advances, he declares "The disappointing thing is that it still falls so far short of perfection." Improvements in examining would-be civil servants fail to obtain a satisfactory supply of career men for posts of highest responsibility; examinations, while successfully testing abilities for higher posts, are still aimed almost exclusively at filling particular positions.

The single headed department of personnel should be introduced with caution; ". . . in its earliest promotion stage, civil service reform may still require the services of a strong, independent commission." Appointment of an independent director of personnel through competitive examination by a body specially set up for that purpose, while an ingenuous method, results in making a personnel director responsible to no one. "In conception of complete removal from political influence which underlies (such methods of appointment), they run directly counter to the fundamental principles of democratic government." Dr. Reed believes there is no reason why the office of personnel director under a civil service commission should not itself be subject to civil service regulations. The recent development of organizations among municipal employees is fraught with gravest consequences to municipal management. Dr. Reed suggests that the employee who has secure tenure and pension rights assured under a good municipal personnel system is in a more satisfactory status than that of union members under the national or state labor relations acts. There are advantages to the municipal administrator, however, in dealing with a few leaders rather than thousands of individuals, but these leaders must be enlightened.

The bulk of the book covers the major aspects of municipal management. The administration of elections and justice are omitted completely because they are not in reality local functions. After devoting two brief chapters to the role of management in municipal affairs and the types of municipal organization, the author gives five chapters to basic administrative relationships. These include the part played by the council, the relation of the executive to the

public, to the council and his department heads, and the interrelation of governmental units. Chapters on the fundamentals of municipal management, as well as the management of the various service functions of a municipality, combine to make the volume remarkably comprehensive in its coverage.

This book provides stimulating reading alike for on-the-job executives, and students who are preparing for careers in municipal administration. It is more than "just another book." It "gives you the works" without overdocumentation but with an adequate selected bibliography for further and more specialized study. But best of all, *Municipal Management* has pith and punch. The book breaths life into the flesh and bones of local government administration.

KENNETH O. WARNER

Department of Political Science  
University of Tennessee, Knoxville

**Administrative Procedure.** A Practical Handbook for the Administrative Analyst. Comstock Glaser. American Council on Public Affairs. Washington, D. C. 1941. 207 p. \$3.00.

From a man who has personally grappled with administrative problems in government, we have a clear, concise enumeration of administrative analytical techniques. The book is valuable to the student entering the field of administration in providing a helpful framework upon which experience may be built. To the administrator it will be a device against which performance may be measured.

As an unique and much needed contribution to the field of public administration the book deals with "processes of administration and the anatomy of administrative organizations." The author avoids treatment of underlying political philosophy in one extreme and the content of programs or activities in another. Instead, basic organizational problems are analyzed and solutions are developed, illustrated with cases.

To realize the need for an adequate treatment of the subject it is necessary only to consider the oft repeated statement, "We Americans have a flair for organization." A simple tabulation of the frequency of major reorganizations in any branch of government or unit of industry would lead one to question the assertion which tends to give us a false sense of security. The recurrence of failure in admin-

istration due to basic organizational defects must spur us on to more careful consideration of elements which soon must approach the reality of physical laws if we are to retain the democratic way of life.

The author points out that scientific management as applied to productive operations in industry requires the standardization of human behavior and the study and correlation of facts so as to facilitate, coordinate, and simplify work. While techniques of measuring mental output and the effects of human interrelationships are much harder to develop than the measurement of manual operations such must be the objective of the administrative analyst.

The scope of administrative procedure includes several important phases: *planning*—deciding what is to be done; *execution*—giving orders, instructions, and supervision; and *control*—seeing that the work is done according to plan. *Coordination*, or seeing that individuals do not work at cross-purposes extends to all phases of administrative procedure when large numbers of people are involved.

Various types of administrative analysis form the subjects of several chapters and indicate methods of studying the bases of facts upon which management planning must be built. "Analysis by Function" included the familiar line and staff grouping. "Analysis by Units of Organization" approaches the problem through attention to methods, flow of work and other factors which may not result in usual line and staff relationships. The third method developed is "Analysis by Administrative Sequence," which considers the objective of arranging the tasks and transfers between them so as to achieve the desired end result with a minimum of time and effort. The three types of analysis are essential and complementary. If all three are not taken into account the results may not be those desired.

Chapters on "Organization and Procedure," and "Administrative (Program) Planning" naturally follow the analytical processes by outlining techniques of building an operating structure. In the former chapter particularly are many of the searching questions which should be asked and answered and guiding principles which should be observed in setting up a new organization.

The personnel administrator and technician should be especially interested in the chapter,

"Administrative Execution—Personnel." As also in the preceding chapter, "Administrative Execution—Purchasing," many important considerations are developed regarding the relationship of central service agencies to the other departments and branches of government. Although it is rather unfortunate that at this point the author dealt directly with the Procurement Division and the Civil Service Commission as the central agencies of the federal government, the reader can without too much difficulty translate this experience to other levels of government.

The importance of continuous management planning and its role as an aid to the administrator are developed at some length. The establishment of such an activity as a distinct and legitimate phase of administration has been generally recognized. The author definitely emphasizes the caution that the administrative analyst should not attempt to formulate programs and policies. Responsibility for shaping policy rests with the legislature or board of directors, and responsibility for establishing programs of execution rest with the administrator. The administrative analyst advises as to the best functional and hierarchical arrangement of officials and plans channels through which work flows. The closing chapter rounds out a program of administrative procedure.

Although the book carries the subtitle "A Practical Handbook for the Administrative Analyst," it should be required reading and a ready source of helpful information to the personnel examiner, classification technician, and administrator, and to the operating official.

ROLLAND D. SEVERY

War Production Board  
Washington, D. C.

**History of the Federal Civil Service.** United States Civil Service Commission. Government Printing Office. Washington, D. C. 1941. 162p. \$25.

It is always a little difficult for those of us who are accustomed to a federal civil service system to realize the full impact of the spoils system in the history of the federal government, and to understand the long and hard road that was traversed by the early civil service reformers. For the first time we are now permitted to see the full sweep of the civil service

reform movement, from the founding of the Republic to the present day. The United States Civil Service Commission, and particularly M. Barris Taylor of that staff, are to be congratulated on presenting the story. The occasional photographs by Robert T. Frank, Jr., and by staff members of other federal agencies, serve primarily to make the reader wish that more had been included.

Many persons are familiar in broad outline with the high standards of personnel selection set by the early Presidents, notably Washington and Adams. Familiar also is the growth of the Jacksonian philosophy that the establishment of a bureaucracy is antithetical to democracy, a philosophy that immediately proved an apt instrument of corruption. The phrase "to the victor belong the spoils" is attributed to Senator William L. Marcy of New York in a senatorial debate over the appointment of Martin Van Buren as minister to Great Britain. This was in 1832, at the beginning of Jackson's second term, and it is interesting to note that Van Buren's appointment was bitterly attacked and defeated, primarily on the ground that he had been the person under Jackson responsible for the introduction of the spoils system.

The first effort at regulation of the federal civil service was in 1853 when Congress established four "grades" or "classes" of clerks in certain of the executive departments, and required "pass" examinations for these classes. Although the "pass" examinations were non-competitive and often were a mere formality, they helped to lay the ground work for the competitive examinations which were first introduced under Grant in 1872, and placed on a permanent basis by the historic Pendleton Act of 1883. In the meantime, patronage was rampant. Even under Lincoln, who at one time said of the spoils system, "There you see something which in the course of time will become a greater danger to the Republic than the rebellion itself," a larger percentage of removals was made than under any other American President. "Practically every Presidential office in the control of the Federal Government changed hands at least once, and some many times between 1861 and 1865." Few persons realize that not one, but two, presidents lost their lives through the spoils system. The illness of Harrison, who died a month after his inauguration, is attributed by many historians to swarms of

office seekers camping on his doorstep and making wearing demands and counter-demands.

Because of the necessity to crowd the experience of 152 years into 140 pages, detail has been sacrificed, particularly in the more recent periods. The chapter on "The Merit System Today, 1933-1941" seems unduly condensed in view of its importance not only in the light of important extensions under the Ramspeck-O'Mahoney Postmaster Act, the Hatch Acts, the Ramspeck Act of 1940, and the Executive Orders of June 24, 1938 and January 31, 1939, but also by virtue of the transition from a negative to a positive program of personnel management. This criticism is waived, however, in the face of the liberties accorded a dramatist who is presenting a well-staged production. The plot is the growth and decline of the spoils system, accompanied by the rising tide of the merit system; the villains are there, and so are the fair-haired boys; and the audience is left with the feeling "They all lived happily ever after under civil service."

There have been other publications dealing with various phases of federal civil service history, many of which are mentioned in a concluding bibliographical note. Perhaps the best of these are Carl Russell Fish's *The Civil Service and Patronage* on the years prior to 1883; A. B. Sagesar's Ph.D. thesis at the University of Nebraska in 1935 on *The First Two Years of the Pendleton Act: a Study of Civil Service Reform*; and William Dudley Foulke, one-time member of the Civil Service Commission, on the period from 1900 to 1916 in his *Fighting the Spoilsman*, a volume which is not included in the Commission's bibliography. At the present time, a Ph.D. thesis is under way at the University of Chicago to bring the history of civil service reform up to date in its many details, an important task that the Commission did not even attempt to tackle. Their job, rather, was a bird's eye picture, and in this an excellent contribution to personnel literature has been made.

JEAN CHARTERS GRAHAM

University of Chicago  
Chicago, Illinois

**Model City Charter. Fifth Revised Edition.**  
Committee on Revision of the Model City Charter. National Municipal League, 299 Broadway, New York City. 1941. 141p. \$1.00.

The fifth edition of the Model City Charter of the National Municipal League attempts to bring municipal administration up to a reasonable state of idealism tempered with practicality. The main theme is still the council-city manager plan which has probably made greater contribution toward the solution of the problem of management of municipal affairs than any other single technique of local government. It is not surprising, therefore, to learn from the prefatory statement that over 500 cities throughout the nation are already operating under the League's model city charter.

As its sponsors point out, the plan of the charter is based on the "concept of entrusting administration to men trained in municipal management, which concept in turn assumes the building up of a profession of management." It is modestly claimed that this assumption has already been realized. Undoubtedly much progress has been made, but we wonder whether this optimism is based on wishful thinking rather than on the record of achievement in this field. Perhaps we may be excused for this somewhat sour note because of the failure of this progress to materialize in the selection of civil service commissioners in municipalities. We have made far more headway in attracting better qualified and experienced city managers than we have civil service commissioners, although we have gone a considerable way in educating the public to the need of professional expertise in the appointment of personnel administrators.

However, it is in the personnel sections of the charter that we are here particularly interested, and in that direction the new charter provides a comprehensive merit system under the aegis of an appointed professional city manager who is required to be an expert in matters of municipal administration. A personnel department is established at the head of which is a personnel director appointed by the city manager and responsible directly to him. There is also a personnel board whose functions are solely advisory, although the board may in some cases disapprove recommendations made by the personnel director, such as in the cases of adoption and amendment of civil service rules, classifications of positions and appeals. Basically the personnel provisions follow the general pattern of the model state civil service law developed in 1939 by the National Civil

Service Reform League, the National Municipal League, and the Civil Service Assembly.

Coming directly to the provisions for the personnel department itself, we find a few innovations. The importance of personnel administration in municipal administration is indicated by the fact that the personnel agency is set up as a department of city government rather than as a division of the budget office or an adjunct of the city manager's office. This is a distinct departure from earlier theories of personnel administration long advocated by the doctors of municipal government. The competitive examination system is made applicable solely to the "administrative service" of the city. Just why it was found necessary to restrict it to this service alone is somewhat obscure, particularly as the competitive system is to be applied only "so far as practicable." With specific enumeration in the Charter of positions in the unclassified service one wonders all the more at the necessity for this new departure from applicability to the entire city service rather than just the "administrative service." Where does the "administrative service" begin and end?

The pretense of securing nonpartisanship through bipartisanship has been abandoned. The personnel board is to be chosen by the city council without reference to the political affiliations of the members of the board. They are to serve for overlapping terms of six years and may be removed by the council after a written statement of charges and a public hearing, if requested. It is gratifying, too, to find that the need for prohibiting members of the personnel board from partisan political activity is recognized, and that the same general prohibitions are applied to all employees in the classified service of the city.

It is of questionable wisdom, however, to have the council approve the civil service rules or amendments thereto. While there are substantial reasons for requiring its approval of the salary plans, and possibly the original classification plan, there appears no good reason for dragging the city council into the rule-making function. If it is logical to have the council approve the original rules, there is equal logic in requiring it to approve amendments to the rules recommended from time to time. Yet that is not required. The approval of the rules should be left to the personnel board, and not

to the council. The same criticism may be made of the requirement that the city council must approve every change in the classification plan.

It is required that promotions be made, wherever practicable, by competitive tests, although the city manager may open the tests to persons not in the city service. Whether the city employees are to be granted priority in appointment under the latter arrangement is apparently left an open issue.

The model personnel system advocated in the new charter is a reasonably comprehensive and workable plan that meets practically all the essentials for a sound merit system for a municipality operating under a council-city manager or strong mayor plan. It fits in well with a model city charter that is an improvement over its earlier drafts in many respects.

It is noteworthy that the committee on revision has not a single representative of business or industry on it. Is it because it is believed there is little such persons could contribute to the problem of municipal management?

H. ELIOT KAPLAN

National Civil Service Reform League  
New York City

**Training and Recruiting of Personnel in the Rural Social Studies.** Theodore W. Schultz, and Lawrence W. Witt. American Council on Education, Washington, D. C. 1941. 340p. \$3.00.

As might be expected of a volume dealing with this subject, this book's interest is reserved primarily for rural social scientists. Others may find the report something less than "stimulating and useful," as the foreword promises.

However, persons concerned with rural social studies (rural social scientists) should find quite useful the data on departmental and institutional organization (Chapter II), on financial resources available to agricultural economics and rural sociology (Chapter III), and on personnel and financial resources in the federal service (Chapter VI). This material is informational and statistically thorough to the point of being exhaustive. Several sound observations are drawn from it, namely that land-grant colleges and universities would do well to coordinate research, teaching, and extension, possibly in one department, and that budgets

for rural social studies are inadequate where the work is needed most—in the South and in the Plains and Intermountain Region.

Concerning other portions of the volume, it appears doubtful whether the reader will derive much benefit from the recommendations on how to improve recruiting and training of personnel in the rural social studies. These recommendations have a peculiarly evasive quality. None is made without a subsequent qualification, usually a foot-note, that leaves the reader about where he was before.

It seems, for example, that many workers in this field, particularly in the federal service, have not had enough graduate training, and that perhaps their undergraduate work was deficient. But they should beware the opprobrium of degree-seeking. Some institutions are suffering from too rapid turnover, others from not enough. These latter are given to inbreeding. Again, the shortcomings of civil service procedure hamper entrance of rural social scientists into the federal service, yet the writers think it might be a good thing if civil service examinations were used for staffing college departments.

We are led to suspect that the pronounced disinclination of the authors of this report to be caught in a positive, unqualified statement is the result of the report being a cooperative effort, rather than the work of one man. Almost everyone having to do with this subject was canvassed for his opinion, and most of the opinions were included in the report. This book, and most books written under similar conditions, occasionally suffer from a lack of incisiveness.

In spite of its drawbacks, the report makes a number of observations that bear consideration, particularly by personnel workers. The need for annual leave with pay for further study is one, and the dangers of too great devotion to promotion from within is another. And for students of the rural social studies, the need for better acquaintance with the tools and techniques of analysis, and the ability to evaluate and communicate results in writing and speaking should be taken to heart.

THOMAS E. STREET

Office of Personnel  
U. S. Department of Agriculture

---

# ARTICLE ABSTRACTS

---

LIBRARY  
C.P.D.

---

## PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION— GENERAL ASPECTS

23. Gallup, George H. **Drafting the nation's brain power.** *National Municipal Review* 31 (1) January, 1942: 11-17.—From six years of directing the interviewing of many hundreds of thousands of American citizens, representing all walks of life, has come the opportunity to examine their opinions and comments on vital social, political, and economic issues of the day. The experience convinces one that the common people possess an amazing degree of intelligence and common sense. They are willing to make far greater sacrifice for their country than they have yet been called upon to do. Two out of every three persons would be willing to serve, without pay, on committees dealing with important problems. Seven out of every ten successful professional and business persons would gladly take time from their own busy pursuits to serve their communities. The political and partisan approach to virtually all our problems gives us the poor local government we have despite this willingness to serve. We have found that the two-party system works best here, but have weakly accepted the theory that the system can be kept strong and vital only by party machines maintained by political despilers. There is ample evidence otherwise for we have now reached the point where ideas and opposing political philosophies form the basis of our two-party system. We should work for the extension of the Hatch Act and merit system laws. Citizens should make it a habit of splitting their tickets. National party names should not be used in local elections, and local and national elections should be on different dates. Our procedure should be to call upon the best equipped men in every community in America to devote their time to the study and solution of our community problems and we must take far greater advantage of the experiments which are going on throughout the land to solve these same problems. We must accelerate and encourage the movement of our best brains into solving our problems. This can be specially done by: (1) expanding the movement to every community in

America; (2) give citizen groups quasi-official standing; (3) see to it that serving on such committees is one of the highest honors in the community; (4) have the findings of these groups fully reported on and brought to the attention of everyone in the community; (5) have clerical, reporting, and other minor costs borne by taxation; (6) develop fullest possible cooperation from local and state officeholders; and (7) have national recognition given the individuals and groups who make the greatest contribution. Local experiments should be given nation-wide publicity, something they are not receiving now. In dealing with all our multiple problems, we have never yet brought to bear our greatest force—our untapped resource—the brains of our people.—*Ray L. Wilbur, Jr.*

24. Murphy, Kathryn R., and Gordon, Melton M. **Federal personnel by types of work performed, June 1940 and 1941.** *Monthly Labor Review* 53 (6) December, 1941: 1361-1367. This article is prepared as a joint undertaking by the Bureau of Labor Statistics and the United States Civil Service Commission. It is a continuous study started in 1941 of the fluctuation of employment in the federal government. Employment in the federal government shows a large increase since June, 1940, due primarily to national defense activities. There have been also marked shifts in the proportion of workers engaged in the various functions of the federal government. In June 1940, 47 per cent of federal employees were engaged in national defense activities; one year later, the percentage increased to 73 per cent. The armed forces accounted for 32 per cent of the personnel in June 1940, and was increased to 56 per cent in June 1941. The percentage of workers in activities other than national defense was 53 per cent in June 1940, and had decreased to 27 per cent in June 1941. However, the actual number of employees working on non-defense activities increased 7 per cent. Non-defense employees are classified into fifteen major groups, such as: general government, law enforcement, public works, conservation and development, agriculture, etc. The largest pro-

portionate increase was in law enforcement, having 48 per cent more workers in June 1941 than in June 1940. There was also an increase in the number of employees in such groups as: public works, education and reference services, labor and industrial relations, general government, regulatory services, health, and postal service. There was a decrease in the number of employees in such major functions as: general information and research, agriculture, welfare, Indian affairs, conservation and development. The combined effect of the increase in governmental personnel is as follows: 7 per cent increase in the number of employees in non-defense activities; 127 per cent increase in civilian defense activities; and 267 per cent increase in the armed services. In June 1940 there were 1,496,000 employees with a monthly payroll of \$184,860,000. In June 1941 there were 3,119,000 federal employees with a monthly payroll of \$312,583,000. The figures reported do not include such activities as: Works Progress Administration, National Youth Administration, and Civilian Conservation Corps. The results of the study are summarized in two tables. One gives the number of employees in the major categories and shows the percentage of increase or decrease between 1940 and 1941; the other table shows the percentage distribution of employees by number of personnel and payroll costs.—*Francis King*.

25. Probst, John B. **The values of an adequate civil service system.** *Journal of the American Waterworks Association* 33 (9) September, 1941: 1591-1595. (A paper presented on June 25, 1941, at the Toronto Convention of the American Water Works Association.)—An "adequate" civil service means merit as reflected in the employee's all-around performance on the job. There are very few real merit systems in public personnel administration. Most of them are merely "civil service" systems. An "adequate" civil service system does not rest upon veteran's preference or an inflexible seniority system as the sole determining factor for various administrative actions. Nor is "adequate" civil service possible if the higher jobs must be filled by men who are deficient in requisite qualities, or if the law does not permit reasonable discretion in maintaining discipline or in effecting separations of below-average employees. For the real executive who welcomes reasonable restrictions on his own discretionary powers in order to save him from himself, a merit system can offer freedom from political influence and pressure in dealing with employees, more time for constructive work in better administration, and a better opportunity to maintain continuity of good personnel policies and practices. Without an adequate civil service system a good manager of a water department cannot know whether his employees are being properly recruited or tested, whether the

problem of salaries and wages is being properly met, and whether the best qualified people are being promoted to vacancies in higher ranks. Even where a water department may be administered at present by a board and a superintendent who believe in and practice the true principles of the merit system, there is no assurance that the same personnel policies will be continued by the next or future water boards and superintendents. With a civil service merit system such desirable policies would be retained and would provide "going concern" value regardless of changes in management. Civil service has the advantages of providing appointments made from eligible lists, which takes away the incentive and the opportunity for an official to appoint friends, or relatives, or political followers, or to appoint hundreds of unnecessary persons by creating many unnecessary jobs and titles. Adequate civil service provides for equitable salaries and fair working conditions through the adoption of common sense workable rules. All this means economy and better qualified personnel. Present day civil service may not be the final answer for the most successful public personnel administration but until a better plan emerges the best alternative is an adequate civil service merit system.—*Harry Albert*.

26. Unsigned. **Administrative codes, rules, and regulations** *Public Management* XXXIV, (1) January, 1942: 13-18.—The main objective of administrative manuals, regulations, orders, and memoranda is for instructional and informational purposes aimed at guiding and facilitating management. These so-called directives are backed by the authority of the city manager and relate to organization and to administrative methods. Since they are not matters of lawmaking, legalistic forms should be avoided, and formalization need go only to the point of providing an orderly system of preparing and issuing these materials. There is a distinct advantage in bringing certain materials together in an *administrative code* or ordinance prepared under the direction of the city manager for adoption by the council. The code would outline the major structure of the administrative organization, the functions of the departments and the duties of the chief officials, and establish the essentials of certain important procedures. Finally, the code should authorize the manager to issue and enforce such administrative regulations, in addition to those embodied in the charter and code, as are necessary for the effective functioning of all departments. *Administrative manuals* are comprehensive guides for administrative action and are intended especially for employees. They provide a basis for a common understanding as to the meaning of the charter and responsibilities and duties of the employees. Manuals must be written in the light of what is administratively feasible. Manuals may be

prepared under the direction of the manager to cover details common to all departments, or by a department head to cover the operations of his own department. In medium-sized and small cities the manager may find that one general manual of administrative practice can be prepared to cover a variety of matters. *Administrative regulations* relate to general administrative policy and procedure, and are prepared for the continuing guidance of employees. General administrative regulations cover matters which have to do with the internal administration of the several departments. They are issued on the basis of authority provided in the charter or administrative code and establish uniform principles or practices for the entire administration on many different subjects. Minor matters of administration may be handled by memorandums from the city manager, and every department head should be furnished with copies of all administrative regulations and general memorandums as issued. In addition, department heads should be authorized to prescribe regulations for the conduct of their own departments. There is another group of written regulations affecting the rights and behavior of citizens, or dealing with the substance of general policy which may be called *ordinance rules and regulations*. Modern conditions have made it difficult, if not impossible, for the city council to care for all details of legislation; and in local, as well as in the state and national field, there is a trend toward delegating to administrative officers power to issue interpretative rules and regulations which have the force of law. These rules and regulations should take up where the ordinance leaves off, supplying the forms and secondary procedures to aid and guide the citizen who seeks a service to which he is entitled. Since these ordinance rules and regulations affect the conduct of citizens and have the force and effect of ordinances, with penalties resulting from failure to comply, they constitute subordinate legislation, and generally must be approved by the council before becoming effective. It is desirable to distinguish clearly between the kinds of documents issued, and each type should be identified as to whether it is a general administrative regulation, a departmental rule, or whether it is an ordinance rule or regulation affecting citizens.—Charles H. Bentley.

27. Unsigned. **The direction and control of activities.** *Public Management* 23 (11) November, 1941; 334-39.—Effective direction and control of city manager activities are essential if the manager's responsibility is to be properly achieved. Methods of obtaining these desiderata are outlined in this, the third, article of the International City Manager's Association surveying practices followed by 20 city managers. Among the methods used to develop the initiative of department heads are: urging the de-

partment heads to affiliate with their professional groups; referring to them literature; encouraging them to offer suggestions for improving procedures; analyzing reports from departments for information upon which a basis for discussing problems and methods is obtained; commending department heads when they achieve improvement; requesting department heads to work out the details of plans for review and approval by the manager; defending the actions of department heads when they are correct; encouraging department heads to delegate work to assistants; and holding staff meetings. In planning and assigning work city managers request department authorities, by written memoranda, or in conference in important matters, to survey and plan for the synthesis of all departments in the processing of the problem. In routine matters, telephonic or personal interviews are utilized. Discipline of departmental authorities is carried out by individual conference. Decisions reached in conference are confirmed by managers in writing if the matter is of a formal nature, otherwise by oral methods, or short memoranda. Over-all coordination of activities is a very important function of city managers. This coordination is achieved by staff meetings, administrative committees, interviews with department heads, progress reports and charts, administrative regulations, and inspection. In evaluating the work done, city managers rely heavily on their personal judgment. Personal observation and inspection, and knowledge of what a day's work should produce are some of the ways a manager checks on work done. The flow of reports over the manager's desk keeps him advised of progress or retardation. From these the manager acts in determining evaluation.—William W. Shaw.

#### PERSONNEL AGENCY MANAGEMENT

28. Berkson, Joseph, M.D. **A punch card designed to contain written data and coding.** *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 36 (216) December, 1941; 535-38.—A punch card, practicable for studies requiring comparatively small numbers of cards (up to 5,000), has been developed through an evolution of experience with a number of other forms. The punch card, which has withstood the test of several years of use, contains in writing the original data and the coding as well as the punches. The original data are written on the card against the various abbreviated headings. The data are coded, and the code written on the card in boxes provided and so placed that the punch operator reads the code on the card while punching the card. Having all the information on one card permits checking from the original data to the punches and eliminates the check of codification. Errors found can be traced immediately through the coding to the punches. The greatest practical advantage lies in

the facility of making a code of comparatively broad groupings yet permitting the making of studies involving the minute details found in the original data. This is done through machine sorting followed by hand sorting for the greatest detail in which the card is written. The stock form of these specially designed cards without the headings is provided in the regular way by the International Business Machines Company, utilizing a plate registered for the Mayo Clinic and copyrighted. The plate will be made available to others without cost if permission is first obtained. The request for permission should be directed to the Statistics Division of the Mayo Clinic.—Michael Levine.

29. Merwin, Frederic E. **The reporting of public affairs.** *The Annals* 219 January, 1942: 120-26.—With the transformation of government from a mere police instrument to the so-called "service state," the development of proper relationships between citizens and public officials has become a critical necessity. A major crisis in modern democracy has arisen because the citizen maintains his traditional attitudes of distrust, suspicion, or apathy toward government agencies whose services are nevertheless increasingly pervasive and necessary. In bridging this gap of understanding, the formalized public report has failed, for it usually repels rather than attracts attention. Administrators have been slow to improve its layout, type and format and to push circulation aggressively. Routine press releases, except perhaps the handouts of county farm agents, are usually ineffective. Written in dull style and providing an episodic treatment of their subjects, such news releases lack the continuity needed for a broad picture of government activities. Administrators have barely touched the broader problems of public opinion testing and reader reaction, and, when appropriations are low, they frequently abandon their reporting efforts entirely. Administrators are afraid, and editors believe, that the handout of the government department is propaganda traveling incognito. Newspaper reporting of public affairs is likewise limited and traditional, featuring the unusual, the unexpected, the emotional and the corrupt. Rare indeed are efforts such as that of the Yonkers, New York *Herald Statesman* to translate "civics into news." Instead of raising a shout and tumult in recurring crusades over corruption and evil conditions, the press should direct more enthusiasm to the positive side of government which requires continuous reporting by staffs trained to interpret complex social and economic problems.—Frederick C. Mosher.

#### CLASSIFICATION; PAY

30. Donovan, Jeremiah J. **Pay adjustments for city employees.** *Public Management* 24 (1) Jan. 1942:

8-12.—Remembering well the plight of public servants during World War I, when they were ground between the millstones of soaring prices and fixed incomes, public employees everywhere are urging the immediate upward revision of their pay rates. The problem has numerous ramifications, and responsibility for reaching a practical and equitable solution is shared alike by the legislator, the public administrator, the personnel officer, and the finance officer. Too often the pay schedules, like Topsy, "just growed." Although the urgency of the current situation may call for an immediate, though makeshift, remedy, the fact remains that no enduring solution can be reached until the problem is attacked at its roots. What specific steps should be taken in studying the current pay situation in a public jurisdiction? The obvious first step is to analyze departmental budgets and pay rolls to make a precise determination of the following points: (1) the various titles; (2) what these titles represent in the way of duties; (3) what rates are being paid; and (4) how many employees are receiving each rate. When an analysis is made of rates reported from different sources for a given type of position, it is usually found that these rates tend to focus around a certain figure. In order to obtain a comparative figure that best represents the consensus of these rates, either the average rate or the "weighted average" rate may be used. The latter is much more accurate than the former. When all of the necessary analysis of the pay study has been completed, a comparison between the existing pay schedule and the rates prevailing elsewhere will indicate the extent to which internal adjustments are needed. Aside from the problem of making equitable internal adjustments in the pay schedule, the matter of coping with over-all increases in living costs requires consideration. These should be based on several general assumptions: (1) There should be justification for assuming that the existing pay structure is internally consistent; (2) Inasmuch as increased living costs affect employees in the lower brackets most seriously, it is assumed that primary attention will be directed to relieving the economic pressures on employees in this group; (3) Although upper-bracket employees are not so vitally affected by rising living costs, the higher pay offered elsewhere for their services places the city at a disadvantage in retaining them, or in replacing them when they leave. If available funds will permit, after more urgent needs have been met, it is assumed to be desirable to make some pay increases in the upper-bracket positions. In addition to outright adjustments in the pay structure, several auxiliary measures may be adopted to achieve the same end. Among these are the following: (1) Shortening the period between regularly granted pay increases within established salary ranges; (2) Hiring of new employees at a rate in

excess of the minimum established rate, together with a corresponding increase of all incumbent employees to the new rates; (3) Exploring the possibility of granting indirect pay increases to employees in the upper salary brackets through the medium of defense savings bonds and income-tax anticipation bonds. The matter of making pay adjustments to meet current conditions is only one small part of a more fundamental matter—the original determination of pay rates. Though temporary expedients may be adopted as a stopgap, public officials who sense their ever-growing responsibility to expend public funds in the wisest, most efficient manner, will see in the present situation the starting point toward the establishment and maintenance of a practical pay plan. Once achieved, it is well worth the effort required, for its tangible benefits will be reflected in a stable body of public employees of high morale.—*Louis E. Hosch.*

31. Lubin, Isador **Wage policies and price trends.** *Survey Graphic* 31 (1) January, 1942: 19-23.—The question of wage policy is part and parcel of the question of prices. Periods of emergency have always reduced the real income of wage earners—their money buys fewer clothes, less food, fewer services than at the beginning of the price rise. The cost of living has gone up about 10 per cent since this war began, but most of the price increases cannot be attributed to labor costs. Prices went up before wages increased, and in some instances prices have risen in anticipation of wage increases, and wages have not yet gone up. Another point worthy of consideration is that higher wages do not necessarily mean a proportionate increase in the cost of the product. In fact, an increase in wage rates may even mean a lower labor cost per unit. On the other hand, to freeze wages may increase labor costs, because, the dollar an hour paid for labor may buy less output than it did before wages were frozen. Most people argue that current change in the price structure makes necessary some control over the prices of necessities. Once the wholesale price level forces up retail prices and the cost of living, general wage increases in this country will become imperative. There is no other way out, except a general lowering of the standard of living. It is also well to remember that wages are already fixed through collective bargaining in an important segment of the economy. Furthermore, by fixing prices we also fix some sort of maximum wage levels by limiting the amount the employer can pay. Can we say that the existing wage structure is sufficiently perfected to justify our freezing wages where they are, with all existing differentials? Or shall we accept American experience which indicates that the only way to get efficiency and high morale is to let management and labor iron out their difficulties through day-by-

day negotiations? So long as labor limits its demands for wage increases to amounts which can be paid without further increasing prices, and so far the evidence shows that in most instances it has, there can be only one answer. (Article includes six charts on price and wage trends.)—*Jack H. Foster.*

32. Unsigned. **Salary increases for municipal employees.** *Public Management* 23 (11) November, 1941: 323-328.—Inquiries sent by the International City Managers Association and the Municipal Reference Library of Milwaukee, to cities in the United States disclose that many of them have increased salaries and wages of municipal employees, and that the others are giving serious consideration to the same problem. The cost of living is rising perceptibly and this fact is focusing attention on the salary and wage problem. Eighteen of twenty-seven council-manager cities surveyed by the International City Managers Association have already increased salaries. Of the cities canvassed by the Milwaukee survey, eight of twenty-one reporting have increased salaries and wages. Public agencies using a cost-of-living adjustment plan have also adjusted compensation rates upward. Sound position-classification plans, the pay trends shown in the figures of the Bureau of Labor Statistics, and a thorough consideration of local conditions are of a decided aid to local jurisdictions seeking a practical answer to the pay problem.—*William W. Shaw.*

#### RECRUITMENT; SELECTION; INDUCTION

33. Ferguson, George A. **The factorial interpretation of test difficulty.** *Psychometrika* 16 (5) October, 1941: 323-29.—This paper discusses the influence of test difficulty on the correlation between test items and between tests. The greater the difference in difficulty between two test items or between two tests the smaller the maximum correlation between them. In general, the greater the number of degrees of difficulty among the items in a test or among the tests in a battery, the higher the rank of the matrix of intercorrelations; that is, differences in difficulty are represented in the factorial configuration as additional factors. The suggestion is made that if all tests included in a battery are roughly homogeneous with respect to difficulty, existing hierarchies will be more clearly defined and meaningful psychological interpretation of factors more readily attained. (The foregoing is a direct quotation from the author's summarization of the article.)—*George Wilgus.*

33. Koran, Sidney W. **Performance testing in public personnel selection.** *Educational and Psychological Measurement* Part I: 1 (3) July, 1941: 233-52. Part II: 1 (4) October 1941: 365-386.—Though per-

formance tests are widely approved for public personnel examinations, they are widely neglected by personnel agencies, except in such scattered instances as typing tests. This article describes four tests used in the Pennsylvania Department of Public Assistance, to illustrate some possibilities for the benefit of other agencies. Since a more thorough acquaintance with the job is necessary for the construction of a good performance test than for other types of tests, experts who know the job must be consulted in order to test directly the most important elements of the job.

The resulting test should sample the essentials adequately, be inexpensive to give, avoid the effects of differences in familiarity with the particular models of equipment used in testing, impress candidates favorably, be uniform in administration, and objectively and quantitatively scored. The passing point is more directly determinable in a performance test than in a written test, and may be based on production standards obtained during the job analysis. The following four performance tests are described: Telephone Operator, Graphotype-Addressograph Operator, Tabulating Machine Operator, and Duplicating Machine Operator. Each of these was given to those candidates who had qualified on a written test and experience rating. As no minimum training and experience requirements could legally be established, the tests were designed to serve as qualifying tests as well as for measuring instruments. Though the statistical validity of the tests had not been determined, experts in the respective fields approved them as appropriate, and employees selected by these tests have been more satisfactory than those selected by non-performance tests.—John A. Ohlson.

34. Lavos, George. **The employment of physically handicapped under civil service.** *Outlook for the Blind and Teachers' Forum* 36 (1) February, 1942: 4-15.—Questionnaires were sent to civil service commissions at all levels of government in order to determine their policies and procedures affecting the employment of the physically handicapped (limited in this report to the blind, the deaf, the partially sighted, the hard of hearing, the cardiac, and the arrested tuberculous). The reporting agencies disagreed among themselves as to what constitutes a disqualifying defect. Most reported that the basic physical requirement is "fitness to perform the duties of the position." However, the applicant's physical fitness is generally decided either by an appointing officer or by a general medical practitioner and not by a medical-vocational specialist who knows the possibilities and limitations of specific defects. Many agencies do not have job analysis programs and, among those which do maintain such programs, none reported that this

work was done so as to analyze the placement possibilities for the physically defective. A few commissions have started programs of assigning special positions to the handicapped; however, it is more desirable in the long run to give the handicapped equal opportunity to compete for all positions they are qualified to fill than to create special opportunities for them. Information is incomplete as to the number and types of handicapped persons actually employed in civil service positions, but commissions which do employ handicapped people report that they are rendering satisfactory service. The growth of pension plans has operated against the employment of the handicapped because of the belief that their higher mortality and morbidity rates cause a special drain on pension funds. In cases where this belief is valid, it is recommended that the government pay out of its general funds the difference between the amount contributed by the handicapped worker and the total cost of the pensions.—William T. McDonald.

35. Richman, T. LeFoy **Information men in Washington** *Personnel Journal* 20 (6) December, 1941: 214-221.—The information man's job is "saying, showing, and withholding." Government agencies are each engaged in highly complex activities. They must have public support or their programs are doomed, no matter how essential their work is to the public welfare. Therefore, they must address themselves to the public to educate it, to understand its objectives, possibilities, limitations, and it must address itself to this public in terms which can be understood. The furnishing of facts and figures to all persons who are interested is a second responsibility of the information man. If the Ladies Aid Society of Plum Center wants to know about public housing and juvenile delinquency, the information man should be able to supply accurate, well-presented material. Congress must also receive regular and special reports on the operations of each agency. The information man himself operates quietly, with no fanfare, and generally anonymously, whether he is a writer, photographer, speaker, movie maker, or exhibit builder. He personally is subordinate always to the presentation of his information. Hence the spectacular nature of highly competitive enterprise is completely lacking in government activity. Schools cannot produce government information men, though college courses in the information field are improved each year. This leads us to the question, "Where are Washington's information men found?" The biggest source is the press, and since the preparation of press material involves sharp, clear writing, newspapers offer the most fruitful field for government information personnel. The surroundings of the big dailies, the wide variety of subject

matter, and the training and preparation of accurate reports on short order have proved excellent training ground for many of Washington's information men. However, the difficulty is that, by and large, the better men stay in the newspaper business or enter other forms of private enterprise. Government salaries are low and the work is frequently routine. Thus, it is not infrequent that mediocre journalists are attracted to government service. The same is true of radio, movie, and advertising men. The majority of government information jobs pay \$3200 per year, from a low of \$2000 to a maximum of, roughly, \$6500. Regular examinations can fall down more easily in selecting information men than in most other types of positions. The best way to select information men is to give several of them a detailed description of the information problem, and allow possibly two weeks in which to develop their solutions to the problem. In this manner, it may be possible to determine their particular merits for an individual agency. Selection of information men should always rest at the very top, since the information man must work as the right hand of the administrator. The information man becomes the loud speaker moulding public opinion regarding policy. The United States Civil Service Commission has thrice given examinations for information personnel. The first two attempts failed miserably, and the results of the third have yet to be seen. It appears that the "solve the problem" technique, and serious consideration by the Civil Service Commission of an in-service training school are the most adequate means of selecting and training information men.—*Walter Evers*.

36. Solomon, Richard S. **Do your tests pick good workers?** *Personnel Journal* 20 (5) November, 1941: 177-183.—Employment tests cannot maintain their value over a long period of time if they are permitted to become static. As plants develop, the jobs within them change; as the labor market expands or contracts, the educational background and work proficiency of applicants change; and personnel research is continuously providing new and improved test techniques. The only justification for the use of pre-employment tests lies in the assistance they give in prediction. Since conditions affecting work to be performed and affecting the labor market are never static, it follows that prognostic devices must be dynamic. One of the most important changes possible affecting the validity of tests deals with the use and interpretation of norms or standards. Statistical analysis, in the form of continuing checks upon reliability and validity of test findings, will point the way toward refinement of existing tests. Batteries, rather than single tests, provide further checks on the validity of the testing process. In analyzing tests, it is not only broad samples which

should be evaluated and checked against the summary test results. The individual whose performance runs strongly counter to test predictions should become the subject of intensive study to eliminate, if possible, the flaw which he, as an exception to the rule, has pointed out in the testing procedure. This statement holds true in negative as well as positive cases of test findings. The following points summarize some of the methods suggested for use in increasing the predictive value of aptitude testing: (1) the ability to predict success or failure determines the value of all work in the field of aptitude testing; (2) tests should be restandardized for the particular situation in which they are to be used; (3) the predictive value of a battery of valid and reliable tests will outweigh the value of any single test when used alone; (4) a pattern of test scores is essential for increased predictability, and for taking the proper steps for individual control and self-improvement; (5) Statistical data obtained from test results must be reinterpreted in terms of meaningful language; and (6) the validity and reliability of a scientific test should be established on the basis of actual performance on the job.—*Walter Evers*.

37. Travers, L. B. **Improving practical tests.** *Personnel Journal* 20 (4) October, 1941: 129-133.—The evaluation of personal characteristics simultaneously with the practical rather than with the interview part of the examination is discussed in this article. Nothing new is claimed except the thought that personal characteristics may be evaluated in surroundings other than those involved in a formal interview. In practical tests there is often a close interrelationship between salient personal characteristics and factors of performance, which lend normal sequence to the rating process under conditions of practical testing. The rater perceives something, records and evaluates it, for example: Completed work, instead of being clean, may be dirty. The evidence is recorded by the rater, and then evaluated on the basis of these two tightly interwoven factors: work factors, and personal characteristics expressed in the completed product. Many types of examinations are better rated psychologically in the practical rather than the interview part of the test. This is particularly true of tradesmen, such as carpenters, plasterers, plumbers, etc. When these workers are in their natural environments they are best able to demonstrate their practical knowledge of subject matter, in the end product and in their work method. In such surroundings, manner of approach, procedure, finished product, tools and condition of same, reflect the personal characteristics such as carefulness, self-confidence, accuracy, ability to follow directions, and mental attitude. It is recommended that the evaluation of personal characteristics simultaneously with the giv-

ing of practical tests be done in small groups, of from 5 to 10, over a period of a half hour or more, rather than testing personal characteristics singly in a series of events of a few minutes duration. In groups of this kind there should be not less than four raters, two thoroughly experienced in the practical elements of the work, the others in evaluating personal characteristics. These two groups of raters should confer in determining the ratings on specific items such as orderliness, finished product, etc. If the practical rater sees a testee place a tool in a position endangering its cutting edge, he should tell the personal characteristic rater that this is indicative of carelessness. Summary rating should be the result of a thorough discussion of all factors by both groups of raters. By combining the rating of personal characteristics and skill, by rating groups of testees simultaneously, and by having more than one technical and psychological rater for each group, it is possible to arrive at a more thoroughly considered summary rating.—Walter Evers.

38. Unsigned. **The selection of department heads.** *Public Management* 23 (10) October, 1941: 298-303.—A staff of capable department heads is essential to successful management. The selection of these subordinate executives is one of the most important tasks of the manager and is a test of his executive ability. Frequently when a vacancy occurs, it is necessary for the manager to waive residence requirements. This depends in part upon the qualifications of the men available locally and the effect either step will have on the morale of the other employees. A recent survey of the practices followed by 20 city managers showed that more than half have appointed from one to three department heads from outside the city. The manager must first determine the job specifications which consist of an enumeration of the duties of the position and a statement of desirable minimum qualifications. Without such a yardstick, personal and intangible factors may be over emphasized at the expense of tangible qualifications and experience. Methods used in canvassing the field are: (1) Publish a notice in the journal of the appropriate professional organization; (2) use the professional exchange service of Public Administration Clearing House in Chicago; (3) contact other city managers and personnel offices; (4) request national professional organizations to supply a list of possible candidates; and (5) carry paid advertisements in technical journals. The application form is important, especially when an "unassembled" examination is used. It facilitates securing comparable information on specific items from all applicants, thus simplifying the task of comparing training and experience. Written examinations may be useful in sampling skills and knowledge for positions where technical knowledge and experience

are important. The use of "unassembled" examination permits an objective selection without the use of formal written tests. In evaluating the training and experience of candidates, the ratings should reflect the quality of training and experience. It is impossible to make an objective selection by interview alone. Although an important part of the examination, the personal interview should be reserved only for those significant factors which cannot be otherwise determined. The city manager and the personnel officer may visit the city in which the candidate is employed to make the interview, or the candidate may be invited to come to the city where the vacancy exists. Naturally the city pays all or part of the travel expenses of candidates called in for personal interviews. After the appointment has been made, the city manager has a definite obligation to make certain during the probationary period that the appointee is properly qualified.—F. Robert Coop.

#### PLACEMENT; SERVICE STANDARDS AND EVALUATION

39. Ewart, E.; Seashore, S. E.; and Tiffin, Joseph A **factor analysis of an industrial rating scale.** *The Journal of Applied Psychology* 25 (5) October, 1941: 481-86.—A usual assumption made when a rating scale is used to measure employee merit is that the scale separately indicates the relative standing of each employee on each of the traits included. To test this hypothesis, a factor analysis was made of merit ratings of 1120 employees in a large industrial plant. The rating device used was a graphic scale consisting of twelve traits: safety; knowledge of job; versatility; accuracy; productivity; overall job performance; industriousness; initiative; judgment; cooperation; personality; and health. Tetrachoric intercorrelations were computed for the twelve traits and the resulting correlation matrix factor analyzed, using Thurstone's centroid method. Only two factors, not independent of one another, were revealed. The first, with high factor loadings on overall job performance, productivity, and industriousness (.961, .913, and .906 respectively), was termed "Ability to do the present job." The second, less significant statistically, exhibited highest factor loadings on accuracy, knowledge of job, and versatility (.448, .337, and .325 respectively), and thus was considered to represent knowledge or skill possessed over and above the requirements for the present job. It seems a safe generalization to state that ratings on the first factor would be nearly as valuable in predicting worker competency as are ratings on all twelve traits. Although the analysis indicates that employee merit could be rated on one or two traits as well as it is now rated with the present scale of twelve, this does not contradict the fact that adequate training of raters or a modification of the

present scale might result in ratings which would validly indicate more than two employee traits. Education in the general use of rating scales (including such topics as the avoidance of halo), and training in the use of the specific scale in question, might make possible the proper functioning of a scale of several items. Industry, then, must not be blind to the possibility that ratings obtained through the use of a multiple-item scale may reveal only one or two aspects of employee merit, and not a much larger number, as casual examination of the scale might lead one to infer.—*Stanley S. Berg*.

40. Lehman, W. P. **The Interdepartmental Placement Service**. *Personnel Administration* 4 (3) November, 1941: 1-7.—The Interdepartmental Placement Service was established in July, 1940, by the United States Civil Service Commission for the immediate purpose of locating and mobilizing for labor shortages unused or incompletely used abilities and skills of federal employees. The long-range, post-emergency objective was that of providing a uniform federal placement program, not previously possible because of the autonomous nature of the administration of each department and independent agency. The first step in the development of the service was the establishment of the qualifications file, which is now in use for (1) surveys to discover federal employees qualified and apparently available for placement in vital defense occupations, and (2) filling specific positions upon requests from officers of various federal departments and agencies. Primary attention has been given to systematic, exhaustive surveys to discover persons qualified and available for placement in occupations in which there are labor shortages and for which the Commission has announced open, continuous examinations. Requests from operating agencies for eligibles to fill vacancies in specific positions have increased rapidly since the service was initiated. These requests are presented either by formal request for certification or informally by phone call or letter. In making selections from the list of eligibles furnished by the Interdepartmental Placement Service, the appointing authority is not required to make the selection in rank order, to justify objections to individuals not selected, nor to execute additional appointment forms for submission to the Commission unless special investigation is necessary. Particularly difficult problems were encountered in developing the Service. The first of these was the time and cost implications attending necessary and/or desirable procedures for effecting the service. Others had to do with the formulation and maintenance of an effective occupational classification scheme and the methods of keeping the qualification files current. The Service uses the "Dictionary of Occupational Titles" of the United States Em-

ployment Service for journeymen, apprentices, helpers, artisans, skilled and unskilled laborers, and as the result of a study has expanded and developed the Dictionary's classification of management, scientific, professional, and subprofessional occupations. The greatest problem which the Interdepartmental Placement Service now experiences is that of keeping the files current. For this purpose it is planned to develop a questionnaire supplementing the one originally circulated to federal employees. In addition, the punched card file must be brought up to date. The time-period for both of these actions is undefined. When coupled with an effective training program, the policy of making the greatest possible use of available skills already possessed by incumbents in the federal service should serve to decrease the number of open competitive examinations given and to place more emphasis upon written examinations for positions at the entrance levels of the various classes. In addition, it should increase the possibilities for an effective career service and raise the morale of those already employed.—*Perry Huntley Hoffman*.

## TRAINING

41. McSherry, Frank J. **Training America's defense workers**. *Personnel Administration* 4 (4) December, 1941: 1-7.—The Labor Division of the Advisory Commission to the Council of National Defense, later incorporated into the Office of Production Management, was given the problem of securing labor for defense industries. Through representatives in 22 field offices, the Training Within Industry Branch of the Division renders specific assistance to defense industries by helping to inaugurate training programs which the industries will carry on at their own expense. This service is available to plant managers but not compulsory, and consists of the following four general types of assistance: (1) help in the analysis of the training needs; (2) aid in setting up a program within the plant to meet its needs; (3) information regarding the experience of other employers in meeting similar problems; and (4) information concerning the availability of the services of government agencies, such as the federal employment services, the National Youth Administration, the Civilian Conservation Corps, and the Work Projects Administration, and vocational and trade schools, and engineering colleges. A survey of public vocational schools throughout the country was made in 1939, and information regarding the tools, equipment, and space available for employment training was obtained. As a result of this survey, Congress was provided with information upon which it based its initial appropriation to the Office of Education, in June, 1940, of \$15,000,000 to provide vocational training in public vocational schools for occupations essential to

national defense. This and later appropriations in 1940 and 1941, together with the appropriations authorized by the Smith-Hughes Act of 1917 and the George-Dean Act of 1936, have made possible the installation and maintenance in the public vocational schools of large amounts of equipment and supplies for pre-employment and refresher classes, for training, for upgrading of workers already employed, and for engineering training. In addition two minor programs were initiated in 1940: one for out-of-school rural youth, in which the Civilian Conservation Corps has participated, and the Youth Defense Work Program of the National Youth Administration. Other federal agencies participating in the labor supply and training problem are the Department of Labor, through the Federal Committee on Apprenticeship and the Bureau of Labor Statistics, the United States Civil Service Commission, and the Work Projects Administration. The National Defense Training Program has had the objective of limiting the training periods to the shortest possible time. This has necessitated careful selection of both course content and instructors—with which responsibilities industry has cooperated. Plants have also cooperated by making machine tools and space available for training. The large and growing production schedule drawn up for the nation's industrial machine has created a training problem which is greater than any ever encountered before, and calls for the united and even more greatly augmented action of plant managers, vocational schools, colleges, and universities to share the responsibility of training employees so as to increase production to the limit.—*Perry Huntley Hoffman*.

### WORK TERMS; CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT

42. Goldman, Franz, M.D. **Medical care in industry.** *Medical Care* 1 (4) Autumn, 1941: 301-312.—Old problems of industrial medicine assume new importance in a time when the greatest possible efficiency in the use of men, money, and material is needed in production for defense. To gain first-hand knowledge of the situation the author made personal visits to four industrial plants and studied their organization and methods of operation intensively. Three considerations appear to govern the development of the programs in the four organizations studied: (1) Absenteeism due to illness has always been an issue of considerable magnitude. It has become the major problem since efficient safety programs have greatly reduced the frequency of work accidents, and liberal provisions for the restoration of health and earning capacity of injured workers have paid good dividends in savings of time lost from accidents and of money compensation. As the frequency and duration of industrial accidents has decreased, there has been increasing recognition

of the need for care of non-industrial injuries. (2) The most profitable production cannot be attained without a labor force of highest efficiency, i. e., the employee himself must receive good care for any ailment whatsoever. Poor health of the worker is a luxury these companies believe they cannot afford. Moreover, the worker must be relieved of all worries, financial or other, about sickness in the family. For this reason, dependents of the employees are given the same care as the employees themselves. (3) The conviction is general that the attitude of the worker towards the job is much shaped by the philosophy of the employer with regard to health and welfare problems. A program which acknowledges medical care as a basic human right and puts the dignity and worth of the individual above his value as an economic unit is considered as the best foundation of good labor relations. Evidence of this is seen in the markedly low labor turnover at these four plants. In line with their policy of fostering group practice of medicine, all the plans maintain clinics for ambulatory patients. Provision for house calls at night and on holidays, as well as in the daytime, rounds out the program of continuous service. The four industrial plans impose no restrictions on the quantity of physicians' services allowed in an individual case or during a definite period of time. The problem of an adequate period of service in an industrial program is particularly pressing in regard to long-term illnesses. All four plans provide for treatment of patients of this type as the physicians consider it necessary. A medical care program in industry may be financed by the company alone, by the employees alone, or by the employer and employees jointly. Capital expenditures for plant and equipment on the one hand, and operating expenses on the other hand, may be met by any one of these three methods, or by varying combinations of them. Medical care programs which are as broad in policy and liberal in procedure as the four analyzed may be thought too expensive to be established in more than exceptional cases. The facts are quite the contrary. The total expense involved in the operation of the four programs is remarkably reasonable in terms of per capita annual cost.—*Louis E. Hosch*.

### EMPLOYEE RELATIONS

43. Baldwin, Roger N. **Have public employees the right to strike?**—Yes. *National Municipal Review* 30 (9) September, 1941: 515-17. Distinctions commonly made between the right of workers in private industry and those in the public service to strike will not stand up under examination. They arise from an unthinking hostility to "strikes against the government" as if all strikes are political in motive. Along with that prejudice runs the substantial practical objection to strikes in essential services whose cessation would be catastrophic to the whole community.

notably the firemen and police. When the right to strike is denied, the argument is commonly extended against all trade unionism in the public service. Although government does not function for profit, the pressure for economy often produces precisely the same effect in low wages. Arbitrary authority is exercised and trade union protection is the only practicable method to counteract such pressure. Advantages of civil service status do not meet all needs and unions have been useful in adjusting and reforming scores of practices not covered in civil service law or regulations. Only those who compose the rank and file appreciate fully their own problems and are capable of speaking for themselves to the point that the voice of organized labor is frequently the only effective means of directing the attention of both legislatures and the public to injustices. No strikes have had a political motive, but have been aimed at particular politicians or administrators. Fire and police service strikes are excluded from consideration for they are unique and it is granted there should be no strikes in them. But this policy does not follow in other services, many of which are performed in some cities by private utilities where no one argues that strikes should be prohibited. Emergency crews are usually ready and the unions will keep skeleton crews on if necessary. Some forget that public employees have a deep community loyalty that makes strikes a very last resort. Also, channels for settlement are open to them not found in private employment. The closed shop issue does not enter here for no unions under civil service have ever raised it. Such an idea is wholly incompatible with requirements that appointments be made by competitive examination and tenure and promotion provisions. Obviously union membership must be entirely voluntary. This controversy is only a phase of the larger trade union conflict rapidly nearing a stable solution. The public service should lead the way in model practice adding protection afforded by independent organizations of employees dealing freely with their superiors to the guarantee of the civil service system.

—Ray L. Wilbur, Jr.

44. Kaplan, H. Eliot. **Have public employees the right to strike?—No.** *National Municipal Review* 30 (9) September, 1941: 518: 523.—The expansion of government in fields viewed heretofore as within the exclusive province of private enterprise prompts the suggestion that relationship between government and civil employees needs to be reconsidered. A new concept has arisen through the extension of governmental activities to servicing rather than policing and regulating, and through the exemption of public employees from the terms of the National Labor Relations Act. To what degree should public employees be permitted to affiliate with out-

side labor unions and to what extent should the rights and privileges accorded private unions be extended to similar associations among public employees are the issues concerning us. Public employees owe a responsibility to the public and not to a political boss or labor leader. The purposes of the affiliation indicate how far public employees should go in joining outside unions and their suspicions may well be aroused unless there is some patently direct interest which they both share. If primarily for the purpose of using combined strength to coerce action, they are undesirable. The people alone must decide what rights or privileges may or may not be granted public employees by the people's representatives and until they recognize by law the right of employees to refuse to obey their superior officers in specified circumstances, there is no "right" to strike. No employee has the right to interfere with the orderly conduct of public affairs or interrupt public service for the people without the people's consent. That is the difference between private and public employment. It is essential to the people's interest that conditions of employment in civil service be remedied in more or less the same general manner and orderly means as is to be expected of any other change of public policy. Public employees can crystallize public sentiment in their direction. The argument that there is a difference in the rights of public employees in essential government functions and those in the proprietary service begs the question. When the people choose to take over a public utility, it is because public necessity requires it. Simultaneously with the change, the relationship of the employees to the people must undergo change. Their rights must yield to the public interest. Collective bargaining is an equally cogent issue to be weighed. Agreements sought to be made are not legally binding on the people in the absence of express authority to make any such contracts. Informal agreements can be incorporated as policy after informal negotiation with employee representatives. The closed or union shop has no place in the public service either, its purposes not being suited for the people's service. In the public service there is no super-agency to act as arbiter in disputes, as the government arbitrates private disputes. The public employees do have redress through the legislature and public officials. Encouraging any class of citizen to ignore or abandon in defiance of authority such orderly procedure to gain its ends would defeat our democratic process.—Ray L. Wilbur, Jr.

45. Spero, Sterling D. **Have public employees the right to strike?—Maybe.** *National Municipal Review* 30 (9) September, 1941: 524-28, 551.—The state guarantees the right to strike despite the public incon-

venience and social dislocations which they frequently cause. Time and again legislators have rejected proposals to abrogate that right, but when it comes to its own employees the state takes a different attitude and will not recognize the right. Government functions are little different than those of others. The administrative functions are similar to those in any business. Industrial functions are directly comparable and service functions parallel or compete with private organizations. Only the small number of employees engaged in law enforcement functions are not directly comparable. Yet this traditional and peculiar public function could not operate by itself for it, like every social process today, is dependent on the running of the whole social machine. Government's denial of the strike right to its own employees cannot be based on the harm of work cessation, but is based rather upon the ground that government as custodian of final authority in the land cannot permit those whom it hires to carry on its work to challenge its authority. The denial of the strike right largely takes the form of statements by executive authorities for virtually no legislation or court decisions exist. Significantly the attitude of employees themselves is opposed to strikes. Those organizations made up wholly of public employees in the traditional service non-industrial in character have sought their objectives through legislative means. The government industrial workers are members of organized unions of their crafts, trades or industries and their first loyalty is to their trade and are government employees only incidentally. They concede no special rights to the governmental employer and insist on the right to strike and have exercised it. The expansion of the public service into the field of economic activity will bring a larger number of industrial workers into the service. They will not easily be cut to pattern and will insist on their strike right. No mere denial of the right will prevent strikes but strikes under such circumstances damage the authority of the sovereign, the very thing the denial of the right to strike seeks to preserve. In order to maintain authority the government must demonstrate its power by punishment and can call on the military forces. When the state denies its workers the right to strike merely because they are government employees, it defines common labor disputes as attacks upon public authority and makes the use of drastic discipline, and armed force a method of handling simple industrial relations. With this growing trend of labor into government service a major problem arises around the free labor movement. The power motive is as important an exploiting force as the profit motive ever was. Labor thus faces a serious dilemma, if the government insists upon denying it that right which is the ultimate guarantee of its freedom. A danger from this

can be the resistance by labor of the expansion of governmental authority creating a disintegrating social trend by rendering government ineffective to meet the problem of the time. These major issues and dangers seem infinitely greater threats to our society than the temporary interruption of some governmental services.—*Ray L. Wilbur, Jr.*

46. Macmahon, Arthur W. **Collective labor action in city government.** *Public Management* 23 (11) November, 1941: 328-334.—Pending litigation on collective bargaining in the New York City transit system has brought into sharp focus the problems involved in the rights of labor organizations in government. Whether the New York City Board of Transportation can enter into labor agreements with the Transport Workers Union has precipitated the necessity for thorough understanding and solution. The corporation counsel of New York City held that, "neither law nor public policy can permit the Board to abdicate its sovereign functions by contract with its employees, much less by contract with a private non-governmental organization which has no vestige of public responsibility." A modus vivendi was worked out by the mayor pending final decision of the courts. Considerable experience has shown that civil service in the ordinary sense may not be applied advisedly to governmental enterprises of a peculiarly industrial character. Decentralization of civil service administration can be better applied in such instances. Then too, civil service provisions do not cover all of the circumstances of employment, i. e., wages, bonuses, and working conditions. In addition, it seems wholesome that there should be a considerable degree of managerial responsibility for the conditions of employment. These areas can be better treated if administrative discretion is permitted the use of conferences and agreements with employee groups. Experience shows many instances of public bodies concluding labor agreements. It is conceivable that state legislation may authorize the "union shop," modifying civil service laws accordingly. Less concern should be had for "sovereignty" or the "individual" and more for the effect a guaranteed monopoly would have upon the alertness and responsibility of labor organization. Organized employee groups are showing inclinations to more clearly assert their "right" to strike, although no increased indication of militancy is evident. These stirrings are not new to the public service. Public authorities should seize the opportunities "to remove conditions of grievance and strain, with due respect for the importance of morale in the mass and realistic acceptance of the ideas and methods of the age." Legislation to provide personnel relations sections in the public service should be instituted now, before it is too late.—*William W. Shaw.*